

GOVERNMENT OF BIHAR

REPORT

OF

THE FITMENT COMMITTEE



VOLUME VI

September, 1998

[Price—Rs. 50]

# GOVERNMENT OF BIHAR



## VOLUME II (Continued)

## **FITMENT COMMITTEE**

■ Shri Justice S. Sarwar Ali,  
■ Chairman

■ Shri Subhakirti Majumdar, IAS  
■ Member Secretary



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Sl. No. Chapters

1.	38	DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, MEDICAL EDUCATION, & FAMILY WELFARE
2.	39	DEPARTMENT OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT
3.	40	DEPARTMENT OF INSTITUTIONAL FINANCE AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION
4.	41	GOVERNOR'S SECRETARIAT
5.	42	OFFICE OF THE LOKAYUKTA AND BIHAR PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
6.		CHART OF THE REVISED PAY SCALES FOR GOVERNMENT PRESS EMPLOYEES





**DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, MEDICAL EDUCATION**  
**AND FAMILY WELFARE**

Bihar Health Service

38.1.1 Bihar State Health Services Association through their President, Dr. P.N. Pal, have represented to the Fitment Committee for the following revised pay scales as given below:-

Sl.No.	Designation	Existing Pay scale on 1.1.1996 to be replaced (in Rs.)	Revised New Central Scale (in Rs.)
A.	General or Non-teaching Wing		
1.	Basic Grade	2425-4000	8825-13500
2.	Junior Selection Grade	3000-4500	10000-15200
3.	Senior Selection Grade	4100-5300	14300-18300
4.	Supertime Scale	4300-5550	15100-18300
5.	Joint Director/Drug Controller	4500-5700	15100-18300
6.	Additional Director	4500-5700	15100-18300
7.	Director	5100-6300	16400-20000
8.	Director-in-chief	5900-6700	18400-22400

B.	Medical Education or Teaching Wing		
1.	Clinical Side		
a)	Resident	2425-4000	8825-13500
b)	Registrar/Asstt. Prof.	3000-4500	10000-15200
c)	Associate Professor	3700-5000	12000-16500
d)	Professor	3700-5000	12000-16500
e)	Prof.in super time scale	4100-5300	14300-18300
2.	Non-Clinical Side		
i)	Tutor	2425-4000	8825-13500
ii)	Asstt. Professor	3000-4500	10000-15200
iii)	Associate Professor	3700-5000	12000-16500
iv)	Professor	3700-5000	12000-16500
v)	Professor in super time scale	4100-5300	14300-18300
3.	COMMON		
i)	Principal	4500-5700	15100-18300
ii)	Additional Director, Medical Education	4500-5700	15100-18300
4.	Dental Service		
i)	Basic Grade	2000-3800	6500-10500
ii)	Junior Selection Grade	2400-4150	7500-12000
iii)	Senior Selection Grade	3700-5000	12000-16500
iv)	Super time Scale	4100-5300	14300-18300
5.	Teaching personnel of the Dental Service		
i)	Tutor	2000-3800	6500-10500
ii)	Lecturer	2400-4150	7500-12000
iii)	Professor	3700-5000	12000-16500
iv)	Principal	4100-5300	14300-18300



38.1.2

Other demands of the Association are as listed below :-

- (a) Every Doctor must get at least three promotions after completion of 4, 9 and 13 years of service.
- (b) Flexible Complementing Scheme to be extended to cover all doctors;
- (c) Risk allowance of Rs. 1000 per month to Doctors attending AIDS, T.B. patients and those working in Blood Bank, Radiology, Radiotherapy and Forensic Medicine Departments;
- (d) Night Duty and deputation allowance should be considered;
- (e) Post-graduate allowance to doctors working in basic grade @ Rs. 500 per month and Rs. 1000 per month for diploma and degree holders, respectively;
- (f) Research allowance of Rs. 1000 per month to teachers in Medical and Dental Colleges for research work, journals, books and workshops;
- (g) House Rent allowance should be linked to actual pay instead of the maximum of the scale;
- (h) Medical allowance of Rs. 100 per month to pensioners also;
- (i) Leave Travel Concession and City Compensatory Allowance at Central Government rates;
- (j) Travelling allowance on the basis of existing pay scales and not on the basis of the classification of post;

- (k) Overtime allowance and Transport allowance to be sanctioned, respectively, for extra working hours in a week and to commute from work place to residence, Telephone Attendant allowance at par with Central Government ( telephone allowance does not stand sanctioned by Central Government);
- (l) Payment of allowances and pension to be net of taxes;
- (m) Advances and other benefits have been sought regarding G.P.F., House Building Advance, Car Advance, Motor Cycle advance, Scooter advance, Personal Computer advance and medical equipment advance
- (n) The representation also mentions that there is a convention of adding three increments at the initial stage and they have requested for the scale of Rs. 8825-13500 instead of Rs. 8000-13500 which stands sanctioned for the basic grade doctors in the Government of India Colleges and hospitals.

38.1.3 The Director, Health Services, Government of Bihar has provided the Fitment Committee with the Rules for Appointment to the **Bihar Medical Service** embodied in Notification No. 13020 – L.S.G. dated 14.11.1929. In exercise of powers conferred by Rules 3 and 4 of the Civil Services ( Governors' Provinces) Delegation Rules, 1920 the Government of Bihar and Orissa framed rules to regulate the recruitment, conditions of service, pay, allowance and pension of the **Bihar and Orissa Medical Service**. Under these rules appointments by promotion could be made from the **Bihar Sub-Assistant Surgeons Service** and direct recruitment to the **Bihar Medical Service** was to be made on the advice of the selection board, then called the State Public Service Commission. The candidates were required to be graduates of an Indian University registered under the Bihar and Orissa Medical Act (II of 1916) and were not to be over 28 years of age and at that time the medical graduates were asked to submit their diplomas. The 1929 Rules also provided that every officer of the **Bihar and Orissa Medical**



7

Service was required to undergo post-graduate training twice during their period of service – the first between the fifth and end of the seventh year of service and the second between the beginning of the twelfth and the end of the fourteenth year of service. Promotion was not to be given till training was completed and the officers passed the practical examinations. The pay in the first year for officers of the Bihar and Orissa Medical Service was Rs. 200 and this was provided in Rule 12 of the 1929 Rules.

38.1.4 The 2<sup>nd</sup> pay Revision Committee Report was perused and we find that the sanctioned strength was only 2118 of the combined cadre of **Medical and Public Health Service** but there were only 88 senior posts.

38.1.5 The Second Pay Revision Committee which submitted its report in February, 1964 pointed out in Chapter 24 that the basic grade and senior grade of the **Medical Service** in Bihar are lower than the corresponding grade of the **Public Health Service** though of the total strength of 2118, only 4% are **Public Health Doctors** and every year the **Public Health Service** is tending to shrink in strength due to a large number of developments.

38.1.6 The Bihar Pay Revision Committee, 1961 which submitted its recommendations on 29.2.64 stated in Chapter 24, paragraph 428 that they have fallen in line with the recommendations of the Bhore Committee and have suggested integration of the Medical and Public Health in a single cadre. In West Bengal such an integration had been carried out and the Health Department of the Government of Bihar in their memorandum to the Second Pay Revision Committee also suggested integration to be recommended in the interest of efficiency and ease of recruitment. The



Committee noted that there were only 59 filled posts out of a total sanctioned strength of 74 posts in the basic scale of **Public Health Service** and recommended that further recruitment as **Medical Officer** of Health should be stopped. The Second Pay Revision Committee of the State recommended at paragraph 432 that some restrictions would need to be imposed on private practice by **Teachers** in Medical College Hospitals and in other specified large hospitals. It was also recommended that private practice should ordinarily be confined to chamber consultation and to domiciliary treatment at the patient's residence. At paragraph 433 it was prescribed that no **Government Doctor** should be permitted to invest in, own or manage a clinic or nursing home where indoor beds are provided and it should be regarded as a misdemeanour on the part of a Government employee to indulge in such a business. The Committee which submitted its Report in 1964 recommended for the doctors a remuneration higher than any other group of Government employees except for the **Executive and Judicial Services**.

38.1.7 On the basis of the recommendations of that Committee orders were issued by the Finance Department (Résolution No. 532 dated 17.7.1965 published in the extraordinary edition of the Bihar Gazette dated 22.7.1965). The State Government notified the re-organization of the Medical and Public Health cadre. The pay scales in the teaching side were non-practising and super-time posts of **Deputy Directors** and equivalent posts constituted only 1% of the cadre of the **Health Service** minus the teaching posts or equal to the number of posts of Deputy Directors and equivalent posts at any time, whichever is greater. In the 1965 order there was no provision for special pay or other allowances except for the junior **Teachers** on the teaching side. The order further mentions that the cadre of the **Health Service** was to consist of duty posts on the administrative side and teaching posts were to be calculated on the basis of the actual requirements of deputation to the teaching side. Holders of teaching posts were to be treated on deputation for the time during which they were employed as teachers and once they reverted to the administrative branch, they drew pay according to their position in the cadre. If a doctor junior in the cadre to a person on the teaching side drew pay in an administrative post in a scale higher than drawn by the person on the



teaching side, other than as a purely casual or temporary arrangement in exigencies of public service, the latter was permitted to draw the pay he would have drawn but for his deputation to the teaching side.

38.1.8 The 3<sup>rd</sup> Pay Revision Committee also discussed in great detail issues like private practice of Government Doctors, general position and availability of doctors, parity in pay scales between **Bihar State Health Service** and *Central Health Service* as well as the comparative position in other States. The 3<sup>rd</sup> Pay Revision Committee recommended that all teaching posts should be made non-practising, all posts located in urban areas or semi-urban areas including Sub-divisional and District headquarters towns, all Municipal towns and towns in Notified Area Committees to be made non-practising and all posts that lie in rural areas other than teaching posts, should be declared practising posts. For the non-teaching side as well as for the teaching the 3<sup>rd</sup> Pay Revision Committee recommended pay scales with teaching allowances for the teaching categories and the scales were the same except for designations which were different with the sole exception being that of the **Principal of Medical Colleges** who were recommended the scale of Rs. 1950-2150 and this scale was not available in the non-teaching side. The 3<sup>rd</sup> Pay Revision Committee recommended non-practising scales. In 1971 there were in all 402 posts in the various teaching cadres out of a total of 2961 doctors in Government employment. This constituted roughly 7.3% of the total posts. Of the 2961 posts in the **State Health Service Cadre** 1398 posts were practising and 1563 were non-practising posts. Though the Committee of 1970 headed by Dr. Madhusudan Das recommended a separate teaching cadre and the 3<sup>rd</sup> Pay Revision Committee also recommended constitution of a separate teaching cadre, nothing so far seems to have been done. The 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee noted that the **Bihar Health Service** has a total sanctioned strength of 4348 as on 1.4.1979 which included 741 teaching posts. The Pay Revision Committee of 1981 recommended that teaching allowance and special compensatory allowance to teaching posts should be discontinued. It has been mentioned at paragraph 33.79 of the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee Report that when an officer in the general line gets promotion to the higher scales, all deserving officers senior to the doctor in the teaching line also get



promotion to the comparable higher grade on the analogy of the next below rule system.

38.1.9 The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee while submitting its report on 15.7.1989 noted that they did not have the benefit of discussion regarding either the teaching or non-teaching cadres with the Secretary, Medical Education and Family Welfare Department of the Government of Bihar. In 1987 orders regarding U.G.C. scales for the teaching cadres with effect from 2.10.1986 were issued but the position was not clear because certain doctors teaching in Medical Colleges had drawn their salary in U.G.C. scales while many others did not. The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee recommended only replacement pay scales. From 2.10.1986 the teachers of Medical Colleges were entitled to UGC pay scales as if their pay scales were not revised on 1.4.1981. It has been further observed that a Lecturer takes 7 years or more to become an Assistant Professor and an Assistant Professor has to have post-graduate qualification. It was also noted that 25% of Professors in Medical Colleges in Bihar were required to be in the super time scale of Professors though this was not then part of the UGC scheme. We do not know when the system of UGC pay scale was discontinued and the Health Department also have not thrown any light regarding the discontinuation of UGC scales. The UGC scales entitled doctors to non-practising allowance but there were doctors drawing salary in UGC scales with non-practising allowance and there were doctors who were continuing in State scales as the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee noted at paragraph 43 and 44 of Chapter 41 of their Report.

38.1.10 In the note submitted by the Director, Health Services to the Fitment Committee on 7.9.1998 through Letter No. 25/ Director, it has been pointed out that the Bihar Health Service in the present form was constituted in 1965 subsequent to the recommendations of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Pay Revision Committee. Finance Department Resolution No. 532 dated 17.7.1965 and published in the extraordinary edition of the Gazette on 22.7.1965 provides in paragraph 8 that the posts in the Medical Colleges will be filled by deputation from the members of the Bihar Health Service and the teaching



posts in the Medical Colleges will be calculated on the basis of actual requirements. The highest post in the teaching side was that of **Principal** of Medical Colleges and on the basis of seniority posts of **Deputy Directors** at the headquarters were used to be filled. Incumbents to the posts of **Joint Director/Additional Director/ Director** and **Director - in - Chief** are selected and the posts filled on the basis of merit and seniority as the note of the Health Department indicates. In 1976 the post of **Director-in-Chief** was created as an ex-cadre post and powers of a **Head of Department** was delegated to him. Promotional posts are only available up to **Deputy Directors** and posts above that are filled on the basis of merit cum seniority. The note of the Health Department further indicates that there are various posts in the junior selection grade like **Deputy Superintendents** and **Chief Medical Officers** in certain places. There are posts in the 12-1/2 percent senior selection grade posts designated as **Chief Medical Officers, Superintendents** of certain Hospitals and **Chemical Analysts**, etc. The 2-1/2% posts in super time scale are designated as **Civil Surgeons** Patna and Ranchi and **Superintendents** of Medical College Hospitals of Patna, Ranchi, Darbhanga, **Regional Deputy Directors** in Divisions, etc. Then there are 5 posts of **Joint Directors**, 5 posts of **Additional Directors** and one post each of **Director** and **Director in Chief**. A Notification dated 11.11.82 of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health) has been submitted by the Bihar Government's Health Department and these are the Central Health Service Rules, 1982. Unlike the Central Government gazette notification, Bihar Health Services Rules have not been furnished. Hence we are unable to comment whether the posts in Bihar stand created on the basis and the pattern available in the Central Government.

38.1.11

We have confirmed from the Director in Chief, Health Services that separate recruitment and promotion rules for the **Bihar Health Service** have not yet been framed. The posts in the teaching as well as in the general side are all in one cadre and doctors have the option of joining the teaching stream and thereafter coming back to the general side. Furthermore, the posts in teaching side do not have specific qualifications laid down as in



the Centre though it is presumed that the Indian Medical Council guide lines would be followed.

38.1.12 In the *Central Health Service* there are 3621 *General Duty Medical Officers* who enter service in the pay scale of Rs.2200-4000 and recruitment is made by the Union Public Service Commission through the Combined Medical Services Examination. In 1994 there were 1306 specialists who were directly recruited in the *Central Health Service* in the pay scale of Rs.3000-5000 by the Union Public Service Commission. There were 697 *Non-teaching (Hospital) Specialists*, 538 *Teaching Specialists* and 71 *Public Health Specialists*. The *Indian Ordnance Factories Health Service* also has 46 Doctors in the specialist sub-stream but in the *Indian Railway Medical Service* there are only 2569 *Medical and Dental Doctors* and specialist posts are manned suitably by qualified doctors from amongst Medical personnel in the Railway Hospitals, Dispensaries and Clinics. The *Armed Forces Medical Service* have been discussed at paragraphs 63.149 to 63.164 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report and the pay scales are generally the same that have been recommended for doctors and para-medical posts in the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have recommended that the three posts of *Professors* and two posts of *Readers* in the Armed Forces Medical College at Pune may be encadred in the *Central Health Service* and have also recommended at paragraph 63.156 that 4 posts of *Regional Family Welfare Medical Officers* and 46 posts of *Lady Medical Officers* in the Family Welfare Organisation of the Armed Forces should be encadred in the *Central Health Service*. The Medical Department in Indian Railways has a network of 122 Hospitals, 670 Health Units and 4 Super Specialty Centres located at Mumbai, Varanasi, Calcutta and Perambur. There are only 2569 medical and dental *Doctors* in the Medical Department of the Ministry of Railways. The *Doctors* in the Railways do not have a separate pool of specialists within the Indian Railway Medical Service and the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have recommended at paragraph 83.260 that the *Railway Medical Service* will need to be merged in the *Central Health Service*. They have recommended that all health cadres in the Central Government except those in the armed forces should be merged and the *Central Health Service* be formed. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission



recommended that a separate pool of *Specialists* in the Railways should be created from the members of the *Indian Railway Medical Service* with post-graduate qualifications and not less than 5 years of service who give their option to join this pool of *Specialists*. The initial pay scale for the *Specialist Service* has been recommended as Rs. 3000-4500. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have dealt with various posts in the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare in Chapter 69. For the *Directorate General of Health Services* the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission has recommended at paragraph 69.16 that standard designations like *Joint Director General*, *Deputy Director General* and *Assistant Director General Grade-I* and *Grade II*, *Deputy Director* and *Assistant Director* should be adopted. The pay scales available in the Directorate General of Health Services are the scales of Rs. 2200-4000, Rs. 3000-4500, Rs. 3700-5000, Rs. 4500-5700, Rs. 5100-5700 and Rs. 5900-6700, respectively.

38.1.13           The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have discussed the pay scales of Medical and para-medical staff at Chapter 52. The *Central Health Service* consists of 5233 *Medical Officers*, the *Indian Railway Medical Service* has a strength of 2569, the *Indian Ordnance Factories Health Services* has 275 doctors and there are 250 *Medical Officers* elsewhere other than the *Armed Forces Medical Services*. These 250 doctors are having specific positions in the Department/ Office at field locations of the Department of Space and Atomic Energy, Central Police Organisations, etc.

38.1.14           The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission at paragraph 52.10 recommended the creation of an All India Health and Medical Service. This being the long term ultimate aim the Commission has recommended for the following immediate steps to be taken:

- (i)           *The Central Health Service may be integrated so that the 4 Sub-cadres are unified into a single Cadre with a common seniority.*
- (ii)          *A high powered Committee should be appointed to start a dialogue between the States and the Centre and the*



*modalities for an All India Health and Medical Service should be worked out within a fixed time frame of 5 years,*

(iii) *The Heads of the Health Services, Railway Medical Service and Indian Ordnance Factories Health Service should work out arrangements for inter - service exchange of personnel, and*

(iv) *Posts outside the Organised Services excluding the Armed Forces Medical Personnel should be immediately integrated into the Central Health Service.*

38.1.15 In has been noted at paragraph 52.11 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report that by a Notification in October, 1996, the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare have provided for direct entry of *Super Specialists* at the level of Rs. 3700-5000, with the requisite qualifications and 5 years experience in the relevant super-speciality. In paragraphs 52.12, 52.13 and 52.14 the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have recommended that *Specialists* should be directly recruited by the UPSC to the extent of 50% of the posts in the pay scale of Rs. 3000-4500 at entry and 50% of the posts should be filled by promotion from among in-service *Doctors* having requisite qualifications. *Super Specialists* in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000 should be filled to the extent of 50% by direct recruitment and 50% through promotion of doctors possessing the requisite qualifications. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission has recommended abolition of separate sub-cadres and preparation of a common seniority list between different streams at the level of Rs. 3000-4500 should be worked out inter se and at the level of Rs. 3700-5000, a final inter se common seniority between the first common list and *Super-Specialists* should be worked out on the same principles as has been explained at Annexure 52.1 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report. The second list having the seniority list of *Super Specialists* will form the basis for career progression to higher positions and the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have suggested that the pay scale of Rs. 3700-5000 will be the highest entry level for any *Medical Doctor*.



38.1.16 At present the career progression of doctors upto the senior administrative grade is different for *General Duty Officers* and *Specialists* and will be clear from the chart below:-

Sl.No.	Scale of Pay (in Rs.)	GDOs (General Duty Officers)	Specialists
1.	5900-6700		3 years in non-functional selection grade or 17 years in Group A. (floating posts)
2.	4500-5700	5 years or 14 years limited to 15% of senior duty posts	8 years after entry
3.	3700-5000	6 years after STS (Rs. 3000-4500)	2 years after entry
4.	3000-5000		Entry
5.	3000-4500	4 years after entry	
6.	2200-4000	Entry	

38.1.17 The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission at paragraph 52.15 have recommended a Dynamic Assured Career Progression Mechanism for the different streams of doctors based on the proposed entry levels above in replacement of the existing system as indicated above. The following chart shows the residency period of the Dynamic Assured Career Progression Mechanism.

Scale of Pay (in Rs.)	GDOs	Specialists	Super Specialists
2200-4000	4	-	-
3000-4500	5	2	-
3700-5000	4	4	4
4500-5700	-	-	-

38.1.18 The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have also recommended granting of 25% non-practising allowance, training, study leave and other facilities for doctors and additional weightage at the time of superannuation depending upon the qualification at paragraph 52.19 of the Report.

38.1.19 We have earlier pointed out the broad features of the Bihar Health Service. It may be seen that the Bihar Health Service is in no way similar to the Central Health Service either in structure, in promotion prospects or in terms of pay scales. There are no posts of *Specialists* or *Super Specialists* which are recruited at higher levels though there may be doctors with similar qualifications.

38.1.20 We also have with us S.O. (notification) No-750 dated 6.8.1985 published in the Bihar Gazette on 7.8.1985 and this superceded the 14.11.1929 Rules. According to the Bihar State Medical Service (Basic Grade) Recruitment Rules, 1984 M.B.B.S. degree holders were eligible subject to permanent registration with the Bihar Medical Registration Council and the four papers in which tests were to be conducted for direct recruitment were also specified. Subsequently on 21.5.1997 the Health, Medical Education and Family Welfare Department issued Notification No. 162 (17) by which the Bihar Medical Education Services Cadre and encadred posts Recruitments Rules, 1997 came into force. Rule 5 lists the posts of Resident Doctor, Registrar, Assistant Professor, Associate Professor, Professor, Principal and posts of Deputy Director, Joint Director cum Controller of



Examinations and Director or Additional Director to be included in the cadre. The post of Resident Doctor and Registrar were to be converted into that of Lecturer. Doctors on first appointment to the Bihar Medical Education Service Cadre were to be treated on probation for two years and only after satisfactory service they were to be confirmed. The recent Rules also provide that promotion to the post of Assistant Professor would be given only after a minimum of four years of teaching experience as Registrar or Lecturer. A minimum of five years of teaching experience was required as Assistant Professor before being considered for promotion as Associate Professor. Professors were required to have the qualification laid down by the Medical Council of India and in addition to the minimum educational qualification, eligible Doctors were also required to have a minimum teaching experience of five years as Associate Professor. It has been further provided that Assistant Professors, Associate Professors and Professors will be transferred every five years without fail.

38.1.21 On 1.4.1996 the total strength of the Bihar Health Service stood at 9311. The total number is spread over the following scales and the sanctioned strength includes permanent and temporary posts:-

Posts	Pay Scale (Rs.)	Sanctioned Strength
Basic Grade	2425-4000	6020
Junior Selection Grade (20%)/ Deputy Superintendent	3000-4500	1862
12-1/2% S.S.G./ Chief Medical Officer/ Superintendent/ Additional Chief Medical Officer	4100-5300	1164
Super Time Scale (2 ½ %) / Deputy Director/ Regional Deputy Director	4300-5550	252
Chief Malaria Officer	4300-5550	1
Joint Director and Additional Director	4500-5700	5 each
Director	5100-6300	1
Director in Chief	5900-6700	1



38.1.22 Conversion of selection grade posts have been issued by the Health Department through their order No-3/D1-1-01/96-1125(3) dated 1.12.1997 but it is not indicated whether the Finance Department has been consulted. Moreover no post in the pay scale of Rs. 3700-5000 has been mentioned and on the face of it a question that needs to be answered is if there is no selection grade or post in the pay scale of Rs. 3700-5000, how is the Associate Professor in a position to draw the pay scale of Rs. 3700-5000, the pay scale sanctioned for the post and indicated in the Finance Department Resolution No. 6021 dated 18.12.1989. This requires to be looked into and specially why the **Dental Service** has a senior selection grade in the pay scale of Rs. 4100-5300 instead of Rs. 3700-5000.

38.1.23 Regulations of the Medical Council of India regarding appointment of **Teachers** and **Visiting Physicians/Surgeons**, etc. in Medical Colleges and attached hospitals for under-graduate and post-graduate teaching approved by the Government of India on 5.6.1971, now stand superceded. We tried our best to obtain the recent guidelines which are in force but we have been unable to procure the recent Regulations in spite of having contacted the Director - in - Chief and Director, Health Services a number of times. According to our information the recent guidelines provide academic qualifications for both **Specialists** and **Super Specialists** and the guidelines approved by the Government of India in 1971 are no longer the basis for appointments in Medical Colleges elsewhere in India. However, the Director, Health Services has assured us that the guidelines of 1971 are still being followed by the Government of Bihar. The Medical Council of India have circulated regulations on minimum standard requirements for a Medical College for one hundred admissions annually and these stand approved by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Government of India on 3.11.1977. It has been indicated therein that the teaching staff of all the departments of a Medical College shall be whole time and non-practising. It further provides that in case of non-availability of suitably qualified medical men for teaching on non clinical subjects, non-medical scientists, preferably possessing



doctorate qualification in their subject may be appointed up to a maximum of 30 per cent of the total strength of the teaching staff of a Department.

38.1.24 Given the lack of up to date information, we refer to posts available in the Jawaharlal Institute of Post Graduate Medical Education and Research (JIPMER), Pondicherry as well as the Maulana Azad Medical College, New Delhi and Safdarjung Hospital. *Director/Dean (Academic)/Medical Superintendent*, JIPMER is in the scale of Rs. 5900-6700, *Professor (Medical)* is in the scale of Rs. 4500-5700, the *Associate Professor* is in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000, *Dy. Director (Administration)/Assistant Professor* in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500 and the *Registrar (Academic)/Lecturer* in the scale of Rs. 2200-4000. In the Maulana Azad Medical College at New Delhi the *Chief Medical Officer* is in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000, the *Senior Medical Officer* in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500 and the *Medical Officer* is in the pay scale of Rs. 2200-4000. The pay scales of *Dean, Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor, Registrar* and *Lecturer* are the same as in JIPMER. In the Dental side the pay scales in the Delhi Medical College are as follows :-

Sl.No.	Designation	Pay Scale (in Rs.)
1	Lecturer (Dental)	2200-4000
2	Assistant Professor (Dental)	3000-4500
3	Associate Professor (Dental)	3000-5000
4	Professor (Dental)	3700-5000/ 4500-5700

38.1.25 The Safdarjung Hospital at Delhi is a non teaching Institution and the pay scales in that Institution are as below :-

Sl.No.	Designation	Pay Scale (in Rs.)
1	Medical Officer	2200-4000
2	Dy. Director (Administration)/ Medical Officer, Grade II/ General Duty Officer - II/ Assistant Medical Superintendent	3000-4500
3	Asstt. Director/Asstt. Professor/ Cancer Surgeon/ Orthopaedic Surgeon/ Sr. Medical Officer/ Specialist	3000-4500
4	Chief Medical Officer/Dy. Medical Officer/ Director (Administration)/ Plastic Surgeon/ Neuro Surgeon, etc.	3700-5000
5	Dy. Director (Rehabilitation)/ Senior Physician/ Senior Specialist/ Senior Surgeon/ Senior Anaesthetist	4500-5700
6	Addl. Medical Superintendent/ Consultants in various disciplines / Medical Superintendent	5900-6700

38.1.26 We have already indicated what the pay scales in Bihar are, what pay scales the selection grade posts have been sanctioned, the Career Progression Scheme for *General Duty Officers* in the Government of India, pay scales in Jawaharlal Institute of Post Graduate Medical Education and Research, Maulana Azad Medical College, New Delhi as well as Safdarjung Hospital and the demands of the Association. The following are the areas in Bihar which are not in conformity with the Central pattern :-

- (1) There is no provision of lateral induction of **Specialists** and **Super Specialists** in the **Bihar Health Service**. Even in the *Central Health Service* there are *Specialists* who enter service in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500 and



the Government of India, Ministry of Health has recently issued a Notification in October, 1996 providing for direct entry of *Super Specialists* in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000 with the requisite qualifications and 5 years experience in the relevant super speciality. Even in the *Medical Services* of the Indian Railways as well as in the Indian Ordnance Factories *Health Service* there is provision for lateral entry of *Super Specialists* though the former do not have a separate pool of specialists in the *Indian Railway Medical Service*.

(2)

Doctors in Bihar enter service in the basic grade and then in a stage wise manner get promotion to higher pay scales. This system ensures promotion from the common seniority list but does not encourage greater specialisation because pay protection to doctors both in the teaching side as well as in the administration side is ensured if a doctor in the teaching side or one in the administration side draw pay higher than the person just senior to him in the common seniority list. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission at Annexure 52.1 have suggested broad principles for fixation of seniority of doctors. This may be adopted in case the Bihar Government decide to follow the Central pattern. We quote below the provisions of Annexure 52.1

"BROAD PRINCIPLES FOR SENIORITY FIXATION OF DOCTORS"

1. *Medical Doctors will enter service at three levels – GDOs (Rs.2200-4000), Specialists (Rs.3000-4500) and Super-Specialists (Rs. 3700-5000). The inter-se seniority of GDMOs will be fixed in the order of merit at the point of entry into service in the grade of Rs. 2200-4000.*
2. *Specialists will be recruited 50% by promotion and 50% by direct recruitment, the first point being set aside for promotion.*

*Inter-se seniority among specialists will be fixed in the order of point of entry into service in the grade of Rs. 3000-4500.*

3. *On the date of entry of specialist(s) in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500, Specialists and GDOs already in that grade on regular basis on that date, will rank en-bloc senior to the specialist entrant(s) who will be en-bloc senior to all the GDOs who enter that grade on the same day. The criterion should be followed for combined seniority in the first instance.*

4. *Inter-se seniority among the super specialists will be decided by the point of entry into service. On the date of entry of a super-specialist(s), in the grade of Rs. 3700-5000, all medical officers already in that grade on regular basis on that date, as per combined seniority will rank en-bloc senior to the super-specialist entrant(s). All super specialists entering service on that date will rank next, followed by medical officers of the combined seniority entering that grade by promotion to posts other than Super-Specialists, on that date, in that order. This will be the final combined seniority list for promotions to higher positions. "*

(3) In Bihar the latest Medical Council of India guidelines are not being followed specially with regard to appointment of **Super Specialists**. Thus the guidelines would have to be adopted if pay scales of the Central Government are to be availed of by doctors in Bihar.

(4) In the Government of India both teaching side posts and administrative posts are sanctioned to incumbents in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000 but in Bihar in the administration side there are no posts in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000.



- (5) According to Notification No. GSR. 689 (E) dated 11.11.1982 of the Health Department of Government of India *Medical Officers* are promoted as *Senior Medical Officers* in the Central Duty Cadre after 5 years regular service in the grade and in the category of Teaching sub-cadre posts *Assistant Professors* with 5 years regular service in the grade become *Associate Professors* and *Associate Professors* with 5 years regular service are promoted as *Professors*. In Bihar according to 21.5.1997 notification of the Health Department a minimum of 4 years teaching experience is required for promoting **Assistant Professors** from the post of **Lecturers** i.e. one year less than the prescribed service required in the Centre. In the Centre for the post of **Professor** there is 25% direct recruitment and this extends also to **Specialist Grade I**. In Bihar there is no provision for direct recruitment above the basic grade.

- (6) For promotion as **Assistant Professor** post-graduate degree in the concerned specialization is required though the requirement of post-graduate qualification does not stand spelt out clearly in the orders of the Health Department of Bihar. In the Central Health Service Rules, 1982 it is provided for Specialists grade that for both *Associate Professor* and *Assistant Professor* at least three years teaching experience is required in the grade below. However for posts at sub para 5 above post-graduate qualification is not mandatory.

- (7) In the Non-teaching side there is no provision for probation period whereas in the Government of India the probation period for those appointed to the service by direct recruitment is laid down as 2 years and the Government have the option to extend the period of probation. We recommend that rules be immediately framed for introducing a mandatory

two year probation period for doctors in the **Bihar Health Service**.

(8) The Central Health Rules, 1982 provided for transfer on deputation of suitable officers holding analogous posts under the Central Government whereas in the Government of Bihar there is no provision for transfer on deputation or for short term contract of suitable officers.

(9) The Central Health Service Rule, 1982 did not provide for non-practising allowance to *Additional Directors General* or *Director General*, Health Services whereas in Bihar right from the **Director – in - Chief** to the **Medical Officers**, non-practising allowance is payable. Recent orders issued by the Government of India regarding non-practising allowances, however, provide for an upper ceiling and has been extended to all *Doctors* right up to the *Director General*.

(10) The Health Department have brought to our notice that time and again notifications are issued by the Department posting a doctor in his own pay scale but against a higher post with a higher scale. This practice of posting of doctors on higher posts without the doctor having been promoted in that particular scale and grade has been resorted to not only to avoid strictures from the Courts of the State but also to fill up vacant posts. But the fact remains that a particular post requires a certain stature and experience which is only possible if doctors with the requisite qualifications are posted to such important positions. We consider the practice akin to what used to be in vogue earlier in Works Departments and the system was then known as '*current charge*'. However, that system has now been discontinued because it led to a situation where promotions were not being given on time and senior



officers who were not being given 'current charge' protested and it also created complications in future during promotions.

We find from the various notifications of the Health Department issued in 1997 and 1998 that Civil Surgeon cum Chief Medical Officers have been transferred and posted as Deputy Director (Health), Medical Officers have been posted as Superintendents and even as Civil Surgeon cum Chief Medical Officer. District Leprosy Eradication Officers have been posted as Civil Surgeons, District Malaria Officers/ Deputy Superintendents/ Radiologists have been posted as Additional Chief Medical Officers. We recommend that this system should be forthwith discontinued because this neither promotes administrative efficiency nor creates a pressure on the Government to promote doctors in time against vacant posts and also creates a claim for higher pay scales without the doctor having earned that scale by virtue of having been promoted to that higher grade.

The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report at paragraph 22.25 has discussed in brief the provisions of '*in situ promotion*' which provides that Group C and D employees should be given at least one promotion grade to those who are directly recruited and who could not get a promotion even after reaching the maximum of the scale. As this scheme was only introduced in 1991 and restricted to Group C and D posts, the State government could consider its introduction after obtaining the complete details from the Central Government but we will be discussing the scheme in further detail when we submit our recommendations on promotion policy for State Government employees. However, this is not the appropriate method by which stagnation is taken care of.



38.1.27 From the point-wise discussion above it will be clear that the doctors in Bihar have a cadre structure which do not match either the cadre structure available in Medical Colleges in Central Government or that of the *Central Health Service*. The career progression of doctors up to super time administrative scale, i.e., Rs. 5900-6700, is not available in Bihar and perhaps no attempt has also been made for ensuring such quick promotions. We have indicated earlier at paragraph 38.1.16 and 38.1.17 the provisions of the Career Progression Scheme as well as what has now been recommended by the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission. This dynamic career progression cannot be implemented unless the Bihar Government introduces lateral entry of **Specialists** and **Super Specialists** in the grade of Rs. 3000-4500 and Rs. 3700-5000. Any attempt at introducing piecemeal any Career Progression Scheme without **Super Specialists** and **Specialists** should be discouraged and in our opinion is not advisable.

38.1.28 In the Central Government posts whose pay scales have a minimum of not less than Rs. 4000 were considered in Group A but in Bihar according to the Resolution No-3.R-1-405/82 Ka. 3746 dated 31.3.1986 of the Department of Personnel and Administrative Reforms all **Posts and Services**, the maximum of the pay of which is Rs. 2000 or above are considered to be in Class I. Hence according to this classification only junior selection grade posts of the **State Services** or others in the pay scale of Rs. 1350-2000 now revised to Rs. 3000-4500 generally can be considered as Class I posts. However, on the basis of Bihar T.A. Rules, Rule 28 members of All India Services and Government employees prior to 1.4.1989 getting a pay of more than Rs. 1500 were considered to be in Class I. Hence **Doctors** in the basic grade in Bihar have all along been in Class II while in the Central Government doctors in the basic grade of Rs. 2200-4000 are in Group A. **Doctors** in Bihar have been sanctioned three advance increments in the basic grade and this has now been in force at least from 1965 onwards. Rule 3 (2) of the Central Health Service Rules, 1982 stipulate that all posts included in the Service shall be classified as Group 'A' posts.



38.1.29 After the 2<sup>nd</sup> Pay Revision Committee's recommendations were implemented basic grade for the Executive (Deputy Magistrates and Deputy Collectors) and **Judicial Services** as well as **Engineering Services** was Rs. 325-985 with the maximum being Rs. 925 but for **Civil Assistant Surgeons** and equivalent posts the non-practising scale was Rs. 415-925. If one were to add three increments of Rs. 30 each to the initial of Rs. 325 then we have the pay scale of Rs. 415-925. Prior to 1965 **Civil Assistant Surgeons** were in the pay scale of Rs. 200-450 while **Assistant Engineers** and **Munsifs** were in the scale of Rs. 220-750 and **Deputy Magistrates/Deputy Collectors** were in the scale of Rs. 220-800. We have furnished these details to clarify that the system of grant of three increments to doctors in the basic grade has been blessed by at least the last four Pay Revision Committees of this State.

38.1.30 As we have not been able to establish the parity of **Bihar Health Service** with *Central Health Service* or the hierarchy of posts and structures in Medical Colleges of the Centre, we are unable to recommend the scale of Rs. 2200-4000 as the basic grade for the doctors. But we recommend that the system of grant of three increments will continue and directly recruited doctors instead of drawing pay at the initial of the scale of Rs. 6500-10500 will draw their pay in the pay scale of Rs. 7100 instead of Rs. 6500. The higher posts encadred will be in the revised pay scale of Rs. 10000-15200, Rs. 12000-16500, Rs. 14300-18300, Rs. 16400-20000 and Rs. 18400-22400. These scales will respectively be available to **Assistant Professors**, **Associate Professors**, **Professors**, **Director** and **Director – in – Chief**. The revised pay scale for the existing scales of Rs. 4100-5300, Rs. 4300-5550 and Rs. 4500-5700 is the same as recommended by us in Volume I, page 47 of our Report. Posts in these three scales will be bunched and get one revised pay scale of Rs. 14300-18300. A **Professor** in super time scale as well as **Joint Directors** and **Additional Directors** will be in the same pay scale. As we are not going into the question of pay of selection grade posts or time bound promotions at this stage we are not recommending the pay of posts in selection grades in the administrative side. However, the **Director-in-Chief** will be in the revised scale of Rs. 18400-22400 the **Director** in the pay scale of Rs. 16400-20000



and Joint Directors and Additional Directors will be in the scale of Rs. 14300-18300.

**POSTS IN INDIGENOUS SYSTEMS OF MEDICINE & HOMEOPATHY**

38.2.1 The Bihar State Ayurved / Unani Demonstration and Teaching Officers Association represented by General Secretary, Dr. Om Prakash Sinha; Dr. Devendra Prasad Singh, General Secretary of Bihar Ayurved and Unani Medical Officers Association and Bihar State Homeopathy Medical Officers Association have represented to the Fitment Committee for Central pay scales which are tabulated below: -

DESIGNATION	EXISTING PAY SCALE (in Rs.)	SCALE DEMANDED (in Rs.)
Ayurved Chikitsa Padadhikari / Unani Chikitsa Padadhikari/ Residential Medical Officers/Lecturers/ District Indigenous System of Medicine Officer/Warden Inspector/ Research Officer/ Deputy Superintendent/Demonstrator & Pathologist	2000-3800 2200-4000	8000-13500
Sr. Selection Grade Medical Officers & Readers	2400-4150 3000-4500	10000-15200
Superintendent, Ayurvedic Hospital, Patna/ Manager/Professor	3700-5000	12000-16500
Deputy Director, Unani/Homeopathy/Unani Medicines	4100-5300	18400-22400
Director, Indigenous System of Medicines	4300-5550	22400-24500



38.2.2

The petitioners have mentioned that there are in all 700 Doctors posted in the various indigenous systems of medicine. In September, 1979 they were declared gazetted but they were not given similar pay scales as the allopathic doctors. The petitioners have submitted a copy of a Patna High Court judgment delivered in CWJC No. 3256/92 in which the Hon'ble Court held that the grievance of the petitioners in being denied the same pay and facilities as are being granted to the M.B.B.S. Doctors appears reasonable in the facts and circumstances of the case and the case of the petitioners had not been considered properly in the State Government. The Finance Department on 15.9.97 sanctioned for the **Homeopathy Doctors** the scale of Rs.2200-4000 against the previous scale of Rs.1500-2750 provided they are degree holders or declared homeopathic physicians by the Board which awards after a four years course D.H.M.S. (Diploma in Homeopathic Medicine and Surgery) or a degree by the State established Board for Homeopathic System of Medicine. Subsequently on 21.1.98 the Health Department allowed to these Doctors three higher selection grades in the pay scales of Rs.3000-4500, Rs. 3700-5000 and Rs.4100-5300. The representationists have also requested for 25% non-practising allowance, house rent allowance, medical allowance, revision in the existing rate for purchase of books/magazines from Rs. 100 to Rs. 500 per month and exemption from departmental examination because Doctors in the Centre are not required to pass such examinations.

38.2.3

The case of the Doctors in the various systems of indigenous medicine have been considered by the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission in their Report at Paragraph 52.28 to 52.34. The recruitment educational qualification at entry for Ayurvedic / Homeopathy / Unani medicine and surgery involves education and internship for a period comparable to the



allopathic stream post-graduate courses and degrees such as the MD and MBBS, respectively. However, it has been recommended by the Fifth Pay Commission that an organized service called the Central Indigenous and Homoeo Medical Service needs to be constituted. In Bihar a Service of a similar nature has not yet been constituted. That may be one of the reasons why posts in this Directorate in Bihar have not been created beyond the scale of Rs. 4300-5550. The Fifth Central Pay Commission recommended that the physicians in the indigenous systems of medicine should be given the same allowances and facilities as granted to General Duty Officers of the allopathic stream. The case of the **Doctors** in the various indigenous systems was discussed by the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee in 1989, Chapter 15 at paragraphs 149 to 161. On the basis of the recommendations of the 4<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission and the Central Government having accepted parity between all systems of medicines, the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee found it inevitable to accept the same in Bihar as well. In the light of this we recommend the same scales for the doctors in the various indigenous systems as are available to Doctors in the allopathic stream in Bihar. However, the higher grades, which are not available to the indigenous systems of medicine, will also not be available now as the posts do not stand created. This matter will be further considered by us when we deal with promotions in a subsequent volume of our Report.

38.2.4 Shri B.N.S. Bharati, Principal, State RPTS Medical College Hospital, Muzaffarpur has pointed out to this Committee that the College Lecturers are not getting the same pay scales as the medical practitioners and the four pay scales, Rs.2200-4000, Rs. 3000-4500, Rs.3700-5000 and Rs.4100-5300, should be sanctioned. It has also been requested that teaching allowance should be granted to the teachers of such Colleges. This is for the Health Department to look into and enquire whether the teachers in this Medical College are also engaged in teaching work. However, an important fact is that the Doctors in the allopathic stream in Bihar start their career with three advance increments which are still not available to the Doctors in the Indigenous Systems of Medicine and Homeopathy. We do not recommend extending three advance increments to Doctors in streams other than those in



the allopathic stream. The Vaidyas, Hakims, House Physicians and Pathologists will be entitled to the same pay scales including the basic grade scale as has been recommended for the Doctors with similar qualifications.

Deputy Directors in Homeopathy, Ayurvedic and Unani Wing

38.3.1 Shri Chakradhar Paswan, Surendra Prasad Singh, Deputy Director, Homeopathy and Md. Khalil Ansari, Deputy Director, Unani have submitted a representation to the Fitment Committee that the pay scale of **Director**, Indigenous System of Medicines has been revised to Rs. 4300-5550 and **Deputy Directors** have been sanctioned the same pay scale as sanctioned to Principals (Rs. 4100-5300). It has been pointed out that earlier the **Director**, was in the scale of Rs. 2225-2675, **Deputy Directors** and Principals in the scale of Rs. 1900-2500 and the **Professors** were in the pay scale of Rs. 1575-2300. It has been requested that the **Deputy Directors** should be recommended the pay scale of Rs. 4800-5700 revised to Rs. 15100-18300 and the **Director** should be in the scale of Rs. 5100-6300 now revised to Rs. 16400-20000.

38.3.2 In the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report we find from paragraph 52.29 that there are 179 Indian Systems of Medicine and Homocopathy *Physicians* in the scales of Rs. 2200-4000, Rs. 3000-4500 and Rs. 3700-5000 but there are no posts in the scale of Rs. 4500-5700 and only three posts in the higher scale of Rs. 5900-6700. The Commission recommended at paragraph 52.33 that the doctors in the Indian Systems of Medicine and Homocopathy should have general parity with Allopathic Doctors known as *General Duty Medical Officers*. We do not know whether orders to that effect have been issued. The Notification No. G.S.R. 569 (E) dated 30.9.97 that have been issued by the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) only mentions that the starting pay scale for all posts requiring medical practice in Indian Systems of Medicine and Homeopathy and a degree in ISM & H as the minimum qualification will be Rs. 8000-13500.



32  
38.3.3 In the list of posts under the Central Government Health Scheme we find that there are Ayurvedic/Homoeopathic/Unani Physicians in the pay scale of Rs. 2200-4000, Senior Medical Officers, Ayurvedic / Senior Medical Officers, Homoeopathy, Unani Physician, Ayurvedic Physician in the pay scale of Rs. 3000-4500/ Rs. 3000-5000, Chief Medical Officers in the pay scale of Rs. 3700-5000 and then there are Additional Director/Chief Medical Officer (SAG)/ Senior Chief Medical Officer in the pay scale of Rs. 5900-6700. In comparison there are additional levels in Bihar of Deputy Directors, who are in the pay scale of Rs. 4100-5300 and Reader and Professors. Therefore, the representation of Shri Singh, Shri Paswan and Md. Ansari are not very relevant to this Committee's terms of reference. If in the Central Government doctors are not having the pay scale of Rs 4100-5300, Rs. 4300-5550, Rs. 4500-5700 and Rs.4800-5700 we are unable to recommend the scales for fitment of doctors in the Indigenous Systems of Medicine. Moreover teaching posts are not indicated among the Central Government posts.

38.3.4 In view of the discussions above we find ourselves unable to resolve the problem posed by the representationists who have drawn the attention of the Fitment Committee to make a distinction in the pay scales of Principal and Deputy Director. An easy solution is also not possible because apparently the recommendations of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have not been accepted and notified by the Central Government. Therefore, we are unable to recommend any scale beyond Rs. 3700-5000 to any other post except that of the Director. Among the list of posts in the Indian Systems of Medicine we do not find any reference to Lecturers, Demonstrators, Readers, Professors, Principals, Deputy Directors and Director but these are sanctioned posts and incumbents who are working against such posts will be fitted in scales that we have recommended earlier. The Director will be in the scale of Rs. 14300-18300. For the others in the scales of Rs. 4100-5300 and 3700-5000, we recommend the scale of Rs. 12000-16500, Rs. 10000-15200 will be admissible to all doctors and teachers in the pre-revised scale of Rs. 3000-4500. The basic grade doctors will be in the scale of Rs. 6500-10500 because they are not entitled in Bihar to three advance increments on appointment.



38.4.1 The Bihar Dental Health Service Association through their Secretary, Dr. B.K.Singh and Chairman, Dr. Nand Lall have, submitted a representation to the Fitment Committee requesting for Central revised scales. It is stated in their representation that every year there is a total enrolment of 30 students in the Patna Dental College while the total number of enrolment in Medical College is of 50 students. The minimum qualification required to become a **Dental Doctor** is a four years course with one year Internship. The Ministry of Health of the Government of India declared the *Dental Doctors* equivalent to *Medical Doctors* in 1984 and the 4<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission recommended the same pay scales for *Medical* as well as *Dental Doctors*. However, in Bihar there are certain anomalies other than not granting three advance increments in the basic grade of the *Dental Doctors* though this stands allowed to the *Medical Doctors* since the last more than thirty years. The Finance Department Resolution No. 781 dated 8.2.1996 has revised the pay scales of the *Dental Doctors* with the basic grade being Rs. 2200-4000, the junior selection grade of Rs. 3000-4500, the senior selection grade being Rs. 4100-5300 and the super time scale being Rs. 4300-5550. The Association has pointed out that the pay scales of Rs. 4500-5700, Rs. 5100-6300 and Rs. 5900-6700 have not been allowed to the **Dental Doctors** though these stand sanctioned to the **Bihar Health Service**. It has been requested that the non-teaching posts should be considered equivalent to *Dental Doctors* in the Central Government Health Scheme and teaching posts in the Dental side as well as of the Bihar Health Service should be in the same pay scales. Further, it has been requested that the **Tutors** should be redesignated as **Assistant Professors** and **Lecturers** as **Associate Professors**. **Professors** with five years experience in that grade should be considered to be equivalent to **Professor** in the super time scale in the allopathic stream and the **Principal** of the Dental College should also be considered equivalent to the **Principal** of the Medical Colleges of the State. The Association has also submitted a notification of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare wherein on



22.12.1997, the *Grade A posts* under the *Central Health Service* have been sanctioned revised pay scales which are as follows:-

Sl.No.	Post	Existing Scale (in Rs.)	Revised Scale (in Rs.)
1.	S-15	2200-4000	8000-13500
2.	S-19	3000-4500/ 3000-5000	1000-15200
3.	S-21	3700-5000	12000-16500
4.	S-24	4500-5700	14300-18300
5.	S-29	5900-6700	18400-22400
6.	S-30	7300-7600	22400-24500
7.	S-33	8000 FIXED	26000 FIXED

38.4.2 In addition, a notification dated 7.4.98 of the Department of Health regarding non-practising allowance has also been submitted which mentions that *Central Health Service Officers* may be paid non-practising Allowance @ 25% of basic pay subject to pay plus non-practising allowance not exceeding Rs. 29,500.

38.4.3 The 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission at paragraph 52.25 have recommended that a separate *Central Dental Service* should be created comprising all *Dental Surgeons* in the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Indian Railways, Ordnance Factories Health Service, Ministry of Labour, Department of Coal and other Departments. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have recommended at paragraph 52.25 that the pay scale of Rs. 2200-4000 is recommended for *Dental Surgeons*, Rs. 3000-4500 for *Senior Dental Surgeons*, Rs. 3700-5000 for *Chief Dental Surgeons*, Rs. 4500-5700 for selection grade *Chief Dental Surgeons*, Rs. 5900-6700 for *Dental Consultants* and Rs. 7300-7600 for *Additional Director General, Health Services (Dental)*. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission did not recommend the formation of specialized sub-cadres for *Dental Surgeons* nor a separate Directorate of Dental/Oral Health because of the small size of the cadre.



35

38.4.4 We have not been furnished with the total number of **Dental Surgeons** in the State. But even in the Centre there are only 76 *Dental Surgeons* in the Ministries of Health & Family Welfare, Railways and Coal. We are not clear whether separate rules have been framed for the **Bihar Dental Service**. The Department of Personnel and Administrative Reforms Resolution No. 2653 dated 28.2.1989 also does not mention the **Dental Doctors** as a separate Service or a cadre.

38.4.5 As the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have allowed to *Dental Doctors* the same pay scales that have been allowed to the medical doctors, we accordingly recommend the same scales for the **Dental Surgeons** as we have recommended for the **Medical Doctors**. However, as the higher pay scales beyond the basic grade for the **Dental Doctors** are only selection grade posts, we are not in a position to recommend at this stage what the pay scale of the higher grades should be. But we are recommending that if the posts in the higher grades are mentioned in the Cadre Rules, they will have the same pay scales as we have allowed to the **Medical Doctors**. If the posts are merely designated as selection grades then we will be submitting our recommendations separately regarding the promotion policy for the **Dental Doctors**. In the Central Government there are apparently no teaching posts and hence there is no discussion regarding them. We will be submitting our recommendations regarding the pay scales of the teaching posts after ascertaining whether teaching posts stand encadred in the Recruitment Rules.

Assistant Clinical Pathologist

38.5.1 The Indian Medical Association, Patna Medical College Hospital (PMCH) through their President, Dr. Shanti S. B. Singh and Assistant Clinical Pathologists of PMCH, Patna and others have requested the Fitment Committee that as they are **Lecturers** in status and pay, they should be given an equivalent teaching allowance of Rs. 150 per month. The Government Resolution of the Finance Department issued in December 1989 and the previous notification of December 1981 do not indicate the pay scale



for the post of Assistant **Clinical Pathologist**. However, this post is mentioned in paragraph 44.58 of the report of the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee and the post is in the Medical College Hospitals and is included in the **Bihar Health Service**. If the post is included in the **Bihar Health Service**, then Assistant **Clinical Pathologists** will be entitled to the same pay scales as are available to that Service. In case the post is held by **Doctors** in higher scales grade pay scale will be applicable.

### **Clinical Psychologist**

38.6.1 Shri Bishnudeo Lal Karn, Clinical Psychologist in Darbhanga Medical College Hospital has requested the Fitment Committee for the scale of Rs. 2200-4000 because even in the Ranchi Mental Hospital the **Psychologist** has been granted that scale. We find from the lists of posts under the Health Department that the **Psychologist cum Social Worker** is in the pay scale of Rs. 2000-3800. The recruitment qualification has not been indicated and on the basis of the recommendations of the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission Report at paragraph 52.46 we recommend that the scale may be either Rs. 2200-4000 or Rs. 1640-2900 depending upon the recruitment qualification. If Dr. Karn is a M.A./M.Sc. in Psychology with a diploma in medical and social psychology then he will be in the scale of Rs. 6500-10500 and if he is only a Post-graduate in Psychology then he will be in the scale of Rs. 5500-9000. **Clinical Psychologists** in various hospitals in the Centre are in pay scales ranging from Rs.1640-2900 to Rs. 2200-4000 and even in Rs. 2000-3500. On the point of recruitment educational qualification the petitioner is silent and we are unable to make a specific recommendation. However, on the basis of the recommendations of the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission, paragraph 52.46, the pay scale of the **Clinical Psychologist** in the Darbhanga Medical College Hospital and elsewhere and also in the Ranchi Mental Hospital, Kanke may be decided.



### Lecturer, Health Education

38.7.1 Dr. Shecobachan Pandey, Lecturer in Health Education and Family Planning Welfare Programme has represented to the Fitment Committee that the post which he is holding and the post of **Lecturer, Demography and Statistics** were earlier in the same pay scales but are different now and the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee raised the scale of the latter post from Rs. 2000-3800 to Rs. 2200-4000 but did not consider it necessary to also increase the pay scale of the **Lecturer, Health Education and Family Planning**. The Pay Anomaly Revision Committee at paragraph 13.40.3 recommended that the pay scale of the **Lecturer, (Demography and Statistics)**, Patna Medical College Hospital should be increased from Rs. 2000-3800 to that of Medical College Tutor (Rs. 2200-4000) because all along his pay scale has been the same as the Tutor in the Medical Colleges except for advance increments at the initial of the pay scale. We find from the chart enclosed that both the posts of **Lecturers** require a Masters Degree and while the latter post of **Lecturer in Demography and Statistics** requires a diploma in Demography, the **Lecturer in Health Education and Family Planning** has to have a diploma in Health Education or a Masters degree in public health. Therefore, we recommend for both the **Lecturers** the identical scale of Rs. 6500-10500. We find from the recommendations of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission at paragraph 69.13 and 69.46 that the *Health Education Officer* and *Physics Lecturer*, respectively, are in the scale of Rs. 6500-10500 with post-graduate qualification and the *Health Education Officer* also has an additional three years experience in addition to M.A. in Sociology.

### District Extension and Media Officer

38.8.1 Shri Chandra Shekhar Prasad Sharma, District Extension and Media Officer has represented to the Fitment Committee that he is now in the pay scale of Rs. 2000-3800, whereas the **District Public Relations Officer** is in the pay scale of Rs. 2200-4000. He has submitted a notification of the Bihar Public Service Commission published in the Bihar Gazette on 21.10.70 which mentions that the **Class II Gazetted Mass**



**Education and Information Officer** in the pay scale of Rs. 325-985 (maximum Rs. 925) will be recruited from candidates who are Post-graduate or Graduates in Sociology and Post-graduates are required to have a two years experience from a recognised Institution concerning health education, publicity as well as public relations work and for graduates, the experience was to be at least five years. There was also a condition in the said Notification that for post -graduates the work experience could be relaxed to only one year and for graduates it could be reduced from 5 to 3-years by the Commission. This is a post which requires a post-graduation qualification and in Chapter 69, the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission for *Non-medical Demonstrators* and *Physics Lecturers* have recommended the pay scale of Rs. 6500-10500 as the posts require post-graduates. For the *District Public Relations Officers* we have also recommended the same scale and hence the petitioner should not have any grievance on that account also. The **District Extension and Media Officer** will be in the revised scale of Rs. 6500-10500.

#### PHARMACY TEACHERS

38.9.1 Bihar State Pharmacy Teachers Association, Patna-7, through their President, have submitted two representations to this Committee. It has been pointed out that there are two Pharmacy Institutes in Patna and Ranchi and the **Principals** are in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500 and the **Lecturers** in the scale of Rs. 2000-3800. The total number of posts of **Principal** is one and that of **Lecturers** is 11. According to the representations, the **Principal** is required to have a M. Pharma. with sufficient experience and the **Lecturers** are required to have a B. Pharma. The Association has requested that for the **Lecturers** the pay scale of Rs. 2200-4000 and for the **Principal** the pay scale of Rs. 4500-5700 should be recommended. The Pharmacy Council of India have informed all institutions imparting Diploma course in Pharmacy that pay scales recommended by the All India Council of Technical Education should be sanctioned and the circular of 19.2.1997 was issued under the signature of Assistant Secretary of the Pharmacy Council of India mentioning that the *Lecturers* should be in the scale of Rs. 2200-4000, the *Senior Lecturer* in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500, the Head of the Department and selection grade *Lecturer* in the scale of Rs. 3700-5700 and the *Principal* to be in the scale of



Rs. 4500-6300. The Pharmacy Council circulated another circular on 3.9.97 asking for compliance regarding implementation of pay scales recommended by the All India Council of Technical Education (AICTE). The fact is that these scales recommended by the AICTE have not been implemented in Bihar irrespective of the fact that the Pharmacy Council informed all Institutes and all State Governments that if AICTE pay scales to teaching staff are not implemented by 31.12.97 it will be presumed that the concerned Institutes are not interested in the approval of their courses and examinations and the Pharmacy Council will take action and initiate steps for withdrawal of approval.

38.9.2 AICTE pay scales have not been dealt with in the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission Report and hence we are unable to establish an equivalence or comparability of pay scales. The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee discussed the pay scale of **Lecturers** and the **Principals** at paragraph 130 to 132 of Chapter 15 of their Report. That Committee recommended that pending Government decision on UGC / AICTE pay scales to the **Lecturers** and **Principals**, the **Lecturers** should be given the pay scale of Rs. 1000-1820 and the **Principals** the pay scale of Rs. 1575-2300. It also recommended that the **Lecturers** and the **Principals** in the Pharmacy Institute should be in higher scales than the **Drug Inspectors** and if the posts in Pharmacy Institute are not inter-changeable with **Drug Inspectors** then there would be justification for UGC / AICTE pay scales. The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee also agreed with the recommendations of the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee and recommended the scales of Rs. 2000-3800 and 3000-4500 for the **Lecturer** and **Principal**, respectively.

38.9.3 We recommend that since the Pharmacy Council of India gives recognition to the Pharmacy Institutes, their recommendation regarding AICTE scales should be agreed to and since the number of posts is negligible the increase in expenditure will also not be a problem. We would, therefore, recommend that the AICTE pay scales should be adopted and till such time the State Government is unable to decide, the **Principal** will be in the scale of Rs. 12000-16500 and the **Lecturers** in the scale of Rs. 8000-



13500. If according to the AICTE the **Principal** has to be in a higher pay scale than **Senior Lecturers** and **Heads of Departments**, the pay scales should be adopted as recommended by the AICTE and additional posts created if the number of students seeking enrolment justify the number of teachers and departments.

### Drug Inspectors

38.10.1 Bihar State Drug Service Association have submitted a representation to the Fitment Committee through their General Secretary, Shri Hemant Kumar Sinha and have requested for the following pay scales:-

Sl.No.	Post	Existing Scale (in Rs.)	Scale Demanded (in Rs.)
1.	Drug Inspector	1800-3330	6500-10500 (pay scale of Rs. 8000-13500 under consideration in the Centre)
2.	Senior Drug Inspector/ Assistant Drug Controller	2000-3800	10000-15200
3.	Deputy Drug Controller		12000-16500
4.	Joint Drug Controller		15100-18300
5.	Drug Controller	4300-5550	16400-20000

38.10.2 It has been submitted that the **Drug Inspectors** are gazetted Government Servants and a separate State Cadre for the **Drug Inspectors** has been constituted and recruitment is made through the Bihar Public Service Commission. The **Bihar State Drug Controller Service** (Recruitment and Service Conditions) have been framed and a copy of the Notification No. 1606 (15) dated 21.12.1989 has been issued. According to the representation the **Drug Inspectors** are required to study for 4 years after 10+2/ Intermediate in Science after which they are awarded a B. Pharma Degree. In addition one and half years experience is required in either preparation of drugs or training in testing of drugs. It has been pointed out that the total educational course consists of 5-1/2 years whereas for engineering graduates the integrated course is only of 4 years. They have also



submitted that if B. Pharma graduates are recruited elsewhere they are in the pay scale of Rs. 2200-4000. According to the representationist the recruitment and service condition mention that the post of **Drug Inspector** is transferable and there will be both a written examination and an oral examination for recruitment of **Drug Inspectors**.

38.10.3           The pay scale of the **Drug Inspectors** was dealt in detail by the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee and the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee, respectively, at paragraphs 13.23 and paragraph 22, Chapter 15. The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee has mentioned the essential qualifications for recruitment to the post and the lowest is graduation in Pharmacy or Pharmaceutical Chemistry but the training/experience of 1-1/2 years is mandatory.

38.10.4           We have with us the list of posts with the pay scales of the Government of India, Ministry of Health and in the Central Drug Standard Organisation there are posts of *Drug Inspectors* and they are in the scale of Rs. 2000-3500, the *Assistant Drugs Controller* is in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500, and the *Deputy Drugs Controller* in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000. There are also Central Drugs Laboratories in which the *Director* is in the scale of Rs. 4500-5700 as well as in Rs. 3700-5000 and the *Deputy Director* is in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500. The Director of the Calcutta and Mumbai' Drugs Laboratories is in the pay scale of Rs. 4500-5700 while the Director of the Chennai Drugs Laboratory is in the scale of 3700-5000. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have recommended the higher pay scale for the Chennai Drugs Laboratory at paragraph 69.53 but the Government of India have not yet issued orders to that effect. However, there is no post with the specific designation of *Drug Inspector* in the Department of Health in the Ministry in the Government of India. The Drug Controller of India is in the scale of Rs. 5900-6700 with the *Joint Drugs Controller* being in the scale of Rs. 4500-5700, the *Deputy Drugs Controller* in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000 and the *Assistant Drugs Controller* of India is in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500.



42

38.10.5 In view of the specific pay scale of the *Drug Inspector* in the Centre being the scale of Rs. 2000-3500 in the Central Drug Standard Organisation we also recommend that **Drug Inspectors** in Bihar will be in the scale of Rs. 6500-10500, against the existing scale of Rs. 1800-3330, **Senior Drug Inspectors** who are shown to be in the scale of Rs. 2000-3800 will ordinarily have been in the scale of Rs. 8000-13500. The rules framed in 1989 do not mention any post above that of the **Drug Inspector** and hence according to the principles adopted by us we are not recommending the higher scales, moreover rules framed are for the basic grade only and the pay scale is noted as Rs. 940-1660. The *Drug Controller* of India cannot really be compared with the **Drug Controller** in Bihar though we find that the latter post is in the scale of Rs. 4300-5550 i.e. the same as that of the **Professor** in the super time scale in the clinical and non-clinical side. We have pointed out that the *Deputy Drugs Controller* of the Central Drug Standard Organisation is in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000 and the *Director* of the Central Drugs Laboratories which supply reference standard of various drugs to drug manufacturers as well as organise training programmes on instrumental methods of analysis of drugs as also pharmacological and toxicological methods of testing them. Therefore, the **Drug Controller** will be in the scale of Rs. 14300-18300 and even if a doctor is posted there will be no problem in fitment.

#### Public Analyst

38.11.1 Shri Jitendra Kumar, Public Analyst in Food and Drug Laboratory, Agamkuan and Shri S. K. Poddar, Joint Food Controller, Bihar have submitted two representations to the Fitment Committee requesting for revised pay scales. The **Public Analyst** has pointed out that his existing pay scale is Rs. 2000-3800 with the recruitment qualification being M.Sc. in Chemistry/Bio-chemistry/Food Technology/Micro Biology with not less than 3 years experience in food analysis. The petitioner has pointed out that in Delhi Administration, the *Public Analyst* is in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500 with the *Deputy Public Analyst* being in the scale of Rs. 2000-3500 and in the Government of Tamil Nadu the *Public Analyst* is in the scale of Rs. 3000-



45

4500. In the Government of Bihar the **Assistant Public Analyst** is in the scale of Rs. 1800-3330, **Deputy Director cum Public Analyst (Food)** and the **Deputy Director cum Government Analyst (Drug)** are both in the pay scale of Rs. 3000-4500 and the **Director cum Public Analyst and Government Analyst** is in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000. The **Director cum Public Analyst cum Government Analyst** in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000 is getting a higher pay than either in Delhi Government or in Tamil Nadu. Therefore, in Bihar the **Public Analyst** is in the scale of Rs. 2000-3800, Rs. 3000-4500 and Rs. 3700-5000 and the Director is in fact in a higher scale than the *Public Analysts* elsewhere.

38.11.2           The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee had in paragraph 119 to 127 discussed the pay scales of various types of **Analysts** starting from the **Assistant Chemical Analyst**. The **Public Analyst** of the Public Health Laboratory, Muzaffarpur was a Post-graduate with a minimum of 5 years experience in Food Analysis and the **Public Analyst** was required to have a degree in Science with Chemistry or Bio-Chemistry or Food Technology or Food and Drug from an University with not less than 5 years experience and if he was a Post-graduate then 3 years experience was required.

38.11.3           The Director Health Services, Bihar, Patna has forwarded to us a list of posts in the Drug Control Organisation and also an extract from the Drugs and Cosmetic Rules, 1945 which mentions that the **Government Analyst** will have to be a graduate in Medicine or Science or Pharmacy or Pharmaceutical Chemistry with not less than 5 years Post-graduate experience in the testing of drugs in a Laboratory or is required to be Post-graduate degree holder with not less than 3 years experience. The **Government Analyst** is required to get analysed or tested such samples of drugs or cosmetics as may be sent by **Inspectors** or other persons and he should forward to the Government from time to time the result of analytical work and research with a view to their publication at the discretion of the Government. The pay scales of the posts in the **Public Analyst** side has not been provided. However, Shri S.K. Poddar, Joint Food Controller Bihar has



informed us that the **Senior Analyst (Food) /Assistant Chemical Analyst** is in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900 and is required to be a graduate in Chemistry with 3 years experience or a Post-graduate in Chemistry and the post of **Assistant Public Analyst** in the pay scale of Rs. 1800-3300 is a promotional post. The **Deputy Chemical Analyst/Public Analyst/Chemist** is required to have a qualification of **Public Analyst**. The other higher posts of **Deputy Director cum Public Analyst** and **Director cum Public Analyst cum Government Analyst** are promotion posts with the qualifications of a **Public Analyst** with 10 years experience as a **Public Analyst** for the **Deputy Director's** post and 15 years experience for the post of **Director**. According to Prevention of Food Adulteration Act, 1954 a **Public Analyst** for appointment is required to hold a Master's degree in Chemistry or Bio Chemistry or Food Technology or Microbiology or Food and Drugs from an University in India or is an Associate of the Institution of Chemists (India) with not less than three years experience. Those who are graduates in the concerned subject mentioned above are required to have 5 years experience after graduation in the analysis of food.

38.11.4 In the Central Drugs Laboratories which are three in number and to which we have referred to earlier while discussing the pay scale of *Drug Inspectors*, there are *Senior Scientific Assistants* in the scale of Rs. 6500-10500, *Junior Scientific Assistants* in the scale of Rs. 5000-8000, *Senior Technical Assistants* in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900, the *Technical Assistant* in the scale of Rs. 1400-2300, the *Senior Analyst* is in the scale of Rs. 2200-4000, the *Junior Analyst* is in the pay scale of Rs. 2000-3200, the *Chief Technical Officer* is in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500, the *Senior Chief Technical Officer* is in the scale of Rs. 3700-5000 and the *Director* is in the scale of Rs. 4500-5700. In the Central Food Research and Standardisation Laboratory, Ghaziabad, the *Technical Assistant* has been upgraded to the scale of Rs. 5000-8000 from Rs. 1400-2300 with the recruitment qualification being graduation in Chemistry for direct recruitment and 50% are through promotions from the *Senior Laboratory Assistants* in the scale of Rs. 1320-2040. The next promotion is in the grade of *Senior Scientific Assistant* and *Senior Technical Assistant* in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900.



38.11.5 The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission at paragraph 69.91 have recommended upgradation of *Technical Assistant* to the pay scale of Rs. 5000-8000 with the post of *Senior Scientific Assistant/Senior Technical Assistant* continuing in the same scale of Rs. 1640-2900 to be filled by promotion of *Technical Assistants* but *Junior Analysts* will now be in the scale of Rs. 6500-10500 and the *Senior Analysts* in the pay scale of Rs. 8000-13500. The recruitment qualification of *Junior Analysts* and *Senior Analysts* being Master's Degree in the subjects required for a *Public Analyst*.

38.11.6 Such posts of *Analysts* which are filled according to the prescribed qualifications laid down in the Prevention of Food Adulteration Act, 1954 or such statutory acts are only available in the Central Food Laboratory/Central Drugs Laboratory or the Central Food Research and Standardisation Laboratory. On the basis of the posts and pay scales available the **Assistant Chemical Analyst** will be in the scale of Rs. 5500-9000, the **Senior Scientific Assistant** and **Junior Analyst** will be in the scale of Rs. 5000-8000. The **Assistant Public Analyst** will be in the scale of Rs. 6500-10500 if he fulfils the recruitment qualification of the *Junior Analyst* in the Central Food Research and Standardisation Laboratory which is the same for a *Public Analyst*. If the recruitment qualification stands at B.Sc. in Chemistry with three years experience in Food Analysis then the revised scale for the post will be Rs. 5500-9000. **Public Analyst** now in the scale of Rs. 2000-3800 will be in the scale of Rs. 8000-13500 provided he fulfils the qualification laid down for *Senior Analysts* which is 5 years experience as *Junior Analyst* in the Gaziabad Laboratory. The pay scales of the **Deputy Director cum-Public Analyst** will then be the revised scale of Rs. 10000-15200 and that of the **Director cum-Public Analyst cum Government Analyst** will be the scale of Rs. 12000-16500 and the **Joint Food Controller** will be in the higher scale of Rs. 14300-18300, the same as the **Drug Controller**.



MANAGER, OFFSET PRESS

38.12.1 Mr. Nayyar Akhtar, Manager, Offset Press of the State Family Welfare Bureau has requested this Committee that he should be in the pay scale of Rs. 2400-4150 and the pay scale revised accordingly instead of on the basis of the existing scale of Rs. 2000-3800. He has cited that the higher scale is available to the **Deputy Superintendent** of the Government Printing Press, Gulzarbagh. There are a large number of posts in the State Family Welfare Bureau but since we are not clear what amount of printing work is done in this press, we are not able to equate the **Deputy Superintendent** of the Gulzarbagh Press with the Family Welfare Bureau Press. In the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission Report, paragraphs 55.205 to 55.229 have a lot of information on pay scales of various presses. The *Assistant Manager (Technical)* in the Letter Press of the Urban Affairs and Employment Ministry is in the scale of Rs. 2000-3500 and similar is the scale of the *Assistant Manager* in the Railway Press and other Presses. We have not been able to find in the list of posts or designations in various presses a post designated as **Manager** and hence we presume that the workload would not be such, that would require posting of an **Assistant Manager** in the Press of the State Family Welfare Bureau. Hence we do not recommend that the **Manager** should also get the scale of the *Manager* in the Government of India Presses. In most of the Government of India Presses the *Managers* are in the pay scale of Rs. 3000-4500 or in higher scales. But for reasons stated and discussed above it is not possible to fit the **Manager** of the State Family Welfare Bureau in a scale higher than Rs. 6500-10500. The revised scale of Mr. Nayyar Akhtar, **Manager**, Offset Press would be Rs. 6500-10500.



38.13.1 Shri Upendra Kumar Verma, State Demographer of the Health, Medical Education and Family Welfare Department, Patna has in his representation to the Fitment Committee requested for the revised scale of Rs. 12000-16500 against his existing scale of Rs. 2400-4150. His representation mentions that a **Demographer** was first appointed in 1971 in the scale of Rs. 730-1250 and right from the Third Pay Revision Committee onwards, the post has not been given the pay scale it deserves because not only the **Assistant Director**, Statistics in Kalazar but also **Statistical Officers** and **Senior Statistical Assistants** and other statistical functionaries are working under his direction and in the Government of India the post has been given the status of **Joint Director**. A letter of the Department of Family Welfare dated 27.9.1995 has been enclosed which mentions that the **Demographers** requested upgradation of the post of **Demographer** to the level of **Joint Director**. The 26<sup>th</sup> May, 1971 notification of the Bihar Gazette by which the Bihar Public Service Commission advertised the post mentions the necessary recruitment qualification as post-graduation in second class in Demography/Mathematics/Statistics with Economics, experience of at least five years in Demography and Census and training in Demography from the Institute in Bombay, Indian Statistical Institute, Calcutta or any other recognised Institution.

38.13.2 Among the posts in the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, we find that the *Medical Demonstrator* posted in All India Institute of Hygiene and Public Health, Calcutta with a MBBS qualification is in the pay scale of Rs. 2000-3200. Then there are *Non-Medical Demonstrators* in the same Institute with the minimum recruitment qualification of post-graduate and were in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission at paragraph 69.22 and 69.23 upgraded the scales to respectively Rs. 8000-13500 for *Medical Demonstrators* and to Rs. 6500-10500 for *Non-Medical Demonstrators*. We have been unable to find a post with the exact designation of **Demographer** but wherever in the Government of India the recruitment qualification is post-graduation with or without training, the scale recommended is generally Rs. 6500-10500. The representationist has not



indicated whether the post is available for promotion or not. But it may be presumed that in 1971 there was direct recruitment against the post and this would be continuing. If the post of **Demographer** is not a promotional post for the **Lecturer (Demography and Statistics)**, then the pay scale of Rs. 2400-4150 is by no means inadequate. We recommend the pay scale of Rs. 8000-13500 as the revised scale for the post of **Demographer** and this scale also happens to be replacement scale according to our recommendations.

### Physiotherapist & Occupational Therapist

38.14.1 The Bihar State Association of **Physiotherapists** and **Occupational Therapists** have represented through their President, Sri U. S. Prasad, that they should be recommended the scale of Rs.5500-9000 for their basic grade, Rs.6500-10500 for Grade II, Rs.7500-12000 for Grade I and the Chief Physiotherapist/Occupational Therapist should be in the scale of Rs.10000-15200. According to the representationist they are posted in Viklang Bhiawan Hospital, Medical College Hospitals, Leprosy Eradication Centres and T.B. Hospitals.

38.14.2 The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report have discussed the case of *Physiotherapists and Occupational Therapists* and in view of their qualification of 10+2 with a three year degree or diploma course and 6 months internship, with or without P.G. training, recommended the scale of Rs.5500-9000 against the pre-revised scale of Rs. 1400-2300. There is also an intervening scale of Rs. 6500-10500 for *Lecturers* in Physiotherapy and Occupational Therapy. The *Senior Physiotherapists/Senior Occupational Therapists* will be in the scale of Rs.8000-13500 against the existing scale of Rs.2375-3500. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission were of the view that educational qualifications and nature of duties of the *Physiotherapists and Occupational Therapists* are not comparable to those of M.B.B.S. and B.D.S. (Dental Surgeons). In Bihar the non-diploma holder **Physiotherapist** and the **Occupational Therapists** are in the scale of Rs. 1400-2300 while the diploma holder **Physiotherapist** is in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900. We recommend that



in future no **Physiotherapist** without a degree or diploma should be recruited. The present incumbents will only get the replacement scale of Rs.4500-7000. For the diploma holder **Physiotherapist** we recommend the revised scale of Rs. 5500-9000 and **Lecturers** or those in the pay scale of Rs. 2000-3800, will be in the revised scale of Rs. 6500-10500. If there are functional and duty posts of Senior Physiotherapist or Occupational Therapist in a scale higher than Rs. 2000-3800 and are in a grade above Lecturers then they will be entitled to the revised scale of Rs. 8000-13500. The Commission also recommended that a post of *Chief Physiotherapist* and *Chief Occupational Therapist* should be created in the scale of Rs.3000-4500. We are not recommending any scale for such posts because these posts do not exist in Bihar and fitment in a Central scale is not required.

#### ORTHOTICS & PROSTHETICS

38.15.1 The Orthotics and Prosthetics Association through Shri Vinod Bhanti have requested this Committee for revision in the pay scale of Orthotics and Prosthetics. The Orthotics and Prosthetics in the Patna Medical College Hospital are in the scale of Rs.1640-2900. The case of this cadre was discussed at Chapter 15, paragraph 145 and 146 of the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee's Report on the Health Department and also by the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee. After consideration of their case no change in their pay scale was recommended by the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended for technicians entering service in the Health Department with either a degree in Science or diploma in engineering, the pay scale of Rs.5000-8000. The training period for Orthotics and Prosthetics Engineering is three years and six months is the period of internship. According to the representationist there are only two posts of Orthotics and Prosthetics in Bihar, one in the Artificial Limb Centre at Vikalangi, Bhawan, Kankarbagh, Patna and the other in the Department of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation in the Patna Medical College Hospital. The existing pay scale is Rs.1640-2900 though we have not been able to



identify the post among the various posts in the Health Department. For this post we only recommend the replacement pay scale of Rs. 5500-9000. In the Jawaharlal Institute of Post-graduate Medical Education and Research both the *Orthotist* and the *Prosthetist* are in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900, the *Orthotic Technician* and the *Prosthetic Technician* are in the scale of Rs. 1400-2300 and the *Prosthetic Craftsman* and *Orthotic Craftsman* are respectively in the pay scales of Rs. 950-1400 and Rs. 950-1500.

#### Ophthalmic Assistant

38.16.1 National Ophthalmic Association of India have through Dr. S. P. Yadav, submitted a representation wherein it has been requested that revised pay scale of Rs. 6500-10500 should be recommended for **Ophthalmic Assistants**. The existing pay of **Ophthalmic Assistant** is Rs. 1400-2300. The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee and the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee have discussed the pay scale of the **Ophthalmic Assistant**. It has been mentioned in the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee report at paragraph 80, Chapter 18 that **Ophthalmic Assistants** are posted in Primary Health Centres and they cannot be considered at par with **Physiotherapists**. The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee at paragraph 13.51.1 have mentioned that **Ophthalmic Assistants** are required to possess a training in a 2 years diploma course after Intermediate in Science and **Physiotherapists** have to obtain a two year diploma or a 4 ½ year internship certificate after Intermediate in Science. According to the terms of reference of the Fitment Committee the posts would have to be fitted in the pay scales which are available in the Centre for employees doing the same work with similar responsibilities. The representationist have enclosed an advertisement which mentions that **Optometrists** will be in the pay scale of Rs. 6500-10500. The *Ophthalmic Assistant* in the Andaman and Nicobar Administration is in the scale of Rs. 1400-2300 and they match the existing scale of **Ophthalmic Assistants** in Bihar. Therefore, we recommend for the **Ophthalmic Assistant** the pay scale of Rs. 4500-7000 which is appropriate considering that the diploma course is only of two years duration and his job is required to assist



the Doctor. An *Optometrist* is not the same as an **Ophthalmic Assistant** and hence we cannot equate the two posts.

**SPEECH PATHOLOGIST AND AUDIOLOGIST**

38.17.1 Dr. Arvind Kumar Sharma, in his representation to the Fitment Committee has pointed out that he is a Speech Pathologist-cum-Audiologist in the Ear Nose and Throat Department of the Patna Medical College Hospital after having done a three years degree course in Speech Pathology and Audiology from the All India Institute of Speech and Hearing, Mysore University. This is a solitary post in the Government of Bihar and the petitioner has not mentioned any pay scale that should be recommended for him but has only mentioned that he should be given the salary of an **Associate Professor** or treated at par with **Physiotherapists and Occupational Therapists** as per the recommendation of all previous Pay Revision Committees. The pay scale of this post, as mentioned in Finance Department Resolution of 18.12.1989 is Rs. 1640-2900. The Fitment-cum-Pay Revision Committee and the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee did not discuss this post because apparently, no representation was submitted. But the problem in granting the pay scale of **Associate Professor** or being treated at par with **Physiotherapists and Occupational Therapists** is that this is a solitary post. The 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have discussed at paragraph 52.96 what the pay scales of *Physiotherapists and Occupational Therapists* should be and have recommended that there can only be a *Chief Physiotherapist* and *Chief Occupational Therapist* in the scale of Rs. 3000-4500. The *Associate Professor* is a senior teaching post and even in Bihar, the present pay scale of **Associate Professors** is Rs. 3700-5000, more than what has been recommended for the **Chief Physiotherapist and Chief Occupational Therapists** in the Centre. Hence comparison with the pay scale of **Associate Professor** perhaps has little relevance, it is another matter that those who studied with him are now **Associate Professors** in Physiotherapy and Occupational Therapy though whether in Bihar or outside has not been mentioned. Considering the educational qualification required for the post we do not find adequate reason for upgrading the scale beyond what is available



to Dr. Sharma. Hence the *Speech Pathologist and Audiologist* will be in the revised scale of Rs. 5500-9000. In the Jawaharlal Institute of Post-graduate Medical Education and Research (JIPMER) the *Speech Pathologist and Audiologist* is only in the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2600. Therefore, by recommending the replacement pay scale, we have adequately compensated for the long experience of Dr. Sharma. Secondly, in the Safdarjang Hospital there are *Senior Audiometry Technicians* in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900 and *Speech Therapists* in the same Hospital in the scale of Rs. 2000-3500. On that consideration also we have recommended the scale of Rs. 5500-9000 to the *Speech Pathologist and Audiologist*. As regards his request for a higher pay scale the matter would be considered when we submit our recommendations on Promotion Policy because Dr. Sharma, according to his representation, is working against the same post since 4.6.1976.

### Pharmacist

38.18.1           Diploma Pharmacists Association of Bihar, through their General Secretary, Shri Raghunath Sharan Singh and Bihar State Pharmacists Association through their General Secretary, Shri Indra Mohan Singh have submitted two representations requesting for, respectively, the pay scale of Rs. 4500-7000 and Rs. 5500-9000. It has been stated that the **Pharmacists** in the State Government are in the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2300 and their recruitment qualification is Diploma in Pharmacy after I.Sc. in Zoology. Shri Raghunath Sharan Singh has pointed out that the Central Government have sanctioned for the *Pharmacists* the four scales of Rs. 4500-7000, Rs. 5000-8000, Rs. 5500-9000 and Rs. 6500-10500. Shri Indra Mohan Singh has stated that in the Centre the *Pharmacists* have the scale of Rs. 5000-8000 as the basic grade, the *Chief Pharmacist* is in the scale of Rs. 5500-9000 and thereafter the *Head Pharmacist* is in the revised scale of Rs. 6500-10500. The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee which considered the pay scale of the *Pharmacists* at paragraph 96 of Chapter 15 had observed that according to the Regulation of 1981 issued by the Pharmacy Council of India, the duration of the training is two academic years and practical training of not less



than three months. "involving 375 hours devoted to actual dispensing of prescriptions". The existing scale of **Pharmacist** is Rs. 1400-2300 and the **Head Pharmacist** is in the scale of Rs. 1400-2600.

38.18.2 The 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission at paragraph 52.90 have recommended the scale of Rs. 4500-7000 for *Pharmacists* possessing entry qualification of Diploma in Pharmacy. It has also been recommended that those who do not possess a Diploma in Pharmacy may be given the replacement pay scale and posts of *Chief Pharmacist* in the scale of Rs. 2000-3500 should be created in Hospitals based on functional justification. In one of the representations, attention has been drawn to the recommendation of the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission Report at paragraph 63.291. *Pharmacists* in the Ministry of Defence are also in the revised scale of Rs. 4500-7000 and there are two promotional grades in the scales of Rs. 5000-8000 and Rs. 5500-9000 with the *Chief Pharmacist* being in the scale of Rs. 6500-10500. We recommend for the **Pharmacists** the pay scale of Rs. 4500-7000 provided the incumbents on the posts possess a diploma in pharmacy and the **Head Pharmacist** will be in the scale of Rs. 5000-8000. As we do not know on what functional justification the post of **Head Pharmacist** has been created, we are unable to equate the **Head Pharmacist** with the *Chief Pharmacist* in the Centre. In the note to the Committee, the Health Department has not furnished us any material regarding posts of **Pharmacists** nor do we know how many **Pharmacists** there are in this scale. Hence in absence of adequate information we are not in a position to recommend the pay scales for the posts that are available in the Ministry of Defence.

### Dieticians

38.19.1 Shri Girindra Mohan Kumar, General Secretary, Indian Dietetics Association, Bihar Chapter has submitted his representation to the Fitment Committee requesting that the **Dieticians** should be recommended the scale of Rs. 7450-11500 with the **Assistant Dieticians** being in the revised scale of Rs. 5500-9000. Higher scales have been requested for **Senior**



**Dieticians, Chief Dietician and Head Dietician** but we have not been able to find these posts among the list of posts in the Health Department. It has been pointed out that the **Dieticians** are required to be Science Graduates/M.B.B.S. with a Post-graduate Diploma in Dietetics and Public Health Nutrition from the All India Institute of Hygiene and Public Health. In Bihar the only post in this category that is mentioned in the Finance Department Resolution of 18.12.1989 is the post of **Dietician** in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900.

38.19.2 The 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission at paragraphs 52.48 to 52.54 have discussed in detail the pay scale of *Dieticians*. The Commission have in consideration of their minimum educational qualification at entry of B.Sc.(Home Science) with one year's Post-graduate Diploma in Dietetics and Nutrition and 3 months internship, recommended the entry scale for *Assistant Dietician* to be Rs. 1640-2900 against the existing scale of Rs. 1400-2300. For *Dieticians* to be redesignated as *Dieticians Grade II*, the revised scale recommended was Rs. 6500-10500, *Dietician Grade I / Senior Dietician* stand recommended the scale of Rs. 8000-13500 and the *Chief Dietician* with a Masters Degree in Dietetics and Nutrition should be filled by promotion and be in the scale Rs. 10000-15200. It has been observed at paragraph 52.53 in the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report that the Director General, Health Services has issued certain guidelines regarding staffing norms and on the basis of these norms wherever the number of beds and patients justify higher and larger number of posts, these should be created on functional requirements basis. The Commission went on to recommend that *Dieticians* should not be given non-practising allowance and if they are engaged in giving lectures, they should be paid honorarium as per rules prescribed for Central Government employees. The absence of a proper cadre structure in Bihar reflects a position where **Dieticians** are not playing an important role in patient care. There is a need to attend to this area because without proper scientific counselling on appropriate diet many diseases cannot be cured only through drugs.



### CARDIOGRAPHERS

38.20.1 The Director, Indira Gandhi Institute of Cardiology, Patna has requested this Committee that **Cardiographers** in the Institute are only getting the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2300 while the Physiotherapists are in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900 and has pointed out that **Physiotherapists** are required to undergo a two years' training after I.Sc. while the **Cardiographers** are required to be Science Graduates with six months training. He has requested for the **Cardiographers** the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900. The 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission at paragraph 52.108 have mentioned that posts like *Cardiography Technicians* are isolated categories and in pay scales ranging from Rs. 800-1150 to Rs. 1400-2300 and minimum educational qualification is usually a degree in Science, diploma in engineering or even matriculation with a few years of relevant experience when direct recruitment is made. In JIPMER, Pondicherry, *Cardiographic Technicians* are in the scale of Rs. 1320-2040. The 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission recommended at paragraph 52.111 that all *Technicians* entering service with either a degree in science or Diploma in Engineering will be in the scale of Rs. 5000-8000. In view of this recommendation and the fact that the Government of India have accepted this recommendation, the **Cardiographers** in the Indira Gandhi Institute of Cardiology at Patna will be in the revised scale of Rs. 5000-8000.

### Health Educator

38.21.1 The Bihar State Health Educators Association through their Acting Secretary, Shri Sushil Kumar Verma, Bihar Health Educators Association through Shri Ram Beehan Upadhyay, Patna - I and Shri Joginder Prasad Singh and one other Health Educator have submitted representations to the Fitment Committee requesting for the revised scale of Rs. 6500-10500. It has been pointed out that the **Health Educators** are graduates and they have been appointed on the recommendations of either the Bihar Public Service Commission or the Subordinate Services Selection Board based on



competitive examinations organised by them for graduate level candidates. It has been submitted that while Health Educators are in the existing scale of Rs. 1400-2300, candidates from the same graduate level examinations were appointed as Labour Extension Officer/ Gram Panchayat Supervisor/Cooperative Extension Officer, etc on existing scales of Rs. 1600-2750 or Rs. 1640-2900. The petitioners have drawn attention to Chapter 52, paragraph 52.101 wherein the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have noted that *Health Educators* along with other categories like *Senior Psychiatric Social Worker*, *Public Health Technician* and *Malaria Supervisors* are in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900.

38.21.2

We have examined the request of the memorialists and find that at paragraph 52.103, the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have recommended for *Medical Social Worker/Social Worker/Psychiatric Social Worker* with qualification of Post-graduation or at least graduation and two years' Diploma in Social Work, the scale of Rs. 1640-2900 at entry. While discussing the pay scales of posts in the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission at paragraph 69.76 has recommended for *Health Educators* in Regional STD Teaching, Training and Research Centre, Safdarjung Hospital the pay scale of Rs. 1600-2660 from the pre-revised scale of Rs. 1400-2300. In the same paragraph the Commission recommended the scale of Rs. 1600-2660 to bring it at par with other comparable posts and also close the gap to the next promotion post of *Health Education Officer* in the pay scale of Rs. 2000-3500. The Government of India accepted this recommendation. Accordingly, we recommend for the *Health Educators* in Bihar the scale of Rs. 5000-8000 because the higher scale of Rs. 1640-2900 is for posts with recruitment qualification of graduation with two years' Diploma in Social Work. The designation of Health Educator is available in the Health Department in three pay scales — Rs. 1200-1800, Rs. 1400-2600 and Rs. 1500-2750. While the Health Educator in the pay scale of Rs. 1200-1800 in the State Family Welfare Bureau will be fitted in the revised scale of Rs. 4000-6000 on the basis of the recommendation of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission at paragraph 69.25, the *Health Educators* in the Family Welfare Bureau and in the Leprosy Control Scheme, respectively, in the scale of Rs. 1500-2750 and



Rs. 1400-2600 will be fitted in the revised scale of Rs. 5000-8000 in line with the recommendations made at paragraph 69.76 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report.

## NURSES

38.22.1 The Bihar State Nurses Association, Patna Medical College Hospital, Patna-4, have represented to the Fitment Committee that **Nurses Grade A**, the lowest grade among the **Staff Nurses** should in no case be in a pay scale less than that granted to **Physiotherapist** and **Occupational Therapist**, etc. A detailed chart has been submitted through their General Secretary, Mrs. P. Lal, which mentions the recruitment qualification of **Nurses Grade A**, the duties and responsibilities in the two broad disciplines of the **Nurses** in the Clinical and Administrative as well as in the Training side. The following are the existing scales and the scales that have been requested for –

Sl. No.	Post	Existing Scale (in Rs.)	Scale Demanded (in Rs.)
1.	Nurses Grade A	1400-2300	5500-9000
2.	Nursing Sisters	1400-2600	6500-10500
3.	Assistant Matron/Junior Midwifery Tutor/Junior Sister Tutor/ Public Health Nurse/ Public Health Nurse Tutor / Psychiatric Nurses Sisters	1640-2900	7500-12000
4.	Senior Matron/Senior Midwife/ Senior Sister Tutor/Senior Public Health Nurse/Clinical Tutor, Nursing College, Ranchi/ Supdt., Lady Health Visitors Training School, Patna/ Lecturer, Nursing College, Ranchi/ Vice Principal, Nursing College, Ranchi/ Principal, Auxiliary Nurses Midwifery School.	1800-3330	8000-13500



5.	Principal Nursing College, Ranchi/State Nursing Superintendent	2000-3800	10000-15200
----	---	-----------	-------------

38.22.2 In addition, they have asked for Dress Allowance, Meal Allowance, Washing Allowance, Danger Allowance and requested that Transport Allowance should be sanctioned at the rates prevailing in the Centre and recruitment age should be raised to forty years. Dress Allowance is sought to be revised from Rs. 700 to Rs. 3500 per year, Meal Allowance from Rs. 200 to Rs. 750 per month, Washing Allowance from Rs. 50 to Rs. 300 per month, Danger Allowance at Central rates and Overtime Allowance at the rate of 20 per cent more than per hour emolument depending on the total salary in their own pay scale.

38.22.3 The Association has also requested the Committee that the **Trained Dais** should be in the scale of Rs. 2550-3200 against the existing pay scale of Rs. 775-1025, Rs. 5500-9000 for the **Lady Health Visitors** against the existing scale of Rs. 730-1080, Rs. 4000-6000 for **House Keepers** in the present scale of Rs. 1200-1800 and Rs. 4000-6000 for the **Auxiliary Nurse Midwives** who are in the scale of Rs. 1200-1800.

38.22.4 The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have discussed the pay scale of the *Nursing Services* stream as well as *Nursing Education stream* and *Public Health Nurses* from paragraph 52.56 to 52.73 of their Report. It has been pointed out that a Nurse's career in the *Hospital Nursing Service* begins as a *Staff Nurse* in the grade of Rs. 1400-2600 and the posts are filled by direct recruitment with qualification of 10 + 2 plus 3 years diploma in general nursing programme and registration as "Nurse and Midwife" with Central or State Nursing Council. In the Central Government Hospitals like Safdarjang, Ram Manohar Lohia and JIPMER there are 56 posts of *Non-resident Nurses* who work only for 6 hours without a break in the out-patient Department. The educational qualification of these *Non-resident Nurses* is the same as that of *Staff Nurses* but as the Administrative Ministry had advised the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission that as the cadre of *Non-resident Nurses* is a dying one and is being phased out, the Commission did not recommend upgradation of the



existing pay scale of Rs. 1200-1800 in view of the differences in the nature of duties.

38.22.5 All Colleges of Nursing Education prepare *Nurses* for the B.Sc. (Nursing) degree and higher courses and the *Clinical Instructor* is in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900 with the same qualification as those of *Staff Nurses* but with one year's experience in clinical nursing. The cadre structure in the Training side above the entry level is *Tutor*, *Senior Tutor*, *Lecturer* and *Senior Lecturer*. Except the *Senior Lecturers* who are in the scale of Rs. 2200-4000, the other three posts are in the scale of Rs. 2000-3200. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission did not recommend granting UGC pay scales to *Teaching Nurses* and recommended replacement pay scales.

38.22.6 For the *Auxiliary Nurse Midwives*, the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended that the pay scale should be revised from Rs. 975-1540 to Rs. 1200-2040 and recommended that this will reduce the gap between the *Lady Health Visitor* and the next level of *Public Health Nurses*. In the Centre, the *Female Health Workers* with Matriculation and Certificate Course of ANM or House Midwifery with registration in the Central or State Nursing Council will be in the scale of Rs. 975-1540 and the *Auxiliary Nurse Midwives* have been upgraded to the scale of Rs. 1200-2040. The *Lady Health Visitors* who are required to be matriculates with a certificate in Lady Health Visiting course in addition to having registration as *Auxiliary Nurse Midwife* will now be in the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2300 according to paragraph 52.72 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission's Report. The *Lady Health Visitors* are promoted as *Public Health Nurses* whose pay scale is Rs. 1640-2900. *Public Health Nurses* are also promotional posts for *Medical Social Workers* though now the revised scale for both the cadres is the same. Posts of *Community Health Officers* in the pay scale of Rs. 2200-4000 are also filled to the extent of 20 per cent by *Lady Health Visitors* and the rest 80% from the cadres of *Sanitary/ Food/ Material Inspectors*. The *Health Supervisor* is in the scale of Rs. 2000-3500.



38.22.7 The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have recommended in the nursing stream only upgradation in the pay scale of *Deputy Nursing Superintendent* from the existing scale of Rs. 2000-3500 to Rs. 2500-4000. Regarding allowances, the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended that Nursing Allowance should be increased from Rs. 150 to Rs. 300 per month for all nursing categories at all levels in Central Government Hospitals and Institutions, Special Allowance of Rs. 60 per month to Nurses working in Special Units like major operation theatres, ICU/CCU, Dialysis Unit/Ward, ICU for burns, Tetanus and Rabies Wards, Pediatric and Neo-natal units recommended to be increased to Rs. 120 per month subject to the condition that it shall not be granted to more than 25 percent of the total nursing strength. Uniform Allowance has been recommended to be revised from Rs. 125 per month to Rs. 3000 as a lumpsum annual amount and Washing Allowance recommended to be raised from Rs. 75 to Rs. 150 per month. The Commission also recommended that Special Allowance should not be granted to *Nurses* who are in the teaching stream but have recommended that Uniform and Washing Allowance should also be granted to Lady Health Visitors, Public Health Nurses and Auxiliary Nurse Midwives as has been recommended for Nursing Staff in General.

38.22.8 Director, Health Services, Government of Bihar has in a note informed the Fitment Committee that the nurses are required to undergo a three years nine months course in Nursing College, Ranchi after matriculation. It has also been submitted that the Nurses who have a degree of B.Sc. (Nursing) and those who have a diploma in Nursing education after matriculation in the College of Nursing should be treated at par and the same pay scale should be recommended because the period which they have spent in studying are the same. According to the note, the Sisters in Psychiatry, Cardiology, O.T., Neo-natal Lab and E.S.I. should be in a separate scale with two promotions in their service careers. The **Trained Dai** whose scale is Rs. 825-1200 is only required to be a Middle Pass or literate with six months training. The **House Keeper** is required only to be a matriculate and the **Female Health Worker** is required to be a matriculate with 18 months training in a Nursing School. The **Lady Health**



Visitors are required to undergo two years and six months training after matriculation. The Health Department have recommended that Staff Nurse 'A' Grade who have special qualification in selected disciplines like Nephrology, Gastro-enterology, Cardiology which requires one year's training should be placed in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900 and those nurses who do not have the qualification to become Grade 'A' Nurses with the requisite qualification should also be given the scale of Rs. 1640-2900 with two promotions. The Department has also submitted a copy of the Indian Nursing Council's guidelines circulated after a meeting held on 27.3.1985 and the Nurses Training, Recognition, Affiliation and Conduct of Examinations of School of Nursing Rules, 1997 which have become effective in Bihar from 1.1.1996. These rules lay down the qualifications required for Degree/Diploma in Nursing Education and Administration as well as examinations for Lady Health Visitor, Female Health Worker and Midwife, etc.

38.22.9 The pay scale of Staff Nurses and Nurses in the education stream in the Government of India are as follows:-

Sl.No.	Designation	Existing Scale (in Rs.)	Revised Pay Scale (in Rs.)
1.	Staff Nurse	1400-2600	5000-8000
2.	Nursing Sister/Clinical Instructor/ Junior Public Health Nurse/ School Health Nurse	1640-2900	5500-9000
3.	Assistant Nursing Superintendent/Sister Tutor/Senior Tutor/Senior Sister Tutor/ Nursing Supervisor/ Public Health Nursing Supervisor/ Tutor	2000-3200	6500-10500
4.	Lecturer in various Subjects	2000-3200	6500-10500
5.	Deputy Nursing Superintendent	2000-3200/ 2000-3500	7500-12000
6.	Nursing Superintendent/School Health	2200-4000	8000-13500



	<i>Nursing Officer/ Senior Lecturer in Nursing Administration/ Senior Lecturer in Nursing Education/ Senior Lecturers in other subjects</i>		
7.	<i>Chief Nursing Superintendent/ Chief Nursing Officer/ Director, Vice Principal and Professor Nursing, Rajkumari Amrit Kaur College of Nursing, Delhi</i>	<i>3000-4500/ 3000-5000</i>	<i>10000-15200</i>
8.	<i>Principal, Rajkumari Amrit Kaur College of Nursing, N. Delhi</i>	<i>3700-5000</i>	<i>12000-16500</i>
9.	<i>Chief Medical Officer</i>	<i>4500-5700</i>	<i>14300-18300</i>

38.22.10 As compared to the pay scales in the Centre the basic grade (Staff Nurse Grade B) is lower in Bihar but then there are more levels in this State. For example, in the Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Hospital, there are just three grades of *Staff Nurse, Nursing Sister* and *Assistant Nursing Superintendent/Sister Tutor/Senior Sister Tutor* whereas in Hospitals in Bihar there are *Staff Nurses (Grade 'B' and 'A'), Nursing Sister, Assistant Matron, Senior Matron, Junior Sister Tutor, Senior Sister Tutor* and *State Nursing Superintendents*. Therefore, it is clear that there are more levels in Bihar and secondly in the College of Nursing there are just two grades in Bihar of *Clinical Tutor* and *Lecturer* other than *Vice Principal* and *Principal* but in the Rajkumari Amrit Kaur College of Nursing at Delhi there are *Clinical Instructors, Tutor/Lecturer, Senior Lecturer, Professor of Nursing* and *Director* other than *Vice Principal* and *Principal*.

38.22.11 The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee discussed in detail the representation submitted by the Trained Nurses Association and having considered their pay scales in the Centre and in the State recommended that the *Staff Nurse Grade A* and *Nursing Sister* will get the replacement scale of the scales recommended by the Anomaly Removal Committee of 1985 but the Committee appreciated the difficult nature of the course prescribed for Nurses and the arduous duty that they have to perform.



Regarding the scales in the Rajendra Medical College Hospital, Ranchi for the Nursing teachers the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee considered it unable to recommend the scale of **Vice Principal** and **Principal** as available in the Rajkumari Amrit Kaur College of Nursing to similar posts in the Ranchi College because the State Nursing College at Ranchi was a fledgling, set up only in 1988 and had only six posts with one **Principal**, one **Vice Principal** and two each in the categories of **Lecturer** and **Clinical Tutor**. The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee also recommended at Chapter 15, paragraph 94 that the post of **Staff Nurse Grade A** should not be filled by promotion from such categories of personnel who have not completed the required three and half years training eligible criteria for the **Staff Nurse Grade A**. In the Centre there is no such category as **Staff Nurse Grade B** or **A** but only *Staff Nurses*. The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee also considered in detail the pay scale of the Nursing Services at paragraph 13.56.1 to 13.56.12 and had recommended no change in the pay scales.

38.22.12

We find from paragraph 13.56.3 that some of the **Lady Health Visitors** were appointed in the Welfare Department as **Lady Social Welfare Organisers** but in 1967 the Government retrenched them and only the Matriculate or more qualified were trained again as **Health Visitors** and absorbed as **Lady Health Visitors** in the Health Department. The **Lady Health Visitors** represented to the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee, of 1990 for a higher scale because these non-matric **Lady Social Welfare Organisers** had at some stage been re-admitted in Government Service and were now in the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2600 as against the **Lady Health Visitors** who are now in the scale of Rs. 1400-2300.

38.22.13

In view of the above discussion we recommend that no **Staff Nurse Grade A** will either be appointed or promoted or be designated as **Staff Nurse Grade A** if he or she does not have the required eligibility as prescribed by the Bihar Government. These **Staff Nurses** will be in the pay scale of Rs. 5000-8000 as in the Centre. Those who do not have the requisite qualification will neither be promoted in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900 as has been recommended by the Health Department, nor will be in the revised pay



641  
scale of Rs. 5000-8000 and instead they will draw replacement scales and be phased out through retirement. **Nursing Sisters** will be in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900 as in the Centre and the same scale will be available to **Clinical Instructor**, the first tier of teachers in the Nursing College at Ranchi. **Assistant Matron** and other categories in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900 as well as others in the higher scale of Rs. 1800-3330 like **Senior Matron**, **Senior Midwife**, **Senior Sister Tutor**, **Senior Public Health Nurse** will all be in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900 because that is structure is in the Centre. As there is probably no post of *Assistant Nursing Superintendent* or *Nursing Superintendent* in Bihar, that scale of Rs. 6500-10500 will be available to the **State Nursing Superintendent**. We find that there is no post of *Deputy Nursing Superintendent* in Bihar and hence the scale of Rs. 7500-12000 will not be available to the Nursing Service. There is also no post of *Chief Nursing Officer* in Bihar and hence the scale of Rs. 10000-15200 is also not recommended. We also do not find any post of *Non-resident Nurses* who only work in the Out Patient Departments in Central Government Hospitals.

38.22.14 The **Lecturers** in Nursing College of Ranchi will be in the scale of Rs. 6500-10500 provided the **Clinical Instructor** are in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900. The *Tutors* in Rajkumari Amrit Kaur College of Nursing as well as *Lecturer* and *Senior Tutors* are in the revised scale of Rs. 6500-10500. If more posts are created in the Training College for Nurses at Ranchi then the scale of *Vice - Principal* and *Principal* in the Rajkumari Amrit Kaur College of Nursing would be made available to the Nursing College at Ranchi. In the Rajkumari Amrit Kaur College of Nursing there are 20 *Clinical Instructors*, 10 *Tutors*, 104 *Group D posts*, 71 *Groups C posts*, 9 *Field posts of Group B* and 6 *Group A posts*. The higher scales of *Vice Principal* and *Principal* is justified for the Delhi based Rajkumari Amrit Kaur College of Nursing and since we have not been provided with the cadre strength of the Nursing College for Nurses at Ranchi, we are unable at this stage to recommend the higher pay scales. Hence we would only recommend for the **Vice Principal**, Nursing College, Ranchi the pay scale of Rs. 6500-10500 and for the **Principal** Nursing College, Ranchi the pay scale of Rs. 8000-13500.



38.22.15

In the Centre the Nursing course is of 3 years in General Nursing Programme after 10+2 and it is the same for the Nurses in Bihar and therefore, the basic grade needs to be upgraded from Rs. 1400-2300 to Rs. 5000-8000 only for trained Nurses Grade 'A' and not for Staff Nurse Grade 'B' who have only a two year training after matriculation. However, as has been pointed out at paragraph 52.58 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report a *Matron or Nursing Supervisor* in the pay scale of Rs. 6500-10500 is only for Hospitals which cater to bed strengths of about 500-600 and *Chief/Principal Nursing Officer* is only to be created if the bed strength in Hospital is from 750-1000. For Hospitals with less than 500 beds a *Matron or a Nursing Supervisor* need not be created and the higher pay scale given to Matrons in small Hospitals is not justified and we recommend that the Health Department should undertake this exercise before notifying the pay scales. As regards the allowances for Nurses we will be submitting our recommendations separately.

ARTIST CUM PHOTOGRAPHER

38.23.1

Shri Dayanand Gupta and Shri Bhagwan Das Prasad, Artists cum Photographer in the State Family Welfare Bureau as well as in the Offset Press of the same Bureau, respectively, have represented to the Fitment Committee that the revised pay scale should be recommended considering their existing pay scale to be Rs. 1500-2750. They have also submitted that after the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee, the Government notified on 30.12.81 in Finance Department Resolution No. 10770 the pay scale of Rs. 535-765 for the post but this was subsequently revised to Rs. 580-860 on the basis of the recommendations of the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee and thereafter on the basis of the ruling of the Bihar Administrative Tribunal, the Finance Department vide Letter No. 3/PRC-02-90/769 dated 22.2.1990 sanctioned from 1.4.1981 the pay scale of Rs. 850-1360 and again the Finance Department revised the scale to Rs. 1500-2750 from 1.1.86. This order of 1990 also mentions that the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee in their report of July 1989 at paragraphs 42 to 44 recommended for those Artists cum Photographer who have a five years diploma after matriculation, the



scale of Rs. 850-1360. We perused the recommendations of the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee and it has been stated therein that the **Artist** and **Photographer** in the Public Relations Department of the State Government are only required to be matriculates and no Institute in Patna provides diploma courses except possibly the diploma course in Photography in the Notre Dame Academy, a Public School in Patna.

38.23.2 The Bihar Administrative Tribunal in their judgment of 1.3.1988 recommended the replacement scale of Rs. 850-1360 for **Photographers** who are matriculates with a diploma in Commercial Art with experience of photography, silk screen painting and graphics and have at least two years of practical experience of art work and photography in a Government or some private firm of repute. In Chapter 16 while dealing with the pay scales of posts in the Human Resources Development Department the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee had recommended at paragraph 23 that **Drawing Teachers** who have undergone a five years diploma course will be entitled to the pay scale of Rs. 850-1360 and they should only be posted in High Schools.

38.23.3 In the Ministry of Information & Broadcasting of the Central Government, it has been recommended at paragraph 73.54 that **Photographers** will be in the pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000 and **Assistant Cameraman** will be in the pay scale of Rs. 5000-8000.

38.23.4 At Annexure 55.5 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission Report the *Artists cum Photographer* who are direct recruits with degree in Fine Arts and two years experience are in the scale of Rs. 5000-8000 and those *Photographers* who are matriculates with diploma in Photography and two years experience are in the pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000. While discussing the pay scales under common categories regarding the *Printing Staff* at paragraph 55.205 the *Cameraman* has been recommended the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2300 with the **Senior Cameraman** being in the pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900. The *Assistant Artist (Retouching)* in the Budget Press of the Ministry of Finance is in the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2300 as has been mentioned at



67

paragraph 55.221. Hence we do not consider it appropriate to grant to the **Artist cum Photographer** the pay scale of Rs. 5000-8000 because obviously he is not a graduate with a degree in Fine Arts and two years experience, the qualification required for a *Photographer* in that scale. **Artists** as well as **Cameraman** in the Press are in the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2300, which has been revised to Rs. 4500-7000. Therefore, the pay scale of **Artist cum Photographer** in the State Family Welfare Bureau will be Rs. 4500-7000.

Malaria Inspector

38.24.1 The Bihar State Malaria Employees Association through their General Secretary, Shri Vidyanand Vidyarthi and Bihar State Malaria Association represented by Sri Ramanuj Sharma have submitted their representations to the Fitment Committee. Shri Ramanuj Sharma has requested for the pay scale of Rs.5500-9000 for the **Malaria Inspectors**. An advertisement in newspapers dated 13.7.89 has also been submitted with the representation which mentions that the recruitment qualification is graduation in Science. The demand is based on the information that in the Centre posts with graduation in Science as the recruitment qualification have been recommended the scale of Rs.5000-8000 as per recommendation in paragraphs 51.34 and 52.111 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission Report. The Field Investigators in the National Tuberculosis Institute are recruited directly and the minimum qualification is graduation with 5 years experience as has been noted at paragraph 69.37 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report. The scale of Rs. 5000-8000 against the existing Rs. 1350-2200 has now been allowed to the Field Investigators. The *Investigator/ Team Leader* in the same organization has been recommended the scale of Rs.5500-9000. Even in the Railways according to the representationist, Sri Ramanuj Sharma, the *Malaria Inspectors* according to paragraph 83.28 have been recommended to be placed in the scale of Rs.5500-9000. The Health and Malaria Inspector Grade IV and Grade III have been recommended the revised scale of Rs.1640-2900 in the Railways on the basis that the recruitment qualification stands increased from Matriculation and Diploma to B.Sc. in Chemistry and diploma. However, we do not have with us the Government orders on this subject.



Drug Control Organization

DESIGNATION	PAY SCALE (in Rs.)
Laboratory Attendant	775-1025
Laboratory Boy	775-1025
Laboratory Assistant	975-1540
Technician	1320-2040

Malaria Eradication Programme

DESIGNATION	PAY SCALE (in Rs.)
Laboratory Technician	975-1540

Filaria Control Programme

DESIGNATION	PAY SCALE (in Rs.)
Laboratory Assistant (Technical)/ Assistant Laboratory Technician	975-1540

Cholera Control Scheme

DESIGNATION	PAY SCALE (in Rs.)
Laboratory Technician	1320-2040



### Laboratory Staff

38.26.1 The Bihar State Medical College and Hospitals and Public Health Laboratory Technologists Association through their Secretary, Shri Dharmendra Kumar and the All India Medical Laboratory Technologists Association through Shri Amarnath Sinha, State Secretary, have represented to the Fitment Committee for recommending the scale of Rs. 5000-8000 to the **Laboratory Technicians**, 5500-9000 to the **Laboratory Assistant or Senior Laboratory Assistant** and Rs.6500-10500 to the **Medical/Technical Officer or Laboratory Technician Grade I**. In addition, they have requested for allowances granted to Central Government employees.

38.26.2 The minimum recruitment qualification for **Laboratory Technician** that has been mentioned in the representation is I.Sc. with one year training/ diploma in DMLT.

38.26.3 The case of the **Laboratory Technicians** was discussed at length in the Fitment-cum-Pay Revision Committee's report in Chapter 15, in Paragraph 69 to 73. The **Laboratory Technicians** and the **Laboratory Assistants** are in various pay scales listed as below :-

DESIGNATION	PAY SCALE (in Rs.)
Laboratory Assistant	975-1540
Technical Assistant	975-1540
Laboratory Technician	1320-2040
Laboratory Assistant, Nalanda Medical College Hospital	975-1540



requested for the pay scale of 5000-8000 for the basic grade. They are now in the pay scale of Rs.1200-1800 and in the Patna Medical College Hospital the Assistant Sanitary Inspectors are in the scale of Rs.825-1200. According to the representationists, the **Sanitary Inspectors** are required to undergo a 3 months technical training in the All India Institute of Hygiene at Calcutta and their total training period is of 2 years 3 months because they are required to undergo a 3 months training in multi purpose scheme, 3 months training as Health Educator and subsequently a 3 months training as **Food Inspector**.

38.25.2 In the Central Government the posts of *Sanitary Inspectors* have been dealt with at paragraph 69.70 of the report of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission. It has been noted that *Sanitary Inspectors* in the organization of Port/Airport Health Organization having the educational qualification of matriculation with diploma are in the pay scale of Rs.1200-2040. 75% posts are filled by direct recruitment and the rest by promotion of *Insect Collectors*. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended a three grade structure for *Sanitary Inspectors* with the basic *Grade III* scale being Rs.1320-2040, *Grade II* in Rs.1400-2300 and *Grade I* in Rs.1600-2660. The Government of India have accepted this recommendation of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission in respect of *Sanitary Inspectors* posted in Port/Airport Health Organization. We endorse the recommendations of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission and accordingly **Sanitary Inspectors** in Bihar will be in three grades which are the pay scales of Rs. 4000-6000, Rs. 4500-7000 and Rs. 5000-8000. In Chapter 52 while dealing with Medical and Paramedical Services the pay scale of *Sanitary Inspectors* has been noted as Rs. 1200-2040 and they have been considered as Public and Social Health Workers. The basis of promotion from one grade to the next and the duties and responsibilities in each grade would have to be obtained from the concerned Central organization for implementation in the State. If the hierarchy is not found suitable for adoption in this State then the **Sanitary Inspectors** in Bihar will get the Central revised pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000.



subsequent to the acceptance of the Pay Commission's recommendation. As regards the claims of the petitioners that the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended for recruitment in the scale of Rs. 1600-2660 B.Sc. Graduates/Diploma holders in engineering, it is seen that in posts where recruitment of graduates in science takes place against various scientific posts in Government of India, the pay scales vary from Rs. 1200-1800 to Rs. 1640-2900. The *Malaria Inspectors* are not having any training/diploma in addition to their qualification of graduation in science.

38.24.2 **Malaria Inspectors** now in the scale of Rs. 1320-2040 will be entitled to the scale of Rs. 4000-6000 like other **Public and Social Health Workers**. The *Malaria Supervisor* in the Centre according to the information at paragraph 52.101 are in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900 and obviously this scale has been given to them according to the higher qualification laid down. Paragraph 69.84 of the report of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission mentions that the two posts of *Malaria Supervisors* are filled 50% by promotion of *Research Assistants* (graduates in Science) with 5 years service and 50% by direct recruitment of candidates having M.Sc. (Zoology) with entomology as the minimum qualification. But **Malaria Inspectors** are available in the National Malaria Eradication Programme and are in the pay scale of Rs. 1200-2040. These posts of *Malaria Inspectors* are filled by promotion of *Laboratory Assistants* or *Junior Technicians* with 5 years service and possessing a certificate in the Health Inspectors Course, failing which by *Insect Collectors* with 8 years service and the necessary qualifications. Hence as in the Centre the **Malaria Inspectors** in Bihar will be in the revised scale of Rs. 4000-6000 for reasons discussed above.

### SANITARY INSPECTOR

38.25.1. The Bihar State Sanitary Inspectors Association have submitted two memoranda to the Fitment Committee one through Onprakash, General Secretary, and the other also through the same person but received after the due date of 06.02.98. The **Sanitary Inspectors Association** have



Public Health Institute

DESIGNATION	PAY SCALE (in Rs.)
Chief Laboratory Attendant	800-1150
Laboratory Technician	975-1540
Chief Laboratory Technician	1200-1800
Head Laboratory Assistant	1400-2600

Arogyashala, Kanke

DESIGNATION	PAY SCALE (in Rs.)
Laboratory Technician	1320-2040
E.C.G. Technician	1320-2040



Field Establishment

Designation	Pay Scale (in Rs.)
Operation Theatre Attendant	775-1025
Sr. Head Ward Attendant/Head Laboratory Attendant	800-1150
Health Worker (Trained)	975-1540
Health Worker (Untrained)	950-1400
Laboratory Assistant, SKM College	1200-1800
Head Laboratory Assistant	1200-1800
Dental Technician	1320-2040
Laboratory Tech., Dental	1320-2040

38.26.4 The case of the *Laboratory Technicians* has been discussed at Paragraph 55.149 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission's Report. Accordingly, the Government of India has allowed *Laboratory Technicians* in the pay scale of Rs.1320-2040, the scale of Rs.4500-7000, which, in fact, is an upgradation. This upgradation has been allowed because it has been mentioned at paragraph 55.144 that *Laboratory Technicians* recruited with qualification of 10+2 with Science, B.Sc. or Diploma in Engineering and/or other subject matter Diploma (including DMLT) are largely entrants in the pay scale of Rs.1320-2040 though a fairly large number are also in the scale of Rs.1400-2300. The 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission recommended that **Laboratory Assistants** in the pay scale of Rs.950-1500 who entered Government service with Matriculation with Science and Certificate/ Diploma in Laboratory Technique including DMLT or 10+2 with Science should get the normal replacement scale of Rs.3050-4590. For the *Laboratory Attendants* the minimum recruitment qualification prescribed is schooling till 8<sup>th</sup> standard. Total direct recruitment has been prescribed in the scale of Rs.750-940. *Laboratory Assistants* in the scale of Rs.1600-2660 who are having Graduation in Science and Diploma/Certificate were recommended the scale of Rs.5000-8000 subject to at least 50% of the posts being filled by direct



direct recruitment. **Laboratory Technicians** in Bihar are not required to be graduates. Hence they cannot be given the scale of Rs. 5000-8000 as has been requested for. All **Laboratory Technicians** in the Health Department or in other Departments will be entitled to the scale of Rs.4500-7000 provided their present pay scale is Rs.1320-2040 or Rs. 1400-2300 subject to the conditions stated in paragraph 55.144 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report referred to earlier. The system of selection grades as prevailing now in Bihar is not available to Central Government employees and the State Government employees also cannot claim them now. All such *Laboratory Attendants* and *Laboratory Boys* in the scale of Rs.775-1025 will now be in the scale of Rs.2550-3200. *Chief Laboratory Attendants* or *Head Laboratory Attendants* in the scale of Rs.800-1150 will now be in the scale of Rs.2650-4000. At Paragraph 55.144, the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission has observed that most employees in the scale of Rs. 800-1150 have educational qualification of Middle/8<sup>th</sup> Standard/High School/Matric with one year Laboratory Attendant Course or experience of laboratory work. On this basis, the higher scale of Rs.2650-4000 is appropriate. **Laboratory Assistants** or **Laboratory (untrained) Technicians** or **Lab. Technicians** in the scale of Rs.975-1540 will be entitled to the revised scale of Rs.3050-4590. To reduce the multiplicity of scales those in Rs.1200-1800 will get the replacement scale of Rs.4000-6000 provided they have the requisite educational qualification including diploma or DMLT. Such of these **Chief Laboratory Technicians** or **Head Laboratory Assistants** in the scale of Rs.1400-2600 will have to be adjusted in the scale of Rs.5000-8000 provided they have been recruited on the basis of graduation in science with diploma or certificate.

38.26.5            The State Government is requested to devise promotional opportunities for **Laboratory Technicians** in the light of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommendations at paragraph 55.149 but of course after ascertaining that these have been accepted by the Government of India.



### Laboratory Technician

38.27.1 Shri Asharfi Sahu, Secretary, Bihar State Non-gazetted Employees Federation, Begusarai Branch representing the State Ayodhya Shiv Kumari Ayurvedic Medical College, Begusarai has represented that the **Laboratory Technician** in the College are in the scale of Rs. 975-1540 whereas they should be in the scale of Rs. 1200-2040 and fitted in the revised Central scale of Rs. 4000-6000. It has been mentioned that the recruitment qualification is Intermediate in Science and the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee only allowed the **Laboratory Technician** of the College the pay scale of Rs. 535-765 instead of Rs. 680-965. We find mention in the list of posts under the Directorate of Indigenous System of Medicines, **Laboratory and Technical Assistants** in the pay scale of Rs. 975-1540 and **Laboratory Technicians** are in the scale of Rs. 1320-2040. The recruitment qualification does not mention any training whereas in the Central Government *Laboratory Technician/Laboratory Assistants* are required to have certificate/diploma in Laboratory (including DMLT). Hence **Laboratory Technicians/Laboratory Assistant** who do not have any certificate or diploma with matriculation or 10 + 2 with Science, will be in the pay scale of Rs. 950-1500 and only such of the **Laboratory Technicians** who are having a diploma (DMLT) or a certificate will be entitled to a higher scale.

38.28.2 We have discussed the pay scales of **Laboratory Assistants** at paragraph 25.5 of Volume II, Part II of our Report and recommendations therein will cover the pay scales of **Laboratory Technicians** in the Ayurvedic College at Begusarai.

STORE KEEPER, GOVERNMENT AYURVEDIC COLLEGE HOSPITAL, PATNA

38.29.1 Dr. Om Prakash Sinha, Medical Officer (Vaidya), incharge of Stores, Government Ayurvedic Hospital, Patna has in his



representation to the Fitment Committee requested for the revised pay scale that has been allowed by the Government of India to *Ayurvedic Medical Officers*. It appears that Dr. O.P.Sinha had at some stage been absorbed in the cadre of **Ayurvedic Medical Officers** and according to the copy of the pay slip issued to him on 9.4.1997, his basic pay is shown as Rs. 2300. The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee considered the pay scale of the **Store Keeper**, Ayurvedic College, Patna at paragraph 13.2.1 and Dr. O.P. Sinha had also submitted a representation to that Committee pointing out that the nature of duties and responsibilities of the post were similar to the **Medical Officer (Stores)** of the Patna Medical College Hospital. He also informed that Committee in 1990 that the Health Department in its Letter No. 311 dated 9.7.1990 informed the Member Secretary of the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee that the minimum recruitment qualification of the post of **Store Keeper** is Ayurved Shastri. The Department considered the recruitment qualification of Ayurved Shastri to be no less than that of the Ayurved graduates and requested that the designation of **Store Keeper** should be changed to **Medical Stores Officer**. The Letter of 9.7.1990 also mentions that Dr. O.P. Sinha is a GAMS and has the requisite qualification for being appointed as an **Ayurvedic Doctor**. When the posts of **Ayurvedic Doctors** were declared gazetted in 1978-79 this post was inadvertently not included. The Fitment-cum-Pay Revision Committee recommended that the post of **Store Keeper** should be rotated amongst the available doctors and posting of one doctor permanently against the post will lead to stagnation and denial of avenues of promotion to the incumbent. In its report in 1989, the Fitment-cum-Pay Revision Committee observed as follows "*in view of special requirements of the job which include knowledge of the properties of various herbs and plants and the method of their preservation, the Committee feels that the Government may consider assigning an appropriate designation reflecting the above instead of the present nomenclature*".

38.29.2

It appears that Dr. O.P.Sinha was appointed as a **Store Keeper** in Class III and in course of his service acquired a Degree/Diploma of GAMS. We are not sure whether the GAMS is a degree recognised by the Central Government as well as the Bihar Government for appointment as an



**Ayurvedic Doctor.** Even if it is a required eligibility qualification for appointment as an **Ayurvedic Doctor**, a person appointed as **Store Keeper** should not be considered to be equivalent to a doctor though the Department of Health has included his name in the seniority list of **Ayurvedic Doctors**. We have ascertained that Dr. O.P. Sinha moved a writ petition and thereafter a contempt petition as well though the details have not been furnished by him. Hence we are unable to recommend that the **Store Keeper** in the Directorate of Indigenous System of Medicines will be in the pay scale of the basic grade of **Ayurvedic Doctors**. We have recommended for the **Store Keepers** revised pay scales in paragraph 23.9.5, Volume II, Part II of our Report and the pay scale of Dr. O.P. Sinha, **Store Keeper** will accordingly be governed by this recommendation. The **Store Keeper** in the Ayurvedic Hospital will be in the revised pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000 as we have recommended at paragraph 23.9.5. If Dr. O.P. Sinha is an Ayurved doctor and finds a place in the seniority list of Ayurvedic doctors, it is another matter.

#### Compounder under the Indigenous System of Medicines

38.30.1           The Principal, State Ayodhya Shivkumari Ayurvedic College, Begusarai has enclosed a representation of five Senior Compounders and Compounders of the same Begusarai College and has requested this Committee for recommending the same pay scale to **Compounders** as **Pharmacists** in the allopathy stream. The Bihar State Indigenous Medical Compounders Association (Ayurvedic, Unani and Homeopathy) through their General Secretary, Shri Prabhakar Pathak, have also submitted a representation requesting that those Compounders (Pharmacy) who have completed their training should be given the same pay scale as **Pharmacists** in the allopathy stream and those **Compounders** who are still under training should be given an opportunity to complete their training within a fixed time frame.

38.30.2           The pay scale of **Compounders** in the Indigenous System of Medicines was discussed in the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee Report at paragraph 13.3.1 and 13.4.1 and also in the Fitment cum Pay



Revision Committee's Report at paragraph 16, Chapter 15. The pay scale of **Compounder** in Homeopathy, Ayurvedic and Unani systems is now Rs. 975-1540. **Pharmacists** in the allopathic stream are in the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2300. It has been pointed out in the representation that the 3<sup>rd</sup> Pay Revision Committee recommended for qualified **Pharmacists** the pay scale of Rs. 240-390 and **Matriculate or Non-matriculate Compounders** without training in Pharmacy School were recommended a pay scale of Rs. 220-315. According to the representation of the **Principal, Begusarai Ayurvedic College**, there was only a difference of one scale between the pay scales of **Trained** and **Un-trained Compounders**. But between the pay scale of Rs. 220-315 and Rs. 240-390 there were the scales of Rs. 230-340, Rs. 244-356 and Rs. 284-372. Hence, to that extent the Association is not correct in stating that the pay scale of **Non-trained Compounders** was just one scale below the **Trained Pharmacists**. The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee noted that the **Homeopathy Compounders** were able to show an advertisement of 1974 to the 1980s Anomaly Removal Committee requiring **Compounders** to be matriculates with two years experience but it was on 4.7.1983 that the Health Department raised the qualification of **Ayurvedic and Unani Compounders** to matriculation. Hence the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee had recommended for the **Homeopathy Compounders** the pay scale of Rs. 535-705 and for the **Ayurvedic and Unani Compounders** the pay scale recommended was Rs. 480-680. The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee has at paragraph 15.07.5 posed certain issues before the Health Department so that a decision could be taken for upgrading the pay scale of **Ayurvedic and Unani Compounders**. Even now this problem remains to be resolved inspite of the fact that the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee and the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee of 1990 had recommended that all **Compounders** in the three Indigenous System of Medicines should be in the same pay scale. In the representation forwarded by the **Principal of the Begusarai College**, out of the 5 **Senior Compounders/Compounders**, 3 are still undergoing training while two have been trained and they are, respectively, in the pay scales of Rs. 1200-1800 and Rs. 1320-2040. Granting one scale to the **Compounders** in the Indigenous System of Medicines or even raising their pay scale up to the level of **Pharmacists** or just one below, would mean that an unattended benefit



will be given to unqualified personnel already in service and whether **Compounders** should be directly recruited from qualified candidates only instead of treating the post as a promotional one for Class IV employees or other employees in lower scales than **Compounders** is one issue that requires to be settled.

38.30.3

In the Andaman & Nicobar Administration, Directorate of Health Services, *Pharmacist* and *Homeo-Pharmacists* are in the same scale of Rs. 1200-2040. Posts of *Untrained Compounders* are not available in the Government of India. At paragraph 104.30, the 5th Pay Commission had noted that *Veterinary Compounders* in charge of sub-dispensaries and first-aid cells with the minimum qualification of matriculation along with two years certificate course and one years experience will be in the scale of Rs.4000-6000. The *Senior Veterinary Compounders*, a promotional post for *Veterinary Compounders* were upgraded from the scale of Rs. 950-1400 to Rs. 4500-7000. The *Compounders* in the Indigenous System of Medicines cannot be compared to even *Veterinary Compounders* because their training is only a two-years course and that too they are undergoing training after entering service. The *Pharmacist*, according to information available at paragraph 52.85 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report are required to have a 10 + 2 certificate with 2 years diploma and 3 months training in pharmacy along with registration with the Central or State Pharmacy Council. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have recommended for the *Pharmacist* the higher scale of Rs. 4500-7000 at entry point and have recommended that those *Pharmacists* who do not possess a diploma in pharmacy will continue in the replacement pay scale and in future no recruitment should be made in this cadre with qualification of less than a diploma. According to this recommendation the training that is being undertaken by the **Compounders** in the Indigenous System of Medicines is not equivalent to a Diploma, and hence we are unable to recommend for the **Pharmacist / Compounders** the same pay scale whether in allopathic stream or in the three Indigenous System of Medicines. In the Andaman & Nicobar Administration there is no difference in the pay scale of *Homeopathy Pharmacist* as well as a regular *Pharmacist*, but the **Homeopathy Pharmacists** in Bihar are only called **Compounders**, thus implying that they



do not have a regular diploma but only a matriculation certificate with at least a two years experience / training. The pay scale allowed to matriculates with one year certificate, according to the broad classification adopted by the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission at paragraph 51.34, is the scale of Rs. 950-1500. Therefore, we are unable to recommend any scale beyond Rs. 3050-4590 for the **Compounders** in the Directorate of Indigenous System of Medicines.

#### E.C.G. / E.E.G. / X - Ray Technicians

38.31.1 **E.C.G. Technicians** in P.M.C.H., Bihar Association, Shri Sarmad Ali and Barun Sahi and **C.T. Scan Technicians** have represented to this Committee for revised scales of pay. The existing scales and demands are tabulated below :-

Post	Existing scale (in Rs.)	Demanded Scale (in Rs.)
E.C.G. Technician, PMCH	1400-2600	5000-8000
E.E.G. Technician, Kanke Mental Hospital	1400-2300	
Cardiographer, Indira Gandhi Institute of Cardiology	1400-2300	
Deep X-ray Technician/ X-ray Technician	1400-2300	
Radiographer	1400-2300	5500-9000
Senior Radiographer	1400-2600	6000-9800
Radiographer in Senior Selection Grade	1500-2750	6500-10,500
C.T. Scan Technician, P.M.C.H., Patna	1400-2300	5500-9000

38.31.2 The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission in their report on *Radiographer/X-Ray Staff* and other technicians at paragraphs 52.107 and 52.117 have recommended that *Radiographers* requiring a minimum of 2



years diploma/certificate after 10+2 may be placed in the scale of Rs. 1320-2040. *Radiography Technicians* and *Senior Radiographers* should be in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900 as these are promotion posts. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission noted that there are various pay scales for *Radiographers* and *X-ray staff*. *Radiographers* in the scale of Rs. 1350-2200 are recruited 20% by direct recruitment with Matric and a 2 years diploma course in Radiography and 80% posts are filled by promotion from *X-Ray Assistants* in the scale of Rs. 1200-2040. Those *Radiographers* in the scale of Rs. 1350-2200 have been upgraded to the scale of Rs. 1600-2660, which stands revised to Rs. 5000-8000. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission has recommended that entry level qualification of *Assistant Radiographers* will have to be at least 10+2 with Science, besides a certificate in radiography and the admissible scale will then be Rs. 950-1500, now revised to Rs. 3050-4590.

38.31.3 *E.C.G. Technicians* in the Centre are either in the scale of Rs. 1200-2040 or Rs. 1320-2040. Many are only matriculates with experience while others are having diploma in engineering or B.Sc. Degree. *C.T. Scan Technicians* having either a Degree in Science or Diploma in Engineering have been allowed the scale of Rs. 5000-8000. Accordingly we recommend for the *C.T. Scan Technician* the scale of Rs. 5000-8000 as it has been mentioned that in Bihar there is no provision for training in C.T. Scan and wherever such training is available candidates have to be graduates in science. For the *E.C.G. Technicians* who are recruited on the basis of recruitment qualification being diploma in engineering or degree in science, we recommend the scale of Rs. 5000-8000, in line with the recommendations of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission and acceptance thereof by the Government of India. Those *Technicians* (*E.C.G. / E.E.G. / others*) recruited on the basis of matriculation with some experience as minimum qualification for direct recruitment will be in the revised scale of Rs. 4000-6000. However, in future we recommend that *E.E.G.* and *E.C.G. Technicians* should have at least graduation in science or diploma in engineering as the recruitment qualification. For the *Radiographers/ Deep X-ray Technician/ X-ray Technician* who are in the scale of Rs. 1400-2300 we recommend the scale of Rs. 4500-7000 as that is the revised scale in the Centre. If the recruitment



qualification is I.Sc. with one year training then we cannot recommend the pay scale of Rs. 5000-8000. The Senior Radiographers will then be in the scale of Rs. 5090-8000. The State Government should in future follow the recommendations laid down by the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission and we recommend that future recruitment of Radiographers should be in the scale of Rs. 4000-6000 from candidates who are 10+2 with science and having 2 years diploma or certificate and Assistant Radiographers will be recruited in the scale of Rs. 3050-4590 from candidates who have 10+2 with Science and a certificate in radiography.

#### DARK ROOM ASSISTANT

38.32.1 The Dark Rook Assistant (Matriculate) of the Shri Krishna Medical College Hospital, Muzaffarpur has in an unsigned representation requested for the Central revised scale of Rs. 4000-6000. In the Finance Department Resolution of 18.12.1989, the Dark Room Assistant is shown in the pay scale of Rs. 800-1150 and we do not know whether these Dark Room Assistants are Matriculates or non-Matriculates. The 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have discussed the pay scale of Radiographers and other staff at paragraph 52.105. Dark Room Attendants have the existing pay scale of Rs. 800-1150 and Dark Rook Assistants when recruited 100 per cent directly with qualification of matriculation with certificate in Radiography then they are in the pay scale of Rs. 950-1500, now revised to Rs. 3050-4590. In view of the lack of information, we are unable to recommend the revised pay scale of Rs. 950-1500 to these Dark Room Assistants. The Health Department have not informed us about the recruitment qualification of these Dark Room Assistants, the number of posts in each College, the promotion channels and the pay scales of the promotional posts and hence we are only recommending replacement scale of Rs. 2650-4000 till the Department is in a position to lay down appropriate recruitment rules which match the recommendations of the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission at paragraph 52.107.



Leprosy Wing

38.33.1 Bihar State Leprosy Control Technical Employees Association through their Secretary, Shri Bhola Sharan and Shri Bhubneswar Prasad Singh, Convenor of the District Unit of Muzaffarpur of the same Association have submitted to the Fitment Committee that the Non-medical Assistant, Health Educator, Medical Social Workers and Work Doctors are engaged in training those who are affected by leprosy. The Association has pointed out that there is a social stigma attached to leprosy and though the programme of leprosy control was first started in 1955, this became a National Programme only from 1983 onwards. It has been requested that **Non-medical Assistants** be recommended the scale of Rs. 5000-8000 against the existing scale of Rs. 1400-2300, the scale of Rs. 6500-10500 for the **Medical Social Worker** now in the scale of Rs. 1400-2600. No specific recommendation has been made for the posts of Health Educator or Health Assistant or Assistant Health Officer working in the Leprosy Control Scheme.

38.33.2 The existing scales of these posts are as follows :-

Sl.No.	Post	Existing Scale (in Rs.)
1.	Vaccinator	825-1200
2.	BCG Vaccinator	825-1200
3.	Health Assistant	950-1400
4.	Spl. Vaccination Inspector	1200-1800
5.	Statistical Clerk	1200-1800
6.	Non-Medical Assistant	1400-2300
7.	Medical Social Workers	1400-2600
8.	Health Educator	1400-2600
9.	Assistant Health Officer	1500-2750



38.33.3 We have with us the list of posts with pay scales under the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare but posts under the Regional Leprosy Training and Research Institutes do not match the posts mentioned above. For example, instead of **Non-medical Assistants** we have the post of *Non-medical Supervisors* in the scale of Rs. 4500-7000 and also in Rs. 4000-6000, instead of **Health Assistants** there is the post of *Health Visitor* in the scale of Rs. 4000-6000, instead of **Health Educator** in the scale of Rs. 1400-2600, there are *Health Educators* in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900, instead of **Statistical Clerk** in Rs. 1200-1800, there is the post of *Computer (common category EDP staff)* now in Rs. 4000-6000, instead of **Medical Social Worker**, there is the *Para Medical Worker* in the scale of Rs. 975-1540 and finally instead of **Assistant Health Officer**, there is the *Medical Officer* in the pay scale of Rs. 2200-4000. It has been stated in Chapter 69 that *Non-medical Demonstrators* are required to be Post-graduates and were in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900 but the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission recommended for them the scale of Rs. 6500-10500 at paragraph 69.23. *Health Assistants* are in the scale of Rs. 1320-2040 but the recruitment qualification has not been specifically mentioned at paragraph 69.25. Similarly, *Medical Social Workers* who are having qualification of post-graduation or at least graduation with 2 years Diploma in Social work have been recommended the scale of Rs. 1640-2900 at paragraph 52.103. Obviously the **Medical Social Workers** in the Government of Bihar are not having this qualification and hence they cannot be recommended the scale of Rs. 1640-2900. The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee has discussed the pay scales of **Non-medical Assistants** and **Medical Social Worker** at paragraph 13.81, and have noted at paragraph 13.81.1 that some **Extension Educators** might have been promoted as **Non-medical Assistants** but actually these are post in two separate establishments and the post of **Non-medical Assistant** in Leprosy Control cannot be a promotional post for **Extension Educators** in State Family Welfare Bureau. However, there is no reference to the recruitment qualification of the two posts or whether these posts are filled by promotion or by direct recruitment. Be as it may, we are unable at this stage to recommend for the **Non-medical Assistants** a scale higher than Rs. 4500-7000 and for the **Medical Social Workers** a scale higher than that of Rs. 5000-8000 which would place the



latter at par with the Health Educator. The Health Assistant and the Assistant Health Officer will get replacement pay scales because further details regarding the nature of their work and recruitment qualifications are not available with us.

#### Non - Medical Assistant

38.34.1 The Bihar State Trained Para-medical (Non-medical) Assistants Association, Patna have represented to the Fitment Committee through their General Secretary, Shri Arun Kumar, that the **Non-medical Assistants** in the Centre are, in the pay scale of Rs. 4500-7000 and that scale should be recommended as **Non-medical Assistants** under the National Leprosy Eradication Programme are required to be Intermediates with training in eradication/control of leprosy. It has been pointed out that the **Non-medical Assistants** recruited between the years 1985 to 1987 are in the scale of Rs. 1400-2300 but the **Para-Medical Workers (Non-Medical Assistants)** are getting a consolidated amount of only Rs. 3000 per month and hence they have requested for equal pay for equal work.

38.34.2 It is not clear in which context it is being stated that the **Para-medical (Non-medical) Assistants** are only getting a consolidated amount of Rs. 3000 per month. In case their service condition stipulates that they will only be getting a consolidated amount, **Non-medical Assistants** in the Leprosy Control Scheme cannot get the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2300 as has been specified in Finance Department Resolution No. 6021 dated 18.12.1989. Under the Central Government there are a large number of posts under the Regional Leprosy Training & Research Institutes. Among the posts there is no post with the specific designation of **Para-medical Assistant**. However, there are the following posts with the scales shown against them :-



Sl.No.	Posts	Existing Scale (in Rs.)	Revised Scale (in Rs.)
1.	Health Educator	1640-2900	5500-9000
2.	Health Educator	1600-2660	5000-8000
3.	Health Visitor (Sr.)	1400-2300	4500-7000
4.	Non-Medical Supervisor	1350-2200	4500-7000
5.	Non-Medical Supervisor	1200-2040	4000-6000
6.	Health Visitor/ Health Visitor (Jr.) N.M.S.	1200-2040	4000-6000

38.34.3 It is not known on what basis the Association is claiming the scale of Rs. 4500-7000 for **Non-medical Assistant** because a post of that designation is not available in the Regional Leprosy Training & Research Institutes. Perhaps the Association has staked its claim on the basis of the scale of *Non-medical Supervisors/Health Visitors (Sr.)* who are in the scale of Rs. 4500-7000. Even under the Andaman & Nicobar Island Administration in the Directorate of Health Services the *Urban Leprosy Worker/Non Medical Supervisor/ Senior Para- medical Worker* are all in the scale of Rs. 1200-2040 and there is no post with the designation of **Non-medical Assistant** in the entire Directorate. While dealing with the Medical and Para-medical Services in Chapter 52, the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission recommended at paragraph 52.40 that a high powered committee should be constituted for the purpose of suggesting re-categorization of all the hitherto Para-medical categories working in the Central Government Institutions because there are about 16939 para-medical staff distributed over eleven categories in various institutions ranging from the pay scale of Rs. 950-1400 to the scale of Rs. 3000-4500 and they are concerned with medical and health delivery in Central Government Hospitals, teaching, training and research institutions. However, at paragraph 52.94, the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have noted that *Physiotherapists* and *Occupational Therapists* with minimum qualification of 10+2 and a three year degree or diploma and six months internship with or without post-graduate training should be in the pay scale of



Rs. 1640-2900. For *Radiographers* requiring a minimum of two years diploma/certificate after 10+2, the scale recommended at paragraph 52.107 is Rs. 4000-6000. At paragraph 52.111, the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended that all posts of *Technicians* requiring matriculation with some experience as minimum qualifications for direct recruitment should be placed in the scale of Rs. 4000-6000 and *Technicians* with either a degree in science or diploma in engineering will be in the revised scale of Rs. 5000-8000. The **Non-medical Assistants** cannot be considered as *Technicians* as we have rated the duties and responsibilities of the post and even if they are *Technicians*, then they cannot claim a scale beyond Rs. 4000-6000 because according to their own admission they are only required to be Intermediates with some training in Leprosy Eradication. That they have to carry out surveys which may involve at least twenty days tour in a month, cannot be considered a pre-requisite qualification for entry to the post. Therefore, we recommend for the **Non-medical Assistant** the scale of Rs. 4000-6000 but those who have been recruited on the specific condition that they will only get a consolidated salary of Rs. 3000 per month, cannot be given the time scale.

### Tuberculosis Wing

38.35.1           The Bihar State Tuberculosis Health Visitors Welfare Committee, Patna - 7 have represented through Md. Reyazuddin, General Secretary that the **Treatment Organizers** and **Tuberculosis Health Visitors** should be recommended the scale of Rs. 5500-9000. They have explained in their representation that the **T.B. Health Visitors** and **Treatment Organizers** are required to be at least Intermediates in Science with the **Health Visitors** requiring an additional certificate of Health Visitors course and the **Treatment Organizers** requiring a Certificate from NTI Bangalore as well. The **T.B. Health Visitors** are now in the scale of Rs. 1400-2300. It has been submitted that the basic qualification of the **Health Visitors** is Intermediate in Science with one year Medical Training of Health Visitors Course and thereafter a specialized three months training at the National T.B. Institute, Bangalore. The **Treatment Organizer** is also required to undergo a training at the



National T.B. Institute, Bangalore. It has been claimed that in the Centre, the *T. B. Health Visitor* is only required to be a Matriculate with nine months training. In addition, the Association has also requested for Cycle Allowance to be raised from the existing Rs. 20 per month to a higher amount as the *Junior Engineers* who were getting Rs. 7.50 per month like the *Health Visitors* in 1952 are now getting Rs. 150 per month. According to the representationist, the *B.C.G. Technicians* are appointed in the scale of Rs. 1200-1800 on the basis of only a Matriculation Certificate and as soon as they undergo a three months training at the National T.B. Institute, Bangalore, their pay automatically gets upgraded to Rs. 1400-2600 with the designation being changed to *B.C.G. Team Leader* but the *T.B. Health Visitors* and the *Treatment Organizers* are deprived from the benefit of this upgradation even after completion of their training. On the basis that the *BCG Team Leader* will be recommended the revised scale of Rs. 5000-8000 against their existing scale of Rs. 1400-2600, the *Health Visitors* have requested for the revised scale of Rs. 5500-9000 specially because they are dealing with an infectious disease like T.B. and while dealing with patients they are liable to be exposed to health risks and hazards.

38.35.2

We have with us the list of posts and pay scales (pre-revised) of the National Tuberculosis Institute, Bangalore. In that Institute the *Health Visitor* is in the pay scale of Rs. 1200-2040, the *Field Investigator* is now in the scale of Rs. 5000-8000, the *Social Worker* is in the scale of Rs. 1400-2300 and there are other posts in Class IV in the scale of Rs. 750-940, Rs. 775-1025 and Rs. 800-1150. It has been discussed at paragraph 69.37 that *Field Investigators* in the Epidemiology section in the National Tuberculosis Institute are required to be at least graduates with five years experience in the field of tuberculosis research work. The *Field Investigators* are promoted as *Investigator/ Team Leader* and thereafter as *Senior Investigator*. For the *Field Investigators*, the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended the scale of Rs. 1600-2600, for the *Investigator/Team Leader* the scale of Rs. 1640-2900 and for the *Senior Investigator* the scale of Rs. 2000-3500. As the *Health Visitors* in Bihar are only required to be intermediates with training, we are unable to recommend for them the scale of Rs. 5500-9000 which has been



recommended by the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission for *Investigator / Team Leader*, the promotion post for *Field Investigators* in the National Tuberculosis Institute, Bangalore. Hence the **Health Visitors** will be in the scale of Rs. 4000-6000 because that is the scale of *Health Visitors* in the Institute at Bangalore. This scale is being recommended after considering that they are intermediates in science and their duties include issue of drugs and identity Cards to the T.B. patients, visiting all positive sputum cases once every week, preparing tour diary and home visiting records and identification of treatment default and defaulter retriever.

### Dressers

38.36.1 Bihar Medical and Basic Public Health Employees Association, Patna 7 (Gope Faction) through their General Secretary, Shri Vaikunth Sharma and Shri Maqsood Alam, Dresser of Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College & Hospital, Bhagalpur have in their representations to the Fitment Committee pointed out that the **Dressers** who are matriculates are getting their pay in the scale of Rs. 825-1200 whereas the **Matriculate Health Workers** who all along have been considered equal to **Dressers** and have been in the same pay scale over the last so many years, are now in the pay scale of Rs. 975-1540.

38.36.2 There is some confusion in this regard because in the Bhagalpur Medical College the **Dressers** are not being allowed the scale of Rs. 975-1540 by the Superintendent whereas in other offices of the State, namely, in Vaishali, Monghyr, Ranchi, etc. the matriculate **Dressers** have been sanctioned the scale of Rs. 975-1540. This confusion has arisen because subsequent to the recommendations of the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee at paragraphs 17.13 to 17.17 that **Basic Health Workers** who are matriculates should be in the scale of Rs. 535-765 and non-matriculates will be in the pay scale of Rs. 400-540, the Finance Department Resolution No. 10770 dated 30.12.81 sanctioned the pay scale of Rs. 400-540, to all **Health Workers** without making a distinction between trained and untrained. But the



Resolution of 30.12.81 indicated the scale of the Basic Health Worker as Rs. 535-765. Hence, the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee of 1985 recommended at paragraph 15.26.1 that if the prescribed qualification is matriculation for a **Health Worker**, the pay scale of Rs. 535-765 should be sanctioned. On that basis, the Finance Department in its Resolution dated 8.4.1987 allowed the pay scale of Rs. 535-765 to the **Health Workers** whose prescribed recruitment qualification is matriculation. As the **Dressers** were a separate cadre with a different designation and posted in certain Colleges and Hospitals of the State, the **Dressers** were not sanctioned the higher pay scale of Rs. 535-765 even if they were matriculates. It is also a fact, as may be seen from some advertisements of Civil Surgeons of Lohardagga, Giridih and Samastipur, etc. districts that matriculate **Dressers** have been recruited on the basis of the pay scale of Rs. 975-1540 with the pre-revised scale being Rs. 535-765. In a writ petition filed in the Patna High Court in CWJC No. 11900/95, the **Dressers** of the Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College & Hospital, Bhagalpur had pointed out that whenever a **Basic Health Worker** is posted in a Primary Health Centre he is called **Health Worker** and **Health Workers** posted in the Medical Colleges and Hospitals are called **Dressers**. It has also been submitted by them in the Writ Petition that the cadre of matriculate trained **Health Workers** and **Dressers** is the same and they perform the same work. A letter dated 30.5.95 was also written to the Finance Department by the Superintendent, Bhagalpur Hospital seeking a definite direction as **Dressers** were demanding the higher scale of Rs. 975-1540 but apparently, no reply was given to the Superintendent or else this representation would not have been submitted to the Fitment Committee.

38.36.3 In the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report, it has been mentioned at paragraph 52.37 that *Dressers* are a para-medical category and at paragraph 52.40 a high powered Committee has been recommended to be constituted for going into the re-categorisation of all hitherto existing para-medical categories working in Central Government Institutions. In the Directorate of Health Services, Andaman & Nicobar Islands Administration, the Para-Medical Worker is in the scale of Rs. 950-1500 and the *Senior Para-Medical Worker* is in the scale of Rs. 1200-2040 but the *Dresser* is in the



scale of Rs. 800-1150. We have not been able to find a post with the designation of **Basic Health Worker**. We have with us the posts with their pay scales in the various Hospitals under the Central Government which are mostly located in Delhi. In the Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Hospital, Delhi the *Dressing Orderly* is in the scale of Rs. 750-940 and the *Dresser* is in the scale of Rs. 800-1150. In the Jawaharlal Institute of Post-Graduate Medical Education & Research, the *Dressers* who number in all 26, are also in the scale Rs. 800-1150. The same scale is available to the *Dressers* in the Kalawati Saran Children's Hospital, Lady Hardinge Medical College & Hospital, Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Hospital, Delhi and elsewhere also. Therefore, the question of granting to the *Dressers* the pay scale of the **Basic Health Worker**, that is, Rs. 975-1540 does not at all arise. *Dressers*, matriculate or otherwise, will be in the scale of Rs. 800-1150 which would stand revised to Rs. 2650-4000.

**DRESSER cum COMPOUNDER IN THE DIRECTORATE OF INDIGENOUS SYSTEM OF MEDICINES**

38.37.1 The Bihar State Indigenous Medicine Compounders Association (Ayurvedic, Unani, Homeopath) have through their General Secretary, Shri Prabhakar Pathak, requested for the revised pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000 for the **Dresser cum Compounders**. In the Finance Department Resolution No. 6021 dated 18.12.89, the **Dresser cum Compounders** are in the pay scale of Rs. 950-1400. We have earlier discussed the pay scales of **Compounders** and recommended that the appropriate scale for them is Rs. 3050-4590 provided they are matriculates with at least two years experience/training. For the *Dressers* in Hospitals we have recommended the pay scale of Rs. 2650-4000. The **Dresser cum Compounder** under the Directorate of Indigenous System of Medicines is probably combining both duties but that does not make him entitled to a higher scale of Rs. 4000-6000. **Compounders** without a Pharmacy diploma are no longer available in the Central Government in the Allopathy stream or in the Indigenous System of Medicines and **Compounders** are only available in the Veterinary wing. *Dressers* in the Central Government are in the scale of Rs. 800-1150, higher than *Nursing Attendant/Khidmatgar/Theatre Orderly/Ward Attendant* who are



in the pay scale of Rs. 750-940. Hence we recommend for the **Dresser cum Compounder** the pay scale of Rs. 3050-4590 on the basis that he is primarily doing the work of a **Compounder**. If the premise is not correct and he is primarily meant to work as a **Dresser**, then the pay scale that will be admissible will be that of a **Dresser** --- Rs. 2650-4000

#### **Dresser and O.T. Assistant**

38.38.1 Shri Yogendra Ram, Dresser cum O.T. Assistant in the Darbhanga Medical College Hospital has represented to the Fitment Committee requesting that the **Dresser** be given the pay scale of the clerks. He has requested for 20 percent additional pay for working on both the posts of **Dresser** and **O.T. Assistant** and has requested that he should also be asked to appear in the departmental examination. This representation has got little to do with the fitment of his pay scale and hence we are unable to consider his case.

#### **MEDIAMAN, BACTERIOLOGICAL LABORATORY**

38.39.1 Shri Bharat Singh, Mediaman in the Bacteriological Laboratory, Patna Medical College & Hospital, Patna has submitted in his representation that the Fourth Pay Revision Committee did not recommend any separate pay scale for **Mediamen** and the Health Department sanctioned to him the pay scale of Rs. 535-765 on the basis that this was the scale of **Laboratory Assistants**. However, the Finance Department, through its letter dated 13.3.1984, granted to him only the pay scale of Rs. 425-605. Subsequently, the Finance Department in its Resolution dated 30.1.1990 sanctioned for the **Laboratory Technicians** and **Laboratory Assistants** the same pay scale of Rs. 975-1540 for direct recruits provided they are having the requisite educational qualification of I.Sc. with one year training in MLT. However, the **Mediaman** was not allowed that pay scale which was sanctioned for **Laboratory Technicians/Laboratory Assistants**. Shri Bharat Singh has claimed that he is a Matriculate and has also got training in the



techniques of Media-making, Museum, Clinical Pathology, etc. from the State Bacteriological Laboratory. A photocopy of the pay scales notified after the Government took decisions on the Third Pay Revision Committee recommendations have been submitted which indicates that the **Mediaman** will be in the scale of Rs. 220-315. For the **Laboratory Assistants** who have got a Matriculation with Science with Certificate or a Diploma in Laboratory Techniques including the DMLT or are 10 + 2 with Science, the recommended pay scale by the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission is Rs. 950-1500. The **Mediaman** who is having the qualification of Matriculation with one years training, as he has claimed, will also be in the pay scale of Rs. 950-1500 which on revision stands at Rs. 3050-4590. We have not been able to locate the post of **Mediaman** in the list of posts mentioned in Finance Department Resolution No. 6021 dated 18.12.1987. Therefore, before notifying the scale, we will request the State Government to verify whether this post stands created or not. The Health Department have not provided to us any detail regarding this post and the post also does not find a place in the list of posts that the Department have furnished to us.

#### SURVEILLANCE WORKERS

38.40.1 The Bihar State Malaria Employees Association through their General Secretary, Shri Vidyanand Vidyarthi has requested the Fitment Committee that the **Surveillance Workers/Superior Field Workers** should be recommended the revised pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000. It has been pointed out in their representation that in 1960 some non-matriculates had been appointed as **Surveillance Workers/Superior Field Workers** but in 1983 it was clarified by the Chief Malaria Officer that the recruitment qualification of both the posts is Matriculation and after 1978 the concerned employees are required to be trained for 3 months. A writ petition was filed by the **Surveillance Workers** of the National Malaria Eradication Programme and the Hon'ble Judge of the Patna High Court in a case between Shashi Bhushan Kumar and others versus State of Bihar and others ruled that the order notifying the pay scale of Rs. 375-480 for the **Surveillance Workers**



stands quashed and the State of Bihar should reconsider the entire matter and if necessary the matter could be referred again to the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee. In this writ application it was contended that **Surveillance Workers** were earlier in a higher pay scale than **Health Workers** but came to have a lesser pay scale than **Health Workers** from 1.4.1981 and the only reason cited in the counter affidavit was that the **Surveillance Workers** were categorized as semi-skilled employees and hence did not get the pay scale allowed to skilled employees. We have seen that before 1971 the **Health Workers (non-matriculates)** were in the scale of Rs. 75-85 while **Superior Field Workers** were in the scale of Rs. 85-110. From 1971 onwards the former were in the scale of Rs. 165-204 while the latter were in the pay scale of Rs. 180-242. The 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee considered the former as skilled and recommended the scale of Rs. 400-540 but for the latter recommended the scale of Rs. 375-480 as they were considered unskilled. The representationists have referred to paragraph 69.84 of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission Report for claiming a higher pay scale. According to them the recruitment qualification of **Surveillance Workers** and *Laboratory Assistants* are the same and hence the replacement pay scale should also be similar. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended that since the *Laboratory Assistants* are required to have a certificate in the Health Inspector Course with 5 years experience the pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000 was recommended for the *Laboratory Assistants* in the pay scale of Rs. 975-1540. The basic grade of *Laboratory Technician* is required to have a minimum educational qualification of graduation in science as shown at Annexure 69.1 and hence this higher scale of Rs. 5000-8000 to the basic grade of *Laboratory Technicians*. As the minimum educational qualification of *Laboratory Technicians* is graduation in science, **Surveillance Worker** cannot be compared to the *Laboratory Technicians* and as they do not have a certificate of having passed the Health Inspectors course and not even five years experience, the scale of Rs. 4000-6000 cannot be extended to **Surveillance Workers**.

38.40.2

In the Central Government under the National Malaria Eradication Programme the *Insect Collectors* are in the scale of Rs. 950-1400 and we find from paragraph 69.84 that these *Insect Collectors* are promoted



as *Malaria Inspector* in the pay scale of Rs. 1200-2040. *Insect Collectors* in Pondicherry as discussed at paragraph 104.77 are required to have a minimum qualification of matriculation and were in the pay scale of Rs. 800-1150. However, these *Insect Collectors* are posted in Pondicherry and subject to the minimum qualification being raised to 10+2 pass in science, the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended at paragraph 104.77 that the pay scale should be upgraded from Rs. 800-1150 to Rs. 950-1500. However, these *Insect Collectors* cannot be compared to the **Surveillance Workers**. In the Andaman and Nicobar Administration also there is mention of posts called *Surveillance Worker/ Superior Field Worker* but these posts are in the pay scale of Rs. 775-1025. We do not have recruitment rules for the posts in the Health Department and hence we are unable to equate the *Surveillance Worker* and *Superior Field Workers* of Andaman & Nicobar Island Administration with similar designated posts in Bihar. However, if we presume that the recruitment qualification of the post is Matriculation then we are unable to equate *Laboratory Assistants* with the **Surveillance Workers**.

38.40.3 The representation of **Surveillance Workers** has been considered but we are unable to recommend a higher pay scale than what stands available in the Andaman and Nicobar Administration. Both the Fitment-cum-Pay Revision Committee and the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee were not in favour of equating **Basic Health Workers** with the **Superior Field Workers/Surveillance Workers**. The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee have noted at paragraph 10, Chapter 15 that the decision to increase the qualification to Matriculation was due to an expectation that this would lead to a higher pay scale. In the note submitted to us on 7.9.1998 by the Director, Health Services of the Health Department it has been stated that the **Surveillance Workers** are required to be Matriculates. If we allow a higher scale of Rs. 4000-6000 to the **Surveillance Workers** then the **Surveillance Inspector** who are now in the scale of Rs. 1200-1800 will have to be recommended a higher pay scale. Secondly, *Insect Collectors* in the Filaria Control Programme were in the pay scale of Rs. 180-242 till 1981. This was also the pay scale of **Surveillance Workers** in the Malaria Eradication Programme though the *Insect Collectors* in the Malaria Eradication



Programme were in the higher scale of Rs. 205-284 but in the Government orders issued in 1981 December after recommendations of the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee were received, the pay scale of both categories of Insect Collectors became the same. If we allow a higher pay scale to the **Surveillance Workers/Superior Field Workers** than the *Insect Collectors*, then the *Insect Collectors* would claim a parity dating back to 30 years and urge a higher scale than **Surveillance Workers**.

38.40.4 The representationist have not submitted any duty chart to justify why they should be rated at par with the **Basic Health Workers** and why they should get a higher pay scale than *Insect Collectors*. Their claim for parity rests on educational qualification only and they have attempted to show that the post requiring a Matriculation qualification should at least have the pay scale of Rs. 975-1540. We have earlier pointed out in Volume I Part I of our report that pay scales cannot be determined merely on the basis of recruitment qualification and that is the view of the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission as well in paragraph 40.24 to 40.28 of their Report and at paragraph 44.19 the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have undertaken an exercise regarding functional classification and have considered the revised pay scale of Rs. 825-1200 to be the scale of the supporting staff. For the reason that the **Surveillance Workers** in the Andaman & Nicobar Administration are in the pay scale of Rs. 775-1025, we should have recommended the revised scale of Rs. 2610-3540. But the resurgence of Malaria and obvious differences in recruitment qualification we recommend for the **Surveillance Workers/ Superior Field Workers** the revised pay scale of Rs. 825-1200 considering the duties and responsibilities of the post and also on the basis of the functional classification adopted by the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission. Regarding their other demands about Group Insurance, Travelling allowance, Gratuity and House Rent Allowance we will be submitting our report separately. Their demand for grant of Cycle allowance as in the Centre against the existing Rs. 20 will also be examined separately in our report on allowances. The revised pay scale of **Surveillance Worker/Superior Field Worker** will be Rs. 2750-4400.



## CYTO TECHNICIAN

38.41.1 The Bihar Medical & Public Health Employees Association, Patna Medical College Hospital, Patna through their Secretary, Shri Madan Mohan Sharma and Shri Hemant Kumar Singh, Cyto Technician, Post-natal Programme, Patna Medical College Hospital, Patna have represented to the Fitment Committee that in 1986 the post of **Cyto Technician** was created in the Health Department of the State Government of Bihar in the Patna Medical College Hospital under the Post-natal Programme in the pap smear scheme but the post was not discussed in the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee's Report because no information was apparently made available by the Health Department. It has been indicated by Shri Singh that the recruitment qualification is graduation with Science with diploma in Medical Laboratory Technology and the present pay scale is Rs. 1400-2600.

38.41.2 If the post was created in 1986 then there was sufficient opportunity for the concerned incumbents to submit their representations to the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee or else if that was not possible then the Pay Anomaly Revision Committee could have been requested to indicate a revised pay scale. The petitioners have not submitted their recruitment qualification or a copy of an advertisement by which Science Graduates with training in Laboratory Technology were recruited. We have ascertained that the qualification required of a **Cyto Technician** is similar to the work required for a **Laboratory Technician**. We presume that the **Cyto Technician** till now had been drawing the scale on the basis of some arrangement because the Finance Department have not yet notified his scale. Moreover, we do not know whether the post is a promotional post for some other feeder cadre. Hence we recommend the pay scale of **Laboratory Technician** to the **Cyto Technician** also.

38.41.3 In paragraph 55.149 the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have recommended what should be the minimum qualification for *Laboratory*



*Assistants* as well as *Laboratory Technicians*. For a matriculate with science and a certificate/diploma in Laboratory Techniques including DMLT or 10+2 with Science, the pay scale recommended is Rs. 950-1500. For those who are in the pay scale of Rs. 1320-2040 and are graduates in science or diploma holders in engineering with a subject matter diploma including DMLT, the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission has recommended the scale of Rs. 4500-7000. In view of lack of information regarding the post of **Cyto Technician** we recommend that direct recruits will be in the scale of Rs. 3050-4590 on the basis of the recommendations made by the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission at paragraph 55.149.

### **Head Cook**

38.42.1 Shri Bachan Mishra, Head Cook in the Patna Medical College Hospital has represented to the Fitment Committee that no pay scale had been recommended by the Fitment-cum-Pay Revision Committee for the **Head Cook** of the Patna Medical College Hospital which has 1700 beds. He has submitted that the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee had fixed the pay scale for the **Head Cook** in the Patna Medical College Hospital as Rs. 375-480. He has also pointed out that the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee recommended for the **Head Cook** of the Mental Hospital at Kanke, Ranchi the pay scale of Rs. 800-1150. Shri Mishra has requested for the pay scale of Rs. 800-1150. The 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee indicated a pay scale of Rs. 375-480 for the **Head Cook** at paragraph 44.157 of their report.

38.42.2 The 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have while dealing with the Canteen Staff at paragraphs 55.22 to 55.33 recommended pay scales for various types of *Cooks*. For the *Assistant Cooks* or *Assistant Halwai*, the pay scale recommended is Rs. 800-1150 and for *Cooks* in the pre-revised scale of Rs. 775-1025 the pay scale recommended is Rs. 950-1500 which has been revised to Rs. 3050-4590. In paragraph 83.269 the *Assistant Cooks* have been recommended the pay scale of Rs. 800-1150 and the *Cooks* the pay scale of Rs. 950-1500 while the *Senior Cooks* directly recruited from matriculates with



certificate of Craftsmanship in Cookery are in the scale of Rs. 1320-2040 and *Master Cooks* have been recommended the scale of Rs. 1400-2300. For the **Head Cook** in the Patna Medical College Hospital, we recommend the pay scale of Rs. 3050-4590 considering the number of beds that there are in the Patna Medical College Hospital and this will be the scale that we recommend.

### Block Extension Educator

38.43.1 Shri Ram Priya Saran, Convenor, Bihar State Block Extension Educator, Bihar, Patna has represented to the Fitment Committee that the Finance Department upgraded the scale of **Supervisors** and **Inspectors ( Education Extension Officers)** from Rs. 1500-2750 to Rs. 1600-2780 but the **Block Extension Educator** was not one of the recipients of this upgraded scale and this category is still in the pay scale of Rs.1400-2600. The job description of **Block Extension Educator** as circulated by the Government of India mentions that he will work under the supervision of Deputy District Extension and Media Officers and District Extension and Media Officer and will be under the immediate administrative control of the Medical Officers in the Primary Health Centre. Among the series of twenty duties and functions listed the major one's are organizing orientation training of Health Workers to collect analyses and interpret the data in respect of extension education work at the block level, assist in organising 'mass communication programmes like film shows, etc., tour for 15 days in a month with a minimum of one night halt in every field worker's area and have with him all information relevant to development activities in the block, particularly concerning health and family welfare, and was required to utilise the same for programme planning.

38.43.2 The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee in their report in 1989 had discussed the pay scale of **Block Extension Educators** at paragraph 57, Chapter 15. It was submitted to that Committee that they were graduates and were required to supervise the work of **Sanitary Inspectors** and other supervisors at the block level. The Fitment cum Pay Revision



Committee after considering their case observed that their work did not require review or correcting the decisions taken by the subordinates as in the case of Circle Inspectors or Block Agriculture Officers and did not agree to put them on par with other **Inspectors** at the block level who are vested with certain powers which call for exercise of statutory functions.

38.43.3 The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee did not consider it expedient to disturb the existing relativity or the pay scale of such functionaries at the Block level like the **Extension Educators** because the final shape of the multipurpose scheme was not yet clear and upgradation of the pay scale of **Extension Educators** would be part of an overall exercise to reduce the existing multiplicity to only three designations for Health employees at the block level.

38.43.4 The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission discussed the pay scales of *Health Education Officer, Social Science Instructor* and *Extension Educators* at paragraph 104.67 of their report. These posts are in the Health and Family Welfare Training Centres of the Government of the National Capital Territory of Delhi. The *Extension Educators* were in the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2300 with the minimum required qualification of graduation with three years experience. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended that the *Extension Educator's* pay scale in view of the qualification should be Rs. 1600-2660 and recommended the scale of Rs. 6500-10500 for the *Health Extension Education Officer/ Social Science Instructor* as the minimum qualification for the posts was M.A. (Social Science) with 5 years experience. We also recommend for **Block Extension Educators** the pay scale of Rs. 5000-8000. As the experience of three years is apparently not available to these **Extension Educators** in Bihar, we recommend that the Health Department will take steps to amend the recruitment qualification and bring it at par with that available in the Delhi Administration.



### Ranchi Institute of Neuro-Psychiatry and Allied Sciences

38.44.1 The Mental Hospital at Ranchi was previously under the State Government but now it is known as the Ranchi Institute of Neuro Psychiatry and Allied Sciences. According to the orders of the Patna High Court this Institute is now an autonomous body and it is managed by a Managing Committee. According to the Letter No. 366 (21) dated 24.1.1998 of the Department of Health, Medical Education and Family Welfare the State Government expressed no objection in the re-organization of the Ranchi Mental Hospital. The Institute has also been allowed by the State Government to accommodate by adjustment employees in that Institute considering their qualification, skill and experience.

38.44.2 We have obtained from the Deputy Director (Administration) of the Ranchi Institute of Neuro-Psychiatry and Allied Sciences the sanctioned posts and their existing scales. The pay scales are State Government scales as we find mention of the pay scales of Rs. 2400-4150, Rs. 1800-3330, Rs. 1500-2750 as well as Rs. 775-1025. However, as the employees of this Institution are no longer State Government employees, we are leaving it to the Management Committee for appropriate decisions on pay scales of the employees posted in that Institute.

### Basic Health Workers and Auxiliary Health Workers

38.45.1 The Bihar State Basic Health Workers (Minimum) Association through their General Secretary, Shri Srinivas Prasad Shrivastava, has represented to the Fitment Committee that their revised pay scale should be on the basis of the scale of Rs. 1400-2600 and not on the basis of the existing scale of Rs. 975-1540. A judgment of the Patna High Court delivered on 26.3.96 in C.W.J.C. No. 6096 of 1992 has also been submitted. According to the judgement, the Hon'ble Court held that the **Basic Health Workers**



should be placed in the same pay scale which is made available to **Auxiliary Health Workers** because both the categories of employees are doing the same nature of work. In C.W.J.C.No. 6096/92, the Court further clarified on 27.8.96 that the salary of the **Basic Health Workers** will be Rs. 1400-2600 with effect from 1.1.1986. The **Health Workers** are in the pay scale of Rs. 825-1200, Rs. 535-765 as well as Rs. 975-1540 and the **Auxiliary Health Workers** have now been given the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2600 on the basis of judgment in C.W.J.C.No-2458/87. The petitioners have submitted to this Committee that the State Government have not yet issued orders increasing their pay scale to Rs. 1400-2600 and they have filed a contempt petition in M.J.C. No. 366/97.

38.45.2 Regarding this cadre, the Bihar Medical and Public Health Employees Association, Patna through their General Secretary, Shri K. M. Sharan and the same Association but belonging to the Gope Faction through their General Secretary, Shri Ramashish Thakur, have also filed representations before the Committee. These two Associations have requested for the **Basic Health Workers** at least the scale of Rs. 4000-6000 while in the representation of Shri K. M. Sharan for the **Basic Health Inspectors** in the Malaria Eradication Programme, the pay scale of Rs. 5000-8000 has been requested for.

38.45.3 The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee in its Report in 1990 discussed in detail the pay scale of **Health Workers** and the **Auxiliary Health Workers** and did not accept the claim of the **Basic Health Workers** that they should have the same pay scale as the **Auxiliary Health Workers**. The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee noted at paragraph 13.67.13 that the beneficiaries of the higher scale of Rs. 785-1210 were those **Auxiliary Health Workers** who were appointed earlier and were inter-changeable with the **Extension Educators** though graduates as **Extension Educators** continued to be appointed irrespective of the fact that the **Auxiliary Health Workers** were Matriculates with two years training. The Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee at paragraph 50, Chapter 15 has noted that the Health Department was of the view that the nature of work of **Auxiliary Health Workers** was



comparable to the **Basic Health Workers** but that Committee was not in favour of any upgradation in the pay scale of **Basic Health Workers**. After careful consideration, the Pay Anomaly Removal Committee recommended that if no **Auxiliary Health Worker** remained then no appointment should be made against the post of **Auxiliary Health Workers** in future and the designation should be abolished and the **Basic Health Workers** cannot be given the pay scale of **Auxiliary Health Workers**.

38.45.4 We have carefully considered the duties and responsibilities and the nature of work of the **Basic Health Worker** vis-à-vis the **Auxiliary Health Workers**. The admitted status is as follows:-

- (1) The **Auxiliary Health Workers** have all along been in a higher pay scale than the **Basic Health Workers** right from post 1947 onwards as may be seen from the chart below,

	<b>Auxiliary Health Workers (in Rs.)</b>	<b>Basic Health Workers (in Rs.)</b>
Prior to 2 <sup>nd</sup> Pay Revision	75-140	45-75
After 2 <sup>nd</sup> Pay Revision	120-225	105-155
After 3 <sup>rd</sup> Pay Revision	240-396	220-315
After 4 <sup>th</sup> Pay Revision	680-965	535-765
From 1.1.86	1320-2040 but revised to Rs. 1400-2600 considering the pre-revised scale to be Rs. 785-1210	975-1540



- (2) At Chapter 18, paragraph 326 the Second Pay Revision Committee of the State have stated in their Report that the **Auxiliary Health Worker** is a Matriculate who has undergone two years training in the Public Health Institute. The Committee also noted that the **Health Workers** are drawn from **Dressers** in the scale of Rs. 28-40 and given three months training and held that the existing scale of Rs. 45-75 is somewhat excessive for them. For the **Auxiliary Health Workers** the Second Pay Revision Committee recommended *"he should be rated as an Intermediate and allowed the normal scale of Rs. 115-225 for this qualification of workers"*. Regarding **Health Workers** that Committee recommended that the appropriate scale for them would be Rs. 85-110, although the existing incumbents will be taken to the scale of Rs. 105-155 (maximum Rs. 130).

- (3) The Third Pay Revision Committee of the Government of Bihar discussed the pay scale of these two categories at paragraphs 70 to 73, Chapter 24 of their report. In 1971 there were 320 posts of **Health Workers** in the scale of Rs. 75-85 for which the prescribed qualification was dressership training for six months; there were 817 posts of **Health Workers** in the scale of Rs. 100-130 and were filled by promotion from **Health Workers/ Dressers** in the scale of Rs. 75-85 and they underwent a three months training in the Public Health Institute. Then there were 1125 posts of **Basic Health Workers** in the scale of pay of Rs. 105-155 and existed under the Malaria Eradication Programme. The required qualification was stated to be Matriculation and they were required to make house-to-house visits and collect blood slides from malaria patients. This category of **Basic Health Workers** have now gone to Court but were then recommended the pay scale of Rs. 220-315.



These were 635 posts of **Auxiliary Health Workers** who were directly recruited to the post in the scale of Rs. 120-225. The Third Pay Revision Committee while recommending the pay scale of Rs. 240-396 for the **Auxiliary Health Workers** observed that *"the prescribed qualification is Matriculation followed by successful completion of two year's training in the Public Health Institute. These posts exist in the field in the dispensaries, mobile units and static Health Centres. They are expected to render first-aid and carry out preventive and curative work under the instructions of Medical Officers. They are expected to conduct serious patients to the nearest hospitals or dispensaries. They also do some basic clerical work of keeping records of articles and maintaining birth and death registers"*.

(4)

The Fourth Pay Revision Committee of the State Government recommended for the **Auxiliary Health Workers** the pay scale of Rs. 680-965 and for the **Basic Health Workers** the pay scale of Rs. 535-765. At paragraph 17.16 and at paragraph 17.17 the pay scales of **Basic Health Workers** were recommended without any discussion except mentioning that the **Basic Health Workers** are at least matriculates and since **Auxiliary Health Workers** were already in a higher pay scale they would obviously be performing duties of a much higher nature and most of the categories of employees discussed would be having a higher qualification, i.e., at least Intermediate. The categories mentioned were **Lady Health Visitors** in Welfare Department, **Auxiliary Health Workers**, **Special Workers**, **Lady Health Visitors** in Health Department and **T.B. Health Visitors**. Hence the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Revision Committee never recommended the higher pay scale to **Auxiliary Health Workers** only on the basis that they had an Intermediate qualification.



- (5) At paragraph 49 and 50 of Chapter 15 the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee Report of the State Government noted that the Health Department had reported to the Committee that **Basic Health Workers** are posted in Health Sub-Centres and under the National Malaria Eradication Programme with in-service training being only for one year. The Health Department also clarified to that Committee that the nature of work of **Auxiliary Health Workers** is comparable to the **Health Workers**. But as the pay scale of the two categories had never been the same and the **Basic Health Workers** have always been in a lower scale of pay, the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee recommended that there was no ground for upgradation of the pay scale of the **Basic Health Workers**.

- (6) The Pay Anomaly Removal Committee in 1990 did not recommend disturbance of the existing relativities among the **Health Workers, Basic Health Workers, Extension Educators and Family Planning Workers**.

38.45.5 Among the posts and pay scales of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare there is no post in the pay scale of Rs. 5000-8000 where the recruitment qualification is matriculation. Ordinarily the replacement or the revised pay scale of the existing pay scale of Rs. 1400-2600 is Rs. 5000-8000. At paragraph 43.14 the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have pointed out that where recruitment qualification of matriculation, I T I Certificate, etc. are required as far as possible the pay scale of Rs. 950-1500, which has been replaced by the scale of Rs. 3050-4590, has been recommended. Nowadays admission to I T I courses is generally not available to non-matriculates. Moreover, there are posts in the Central Government in the revised pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000 where the minimum educational



qualification is graduation. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission have mentioned at paragraphs 66.198 and 102.19 (these are only examples to illustrate) that *Sub-Inspectors* in the Central Bureau of Narcotics in the Ministry of Finance and *Auditors/ Accountants*, respectively, are in the scale of Rs. 1320-2040 though having graduation qualification (paragraph 1.8.3. of Volume II , Part II). Hence only the recruitment qualification is no single determinant of pay scales. At paragraph 43.15 the Fifth Central Pay Commission proposed to induct entrants to the posts requiring graduation, three years diploma course, etc. as minimum entry qualification in the pay scales of Rs. 1400-2300, Rs. 1600-2600 and Rs. 1640-2900.

38.45.6 Under the Directorate of Health Services, Andaman & Nicobar Administration, the *Para-Medical Worker* is in the pay scale of Rs.950-1500, the *Senior Para-Medical Worker* is in the scale of Rs. 1200-2040 and in the same pay scale are *Non-Medical Supervisors* and *Urban Leprosy Workers*. In the Health & Family Welfare Training Centres of the Government of Delhi, the *Extension Educators* with graduation and three years experience are now in the pay scale of Rs. 5000-8000. The *Auxiliary Health Workers* who are only Matriculates with some training cannot be considered on an equal footing. At paragraph 52.70, the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have noted that the *Female Health Workers* are in the pay scale of Rs. 975-1540 and they are required to have a matriculation certificate with a course in the H.W.F. as well as Registration with the appropriate Council. For the *Auxiliary Nurse Midwives* the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission have at paragraph 52.72 recommended the revised scale of Rs. 4000-6000 against the pre-revised scale of Rs. 975-1540. It is seen at paragraph 52.101 that *Field Workers* are in the scale of Rs. 950-1400 and Rs. 950-1500 in the Central Government. The *Health Assistants* in the All India Institute of Hygiene and Public Health, Calcutta are in the pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000 and they definitely have no less an educational qualification than either the *Basic Health Workers* or the *Auxiliary Health Workers*.

38.45.7 From the reference of past Pay Revision Committees it is now clear that *Basic Health Workers* have never been in the same pay



scale as **Auxiliary Health Workers**. The extracts from the Report of the Third Pay Revision Committee clearly differentiate the nature of work of the two categories of workers. It would be pertinent to ask the Health Department to clarify how it was held that the nature of work of **Auxiliary Health Workers** was found to be comparable to the **Basic Health Workers**. Even if the duties and responsibilities were similar and nature of work of two posts are comparable, the Supreme Court in the State of Uttar Pradesh versus J. E. Chaurasia (AIR 1989, Supreme Court, page 19) held "in the present case, all Bench Secretaries may do the same work but their quality of work may differ ..... It does not just depend upon either the nature of work or volume of work done by Bench Secretaries. Primarily it requires among others, evaluation of duties and responsibilities of the respective posts. More often functions of two posts may appear to be the same or similar, but there may be difference in degrees in the performance. The quantity of work may be the same, but quality may be different that cannot be determined by relying upon averments in affidavits of interested parties. The equation of pay must be left to the executive Government". Therefore, even if the nature of duties may be comparable, pay scales need not be the same. We, however, consider the duties and responsibilities of the two posts to be different and we rely upon the Third Pay Revision Committee's Report.

38.45.8 As discussed earlier posts of *Health Workers* under Central Government and in Union Territories are either in the scale of Rs. 950-1400 or Rs. 950-1500. In the All India Institute of Hygiene and Public Health, Calcutta the *Male Health Worker* is in the scale of Rs 950-1400 and the *Female Health Worker* is in a slightly higher scale of Rs. 950-1500. The *Worker* is in the scale of Rs. 950-1500 and the *Male and Female Health Assistants* in the same Organisation are in the scale of Rs. 1200-2040. Under the Government of the National Capital Territory of Delhi the *Field Workers* and *Field Assistants* under the Health Department are in the scale of Rs. 950-1500. Therefore, according to our terms of reference fitment of **Basic Health Workers** is only appropriate in the revised pay scale of Rs. 3050-4590. Designation wise and function-wise in Government of India this is the scale



that is available to employees engaged in work comparable to **Basic Health Workers**.

38.45.9           The **Auxiliary Health Workers** are now in the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2600. But as they are only matriculates with two years training, they are not engaged in such critical work that requires compensation through a pay scale higher than Rs. 4000-6000. The *Health Assistants* sought upgradation but the 5<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission at paragraph 69.25 only recommended for them the pay scale of Rs. 1320-2040 at entry. We quote below the observations of the Pay Commission " *Upgradation of these posts has been demanded drawing a comparison with counterparts in the Ports/ Airport Health Organisation, where Sanitary/ Health Inspectors are stated to have been redesignated as Health Assistants, and are in higher scales of pay, though with comparable qualifications. We have considered the demand but a higher placement does not seem to be justified for Health Assistants in this Institute.*"

38.45.10           *Health Assistants* have now been recommended a revised scale of Rs. 4000-6000 which is at par with **Sanitary Inspectors** who enter service with qualification of matriculation plus diploma for **Sanitary Inspectors**. **Auxiliary Health Workers** do not have a qualification at entry which is more than the **Sanitary Inspectors** and neither do they perform work of a higher nature. Hence the **Auxiliary Health Workers** will be in the revised scale of Rs. 4000-6000. We have also recommended for the **Sanitary Inspectors** the pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000 in paragraph 38.25.7 of this Chapter.





## DEPARTMENT OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT

39.1.1 The Urban Development Department of the Government of Bihar is headed by a Secretary in the super time scale of the Indian Administrative Service. The Town Planning Organisation, headed by the **Chief Town Planner** has the bulk of posts shown under the Urban Development Department, according to Finance Department Resolution No. 6021 dated 18.12.89. However, we have not received any representation from any of the employees of the Urban Development Department. While discussing the demands of the Architects of the Department of Building Construction, we also briefly touched upon the hierarchy of the posts and pay scales in the Town Planning Organisation at paragraph 26.1.3, Volume II, Part II of our Report. As the posts in this Department are by and large common and have already been dealt with by us in other Departments, no separate recommendation or discussion is called for.

Sl. No.	Post	Pay Scale
1	Secretary (Urban Development)	2500-3000
2	Planning Officer/ Deputy Director, Urban Development	2400-2800
3	Assistant Director, Urban Development and Town Planning	2000-2400
4	Joint Revenue Officer	1640-2000
5	Deputy Director, Urban Development	1700-2040
6	Officer	1500-1840
7	Officer	1300-1600
8	Officer	1100-1400
9	Officer	1000-1200





## DEPARTMENT OF INSTITUTIONAL FINANCE & PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION

40.1.1 This Department of the State Government is responsible for successful implementation, coordination and monitoring of the "20 Point Programme" as well as coordination and monitoring of all projects and schemes relating to institutional finance and liaison with Institutional Finance.

40.1.2 The Department has furnished to us the lists of posts with their pay scales and for most of the 38 posts available in the Department, it has been indicated that the posts are filled through appointments made by the Personnel Department. It is only in respect of the following posts that the Department has informed us that appointments are made by the Department on the recommendations of the Bihar Public Service Commission :-

Sl No.	Posts	Existing Pay Scales (in Rs.)
1	Director (Extension)	3700-5000
2	Planning Officer/Deputy Director, Statistics	2400-4150
3	Assistant Director/Statistical Officer/ Senior and Junior Research Officer	2000-3800
4	Computer Programmer cum Planning Advisor	1640-2900
5	D.T.P. Operator	1320-2040
6	Cashier	1320-2040
7	Bill Clerk	1200-1800
8	Librarian cum Assistant Librarian	975-1540
9	Operator	1200-1800



40.1.3 The Secretary of the Department has submitted a letter to the Fitment Committee on 7.9.98 pointing out that the **Director (Extension)** in the pay scale of Rs. 3700-5000 should be given a revised pay scale considering the pay scale of the post to be Rs. 4300-5550. It has been explained that Shri B.K.Thakur, Director (Extension) was appointed as Planning Officer on the recommendations of the Bihar Public Service Commission in the pay scale of Rs. 620-1415 and he joined the department on 28.10.81. The pay scale was fixed at Rs. 1350-2000 from 1.4.81. Thereafter, Shri B.K. Thakur was notified as **Director (Extension)**, the minimum eligibility of the post being six years experience in a lower post. His pay scale was then Rs. 1900-2500. On the recommendations of the Bihar Public Service Commission, the appointment of Shri Thakur was regularised on 18.8.88 and his services were confirmed by Notification No. 231 dated 29.2.1996. As other posts in the pay scales of Rs. 1900-2500 have been upgraded to Rs. 4100-5300 or Rs. 4300-5550, it has been requested that the pay scale of the solitary post of **Director (Extension)** should also be upgraded to Rs. 4300-5550. The recruitment qualification of the post of **Director (Extension)** has not been mentioned anywhere. Recruitment qualification for the post of **Planning Officer**, the post against which Shri Thakur initially joined, is post-graduation in Economics or Agriculture Economics or degree in M.Com. The note from the Department of Institutional Finance and Programme Implementation does not mention the post and the pay scale in the Centre which is having the pay scale of Rs. 14300-18300 so that Shri Thakur could be given that pay scale.

40.1.4 In the Ministry of Planning & Programme Implementation of the Government of India which has been discussed by the 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission at Chapter 81, there is no post with the designation of Director (Extension). The recruitment qualification of the post and duties and the responsibilities are akin to certain posts in the Ministry of Agriculture or Ministry of Industry, discussed respectively at Chapters 56 and 72. The *Director* in the Bureau of



Industrial Costs and Prices or the *Senior Development Officer* in the Department of Industrial Development are in the pay scale of Rs. 3700-5000. *Joint Directors* in the Ministry of Agriculture in the Directorate of Plant Protection, Quarantine & Storage are all in the pay scale of Rs. 3700-5000. *Group A Scientists* in the Ministry of Agriculture with the designation of *Joint Commissioners* in the Department are in the scale of Rs. 4100-5300. Hence we do not find any justification for a solitary post with no specialized qualification other than post-graduation to be in a scale higher than Rs. 3700-5000 and even that scale appears to be on the higher side specially when the requirement of experience of research work is only two years and the post neither requires a Doctorate or a specialised diploma or post-graduate diploma in a specialized area/discipline. We do not find adequate justification for upgrading the scale and in any case, the post and the pay scale of the Central Government against which the post of **Director (Extension)** is to be fitted, has not been indicated. Therefore, we are unable to make a specific recommendation for upgradation.

40.1.5 As there is no other representation from any other employee of this Department, we are not discussing any other post or scale. Revised pay scales of posts will be indicated in the chart that we will be submitting separately.





## Governor's Secretariat

41.1.1 Shri S. J. Shaukat, General Secretary, Raj Bhawan Employees Association has submitted a representation before the Fitment Committee stating that pay scales of employees of the Raj Bhawan need to be considered as if they are part of the Secretariat Cadre. It has been stated that the resolution of the Personnel and Administrative Reforms Department dated 27.2.1991 is not according to the judgment passed by the Hon'ble Patna High Court in C.W.J.C. No. 2321/88. The Resolution of the Personnel Department states that the offices of the Governor's Secretariat and Lokayuta office cannot be considered as either attached offices or subordinate offices. His Excellency the Governor as well as the Lokayukta are both entitled to appoint personnel working in the respective offices and hence both these offices were considered separate and independent. The Judgment passed by the two Judge Bench of the Patna High Court on 25.5.1989 concluded that the Governor cannot make any appointments on his own though the State Government out of consideration and decorum may accept the Governor's request but in law the Governor has no power to appoint any Secretariat staff. Secretarial staff is not recruited by the Governor and it is part of the State Government of the time. It was further held that the Governor can appoint or dismiss any member of his household staff but he cannot appoint or remove from service any Secretariat staff other than on the aid and advice of the Council of Ministers.

41.1.2 The Fitment Committee has been called upon by the representationist to recommend for the employees of the Raj Bhawan Secretariat pay scales and terms and conditions similar to the State Government employees as well as to declare void the decision of the State



Government embodied in the Resolution of the Department of Personnel and Administrative Reforms dated 27.2.1991.

41.1.3

The terms of reference of the Fitment Committee being what they are, this Committee is not an appropriate forum to go into such questions. Hence we will indicate the pay scales of the staff of the Governor's Secretariat in a chart that we will submit separately.

41.1.4

At this stage we would only like to comment on the pay scale of the **Private Secretary to Governor** who is in receipt of the scale of Rs. 2400-4150. **Secretaries** to senior officers are in the pay scale of Rs. 3000-4500. The 5<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission while discussing the pay scales of staff of the President's Secretariat observed in paragraph 77.3 that they are unable to recommend higher scales of pay in isolation only to the ministerial staff of the President's Secretariat. Hence if similarly higher scales cannot be given to the staff of Governor's Secretariat at least they should be similar to what stands recommended for State Government employees. For the reasons mentioned above the **Private Secretary to the Governor** is at least entitled to the pay scale of **Secretary to Senior Officers**, i.e., Rs. 3000-4500 or the revised scale of Rs. 10000-15200.





## OFFICE OF THE LOKAYUKTA

42.1.1 Shri Amrendra Narayan Singh, Deputy Secretary in the office of Lokayukta has submitted an organisation chart and the list of posts with the pay scales. In the office of the Lokayukta there are several posts and their revised pay scales will be indicated in the chart that we will be submitting separately.

42.1.2 As no representation have been received within the stipulated time of 5.2.1998 from any employee of the Lokayukta Office, we are not discussing here any of the posts and the pay scales:

### Office of the Bihar Public Service Commission

42.2.1 The Administrative Officer of the Bihar Public Service Commission has furnished to the Fitment Committee the list of posts with their pay scales and informed that the pay, promotion, service conditions including appointment are the same as those prescribed for corresponding posts in the Bihar Secretariat according to Section 31 of the Bihar Public Service Commission (Conditions of Service) Regulations, 1960. Separately the Finance Department earlier forwarded to the Committee a letter of the Chairman of the Bihar Public Service Commission dated 24.3.1998 and addressed to the Finance Minister, Government of Bihar wherein the pay and allowances of the Chairman and Members of the Bihar Public Service Commission was requested to be referred to the Fitment Committee.

42.2.2 The Fitment Committee considered the letter of the Chairman, Bihar Public Service Commission in light of the provisions of the



Constitution of India and the Bihar Public Service Commission (Conditions of Service) Regulations 1960. According to the provisions of Article 318 of the Constitution of India it is the Governor of the concerned State who is empowered to determine the service conditions of the Chairman and the members of the Public Service Commission. Previously, the Second Third and Fourth Pay Revision Committees as well as the Fitment cum Pay Revision Committee did not recommend any changes in the pay and allowances of the Members and the Chairman. In view of the express provisions of the Constitution of India and the terms of Reference of the Fitment Committee requiring us to recommend only pay scales of State Government employees, the Finance Department was informed through Letter no. 700 dated 22.7.1998 that it would not be appropriate to submit any recommendation regarding the pay and allowances of the Chairman and Members of the Bihar Public Service Commission.

42.2.3 No employee of the Bihar Public Service Commission has submitted his/her representation to the Committee regarding fitment in revised pay scales. The revised pay scales of staff of the Bihar Public Service Commission would be separately recommended in the chart that we will be submitting later. The recommended pay scales will be on the presumption that they are State Government employees unlike the Chairman and Members of the Commission.



# Revised Pay Scales of Press Workers under the

## State Government

SL.NO	DESIGNATION	EXISTING PAY SCALE	RECOMMEN- -DED REVISED CENTRAL PAY SCALE	REFERENCE T PARAGRAPH C 5TH CPC / Fitmen Committee Repor
1	Junior Computer	1200-1800	4000-6000	57.11
2	Technical Assistant	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.221
3	Technical Personal Assistant	1500-2750	5000-8000	46.34
4	Director	3700-5000	12000-16500	55.217
5	Darwan & Prahari	750-940	2550-3200	55.242
5A	Mehtar	750-940	2550-3200	53.13
6	Waterman	750-940	2550-3200	55.217
7	Press Coolie	750-940	2550-3200	53.13
8	Case Coolie	750-940	2550-3200	53.13
9	Case Carrier	750-940	2550-3200	53.13
10	Forms Carrier	750-940	2550-3200	54.18
11	Barman	800-1150	2650-4000	55.205
12	Mali	800-1150	2650-4000	55.126
13	Fireman	800-1150	2610-3540	104.11
14	Press Fly Boy	800-1150	2650-4000	54.18
15	Press Inkman	800-1150	2650-4000	55.221
16	Form Washer	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217



17	Head Watchman	800-1150	2610-3540	55.242
18	Head Type Supplier & Type Supplier	800-1150	2650-4000	54.18
19	Pressman	800-1150	2650-4000	55.221 / 55.205
20	Galley Proof Pressman	800-1150	2650-4000	55.205
21	Impositor-cum-Proof Puller	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217
22	Cylinder Proof Pressman	800-1150	2650-4000	55.222 / 55.224
23	Roller Caster	825-1200	2650-4400	55.217
24	Electro Copier Machine Operator	825-1200	2750-4400	55.217
25	Assistant Paper Issuer	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217
26	Assistant Machine Minder	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
27	Assistant Stamp Printing Operator	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
28	Machine Fly Boy	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
29	Machine Fly Boy & Inkman	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
30	Platenman	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
31	Proof Puller	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217
32	Impositor	825-1200	2750-4400	55.224
33	Distributor	825-1200	2750-4400	55.224
34	Helper	800-1150	2550-3200	55.144 / 54.18
35	Packer	800-1150	2650-4000	63.298
36	Carpenter	950-1400	3050-4590	54.57
37	Paper Issuer	825-1200	2750-4400	55.223
38	Booking Sarkar	825-1200	2750-4400	83.236
39	Mono Caster	950-1400	3050-4590	55.205 / 55.217
40	Type Casting Operator	825-1200	2750-4400	54.66
41	Junior Book Binder	950-1500	3050-4590	55.226
42	Van Driver-cum-Mechanic	950-1500	3050-4590	1.4.6 of Fitne Committee Report



43	Assistant General Mechanic	950-1500	3050-4590	55.205
44	Assistant Mechanic	975-1540	3200-4900	55.205
45	Assistant Link Mechanic	975-1540	3200-4900	55.205
46	Grinding Machineman	975-1540	3200-4900	55.225
47	Welder	950-1400	3050-4590	55.225
48	Turner	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
49	Assistant Lino & Mono Mechanic	975-1540	3050-4590	55.217
50	Assistant Mono Mechanic	975-1540	3050-4590	55.217
51	Assistant Mechanic-cum-Sort Caster	950-1400	3050-4590	55.205
52	Stereo Typer	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
53	Compositor	975-1540	3050-4590	55.217 / 55.205
54	Corrector	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
55	Assistant Incharge Distributing & Type Store, Ranchi	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
56	Assistant Machine Minder	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
57	Machineman	975-1540	3200-4900	55.225
58	Randomman	975-1540	3050-4590	55.217
59	Platenman	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
60	Metal Melter	950-1400	3050-4590	55.205
61	Book Binder/Senior Book Binder	950-1500	3050-4590	55.221
62	Assistant Binding Jamadar	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
63	Assistant Standing Form Keeper	975-1540	3050-4590	55.217
64	Copy Holder	975-1540	3050-4590	64.17 / 55.205
65	Compositor Incharge Raj Bhawan Press	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
66	Assistant Section Holder	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
67	Book Binder (Selection Grade)	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217v
68	Machine Minder (Gluing)	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217



69	Computer Selection Grade, Directorate of Printing & Stationary	1400-2300	4000-6000	55.217
70	Machine Minder	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
71	Machine Jamadar Night Shift	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
72	Assistant Incharge Distributor & Type Store	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
73	Stamp Printing Operator	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
74	Binding Jamadar	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.217
75	Machine Jamadar Lottery	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
76	Press & Machine Jamadar	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
77	Assistant Time Keeper	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
78	Assistant Store Keeper	1200-1800	4000-6000	23.9.5 of Fitter Committee Rep.
79	Paper Issuer -cum-Store Keeper	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.223
80	Reviser	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.205
81	Assistant Time Checker	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
82	Assistant Store Keeper-cum Despatcher	1200-1800	4000-6000	23.9.5 of Fitter Committee Rep.
83	Time Keeper	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
84	Junior Reader	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.225
85	Mono Operator	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.207
86	Lino Operator	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.207
87	Compositor Typist	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.217
88	Machine Minder (Heavy Machine Lottery)	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
89	Senior Reader	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.225
90	Section Holder	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.205
91	Time Works Checker	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.217
92	General Mechanic	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.205 / 55.22
93	Lino Mechanic	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.217



94	Mono Mechanic	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.217
95	Electric Mechanic	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.205 / 55.225
96	Mono Section Holder	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.217
97	Lino Section Holder	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.217
98	Store Keeper-cum-Despatcher	1320-2040	4000-6000	23.9.5 of Fitment Committee Report
99	Assistant Cameraman-cum-Plate Maker	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.217
100	Instructor of Apprentice	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.217
101	Accountant	1400-2300	4500-7000	6.2.3 of Fitment Committee Report
102	Head Computer	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.217
103	Store Keeper	1400-2300	4500-7000	23.9.5 of Fitment Committee Report
104	Store Accountant	1400-2300	4500-7000	6.2.3 of Fitment Committee Report
105	Gen. Foreman & I/c Gen. Foreman.	1400-2600	5000-8000	55.205
106	Foreman, Night Shift	1400-2600	5000-8000	55.205
107	Machine & Binding Foreman	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.217
108	Head Assistant	1500-2750	5000-8000	46.10
109	Head Reader	1500-2750	5000-8000	55.205
110	Reader (Selection Grade)	1400-2600	4500-7000	55.205
111	Camera Man-cum-Plate Maker	1500-2750	5000-8000	55.217
112	Assistant Superintendent	1800-3330	5500-9000	55.221
113	Administrative Officer	1640-2900	5500-9000	25.3.1 of Fitment Committee Report
114	Labour Welfare Officer	1640-2900	5500-9000	31.7.1
115	Printing Engineer	1640-2900	5500-9000	55.217
116	Deputy Superintendent	2400-4150	8000-13500	55.221
117	Superintendent	3000-4500	10000-15200	55.217



118	Labour	775-1025	2550-3200	53.13 / 55.205
119	Unskilled Labour	775-1025	2550-3200	55.205
120	Workshop Coolie	775-1025	2550-3200	55.217
121	Truck Coolie	775-1025	2550-3200	55.217
122	Truck Cleaner	775-1025	2550-3200	55.221
123	Ward Attendant	775-1025	2550-3200	55.217
124	Indent Drawer	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217
125	Assistant Envelope Making Machine Operator	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217
126	Asstt. Numbering Machine Operator	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217
127	Asstt. Ticket Printing Machine Operator	800-1150	2650-4000	55.221
128	Proof Puller	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217
129	Asstt. Sterco Plate Caster	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217
130	Folder	800-1150	2650-4000	54.18
131	Packer	800-1150	2650-4000	63.298
132	Head Packer	825-1200	2750-4400	63.298
133	Form Issuer	825-1200	2650-4000	55.217
134	Distributor	825-1200	2650-4000	55.224
135	Impositor	825-1200	2650-4000	55.224
136	Asstt. Machine Operator	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
137	Asstt. Rottery Machine Operator	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
138	Routing Machine Operator	825-1200	2750-4400	55.217
139	Hydraulic Machine Operator	825-1200	2750-4400	55.217
140	Boring Machine Operator	825-1200	2650-4000	54.66
141	Envelope Making Machine Operator	825-1200	2750-4400	55.217
142	Blacksmith	825-1200	2750-4400	55.205 / 57.17
143	Asstt. Paper Issuer	800-1150	2650-4000	54.63
				55.217



144	Stereo Plate Caster	825-1200	2750-4400	55.217
145	Mono Type Caster	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
146	Junior Binder	825-1200	2750-4400	81.20
147	Senior Binder	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
148	Compositor	975-1540	3050-4590	55.207
149	Task Checker	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
150	Filter Machine Mistry	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
151	Electric Mistry	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
152	Numbering Machine Operator	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
153	Automatic Ticket Printing Machine Operator	975-1540	3200-4900	55.221
154	Platen Machine Operator	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
155	Automatic Machine Operator	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217
156	Cylinder Machine Operator	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
157	Truck Driver cum Mechanic	950-1500	3050-4590	1.4.6 of Fitment Committee Report
158	Asstt. Rotary Mechanic	950-1500	3050-4590	55.217
159	Senior Compositor	950-1500	3050-4590	55.217
160	Asstt. Binding Jamadar	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
161	Copy Holder	975-1540	3050-4590	55.205
162	Computer	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
163	Standing Form Keeper	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
164	Security Officer	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
165	Head Indent Checker	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
166	Rotary Machine Operator	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
167	Press Jamadar	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
168	Machine Jamadar	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
169	Binding Jamadar	975-1540	3050-4590	55.217



170	Selection Grade Rotary Machine Operator Jamadar/Machine Jamadar/Binding Jamadar(Government Press Gaya)	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.217
171	Head Mechanic	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
172	Foundry Foreman	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
173	Pharmacist cum Compounder	1320-2040	4000-6000	52.90 (if having a diploma and 3 months training in Pharmacy along with registration with the Central or State Pharmacy Council then scale on revision to be Rs. 4500-7000)
174	Stenographer	1320-2040	4000-6000	19.6 of Fitment Committee Report
175	Senior Reader	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.225
176	Section Holder	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.205
177	Quality Printer	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.217
178	Store Keeper cum Despatcher	1320-2040	4000-6000	23.9.5 of Fitment Committee Report
179	Instructor	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.205 (if actually instructing personnel in pay scale of Rs. 4000-6000 or if Instructor (Maintenance) then pay scale to be Rs. 4500-7000 as in paragraph 55.205
180	Foreman, Night Shift	1400-2600	5000-8000	55.205



181	Mechanical Foreman	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.217
182	Head Clerk cum Accountant	1400-2300	5000-8000	25.3.1 of Fitment Committee Report
183	Store Keeper	1400-2300	4500-7000	23.9.5 of Fitment Committee Report
184	Administrative cum Accounts Officer	1640-2900	5500-9000	25.3.1 of Fitment Committee Report
185	Asstt. Superintendent	1800-3330	5500-9000	55.221
186	Deputy Superintendent	2400-4150	8000-13500	55.221
187	Superintendent	3000-4500	10000-15200	55.217
188	Labourer	775-1025	2550-3200	55.205
189	Typewriter Cleaner	800-1150	2650-4000	54.18
190	Mali	800-1150	2650-4000	55.127
191	Record Supplier cum Daftari	800-1150	2610-3540	53.6
192	Caretaker	800-1150	2650-4000	55.38
193	Operator	800-1150	2650-4000	54.18 / 54.66
194	Counter	800-1150	2650-4000	55.222 / 55.224
195	Folder	800-1150	2650-4000	54.18
196	Embossor	800-1150	2650-4000	54.18
197	Blacksmith	800-1150	2750-4400	87.17 / 55.205
198	Carpenter	950-1400	3050-4590	54.57
199	Packer	800-1150	2650-4000	63.298
200	Senior Packer	800-1150	2650-4000	63.298
201	Head Packer	800-1150	2650-4000	63.298
202	Binder	825-1200	2650-4000	55.217
203	Booking Sarkar	825-1200	2750-4400	83.236
204	Scouter Van Driver	950-1400	3050-4590	1.4.6 of Fitment Committee Report
205	Workshop Mechanic	950-1400	3050-4590	55.217



206	Typewriter Mechanic	1200-1800	4000-6000	55.217
207	Compositor cum-Ruber Stamp Manufacturer	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
208	Senior Typewriter Mechanic	1320-2040	4000-6000	55.217
209	Head Operator	975-1540	3200-4900	55.217
210	Grinding Machineman	975-1540	3200-4900	55.225
211	Supervisor	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.205
212	Head Typewriter Mechanic	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.217
213	Lady Counter Clerk	1200-1800	4000-6000	1.7.4 of Fitment Committee Report
214	Booking Clerk	1200-1800	4000-6000	1.7.4 of Fitment Committee Report
215	Stenographer	1320-2040	4000-6000	1.9.6 of Fitment Committee Report
216	Asstt. l/c Book Depot.	1400-2300	4500-7000	55.205
217	Store Keeper	1400-2300	4500-7000	23.9.5 of Fitment Committee Report
218	Accountant	1400-2300	4500-7000	6.2.3 of Fitment Committee Report
219	Head Asstt. cum Cashier	1500-2750	5000-8000	46.10
220	Administrative cum Accounts Officer	1640-2900	5500-9000	25.3.1 of Fitment Committee Report
221	Superintendent	3000-4500	10000-15200	55.217
222	Canteen Clerk	975-1540	3050-4590	55.23 (d)
223	Asstt. Incharge, Distributing & Type Store (Ranchi)	975-1540	3050-4590	55.225
224	Assistant Folding Machine Operator	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217
225	Assistant Automatic Machine Operator	800-1150	2650-4000	55.217
226	Paper Issuer	825-1200	2650-4000	55.217



PRINTED BY THE SUPERINTENDENT  
SECRETARIAT PRESS, BIHAR, PATNA  
1998